



Department of Transportation's Speed Camera Program

What questions did the audit look at?

- ▶ Does the New York City Department of Transportation (DOT) adequately monitor its speed camera program?
- ▶ Does DOT accurately issue tickets for violations detected by speed cameras?
- ▶ Are speed cameras functioning and maintained properly?

Why does it matter for New Yorkers?

Since 2013, the New York City Department of Transportation has overseen an automated speed enforcement program using cameras to deter speeding. Under state law, the City is allowed to impose fines of up to \$50 on drivers traveling at a speed of more than 10 MPH in a school speed zone. DOT now has over 2,000 cameras—including 40 mobile cameras mounted to vehicles—deployed in 750 speed zones. Cameras operate 24 hours a day, seven days a week.

The audit found that DOT complied with state law in its designation of speed zones and placement of cameras, which are widely distributed throughout the City. However, the audit found that DOT did not adequately review speeding events captured by cameras and that some of the events were improperly rejected by its contractor, Verra Mobility Corporation. Auditors found errors in almost 12% of sampled events. In addition, the high number of speeding vehicles with no license plates, temporary plates, or obstructed plates make speed cameras less effective and potentially costs the City at least \$108 million in lost revenue.

Speed cameras are proven to deter speeding, improve road safety, and save lives. By allowing speeding to go unchecked, DOT is not only forgoing much-needed revenue that could be used to expand the program, but also allowing drivers to easily circumvent the law.

What changes did the agency commit to make following the audit?

- ▶ DOT agreed to modify its contract with Verra and request greater access to camera footage and data.
- ▶ DOT agreed to regularly review and analyze data to identify problematic cameras.
- ▶ DOT agreed to work with law enforcement and other government agencies to identify solutions to the problem of obscured/missing license plates.

AUDIT FINDINGS



DOT placed speed cameras in accordance with NYS Vehicle and Traffic Law and accurately issued tickets to drivers.



DOT ensured that cameras were functioning and properly maintained.



DOT did not properly review speeding events rejected by its contractor, potentially costing the City over \$100 million.



DOT does not use mobile speed cameras efficiently, with just 62.5% deployed on average during last quarter of 2021.



DOT overpaid for maintenance services, totaling \$107,500.



Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
<p>1 Modify the existing contract and all future contracts to ensure DOT has full access to data related to rejected speeding events, including images and videos.</p>	<p>AGREED</p>
<p>2 Request access to camera footage for all rejected speeding events in the AXSIS system on a regular basis and conduct sample-based reviews to determine whether rejections were appropriate, and if not, reverse the rejections and issue NOLs to vehicle owners.</p>	<p>AGREED</p>
<p>3 Provide Verra and its subcontractor with additional guidance and training on DOT's rejection criteria.</p>	<p>AGREED</p>
<p>4 Regularly review and analyze rejection data to identify underperforming and inactive cameras and address them as they occur</p>	<p>AGREED</p>
<p>5 Work with law enforcement, State agencies, and other cities experiencing problems with missing, temporary, and obscured license plates (impacting speeding, red light, and bus lane cameras, and tolls) to identify potential solutions to this growing problem.</p>	<p>AGREED</p>
<p>6 Determine whether it is cost effective to maintain all 40 mobile speed camera vehicles.</p>	<p>AGREED</p>
<p>7 Obtain a list of cameras being billed by Verra and carefully reconcile these to the active camera list before approving payment.</p>	<p>AGREED</p>
<p>8 Recoup \$107,483 from Verra in overcharged maintenance fees and determine whether any additional amounts should be recouped if Verra overcharged the same relocated camera beyond December 2021.</p>	<p>AGREED</p>



Visit our website to suggest an audit and view our recommendations tracker.

<https://comptroller.nyc.gov/audit>