



Facts, Not Fear

How Welcoming Immigrants Benefits **New York City**

January 2024

Background

Busting Myths about Immigration

As New York City welcomes over 100,000 new arrivals seeking asylum, it is critical to ground conversations on immigration in facts, not fear. This fact sheet seeks to provide accurate information on key questions.

FACT: Immigrants benefit our economy, irrespective of their status

Immigrants strengthen our economy as workers, entrepreneurs, taxpayers, and consumers:

- Immigrant New Yorkers are more likely to be employed, are more likely to create jobs² by starting a business, and contribute billions of dollars to our New York economy in spending power and tax revenue.³
- In 2021, immigrant New Yorkers paid \$61 billion dollars in taxes and constituted \$138 billion dollars in spending power.
- When New York City faced abandonment and fiscal crisis in the 1970s, a strong wave of immigration contributed to public safety, increased the city's population, and boosted public revenues.⁵
- Our upstate neighbors Rochester, Syracuse, and Utica⁶ experienced an economic revitalization after welcoming new arrivals, who have opened new businesses, contributed to population growth, rebuilt homes, 7 and contributed millions in taxes and spending power.8

Welcoming asylum seekers is a net positive to the economy.

• Conservative estimates have found that a 10% reduction in asylum seekers in one year would be a \$8.9 billion loss to the U.S. economy and over \$1.5 billion in lost tax revenue over five years.

Undocumented immigrants¹⁰ support economic growth, pay taxes, and keep our city and economy running as essential workers.

- Although they are ineligible for Social Security, Medicaid, and most public benefits, undocumented immigrants help sustain¹¹ these vital entitlement programs by contributing billions of dollars into Social Security¹² and billions more into local, state, and federal taxes.
- In 2021, undocumented immigrants contributed 13 \$30.8 billion in total taxes nationally, including \$18.6 billion in federal income taxes and \$12.2 billion in state and local taxes.
- In New York State, undocumented immigrants paid¹⁴ \$3 billion in taxes.
- Undocumented immigrants make up approximately 3.2 percent of the U.S. population, but 4.4 percent¹⁵ of the country's workforce.
- Undocumented immigrants are the backbone of many vital industries across New York. 70% of undocumented workers in New York are essential workers. 16

FACT: Immigrants drive workforce growth

New immigration helps the U.S. economy compensate 17 for declining birth rates, slow population growth, and residents moving out of the city. If not for immigrants, the U.S. workforce would be shrinking:¹⁸

- Immigrant workers currently constitute about 18% of the U.S. workforce, 19 a record high. In New York City, immigrants comprise 36% of our population and 43% of our workforce. 20
- Immigrant workers do not take jobs away²¹ from native-born workers.
- Immigrants are more likely to be entrepreneurs²² than native-born Americans. Evidence has shown that immigrants actually create more jobs than they take.²³
- The data is mixed on whether immigration has an impact on wages, with most studies finding wage impacts are small, 24 and outweighed by other factors. Public policies such as minimum wage increases, ²⁵ pay parity, ²⁶ and support for unionization have far more impact on wages in lower-paying sectors.
 - Providing more pathways to legal status for undocumented workers will help raise wages for everyone.²⁷

The United States is currently facing a labor shortage:

- Right now, the latest data²⁸ shows that we have 9.5 million job openings in the U.S., but only 6.5 million unemployed workers. That means, if every unemployed worker found a job, there would still be 3 million job openings.
 - o According to the U.S. Chamber of Commerce, 29 the vast majority of states have more job openings today than before the pandemic, while labor force participation remains below pre-pandemic levels.

New York City's workforce has shrunk30 since the pandemic. Growing our workforce by welcoming new arrivals will help address labor shortages and bolster our city's post-pandemic economic recovery:

- While New York City enjoys a much higher labor participation rate³¹ than many other parts of the country, New York City has lost over 100,000³² workers since February 2020.
- New York State continues to see labor shortages in sectors such as home health care. 33
- The job openings rate³⁴ in New York is still above pre-pandemic levels;³⁵ in a recent special survey, New York State businesses reported³⁶ approximately 4% of their total jobs are currently unfilled, compared with pre-pandemic job openings constituting about 2% of their overall workforce.
- The New York State Department of Labor has identified 39,456 jobs open to migrants and asylum seekers in New York.³⁷

FACT: Seeking asylum is lawful immigration

Arriving at the border to ask for asylum is lawful immigration. Every asylum seeker, no matter what country they are from, has a right to have their claims heard and adjudicated through our immigration system.

- The right to seek asylum in the U.S. is enshrined under federal law. 8 U.S.C. § 1158(a)(1). This right to seek safety from persecution is also guaranteed under <u>international law</u>.³⁸
- The first step in seeking asylum, as required by statute, ³⁹ is arriving in the United States.
- Asylum seekers may apply for asylum <u>regardless of how they arrived</u>⁴⁰ in the U.S. whether they presented themselves to authorities at the southern border, arrived at an airport, or otherwise.

Every asylum seeker should be welcomed with dignity and have a fair chance to have their asylum claims heard.

- Policies aimed at <u>deterring</u>⁴¹ people from seeking asylum have <u>never stopped</u> <u>immigration</u>. People fleeing for their lives will always need asylum, no matter how cruelly we treat them.
- Individuals and families from all over the world are fleeing persecution, torture, violence, and instability in their home countries.
 - Many of the asylum seekers who have reached New York City come from countries, such as <u>Venezuela</u>,⁴³ <u>Mauritania</u>,⁴⁴ and <u>Haiti</u>,⁴⁵ where the U.S. Department of State has identified prevalent human rights abuses, including torture, false imprisonment, and slavery.

FACT: The federal government can and should do more to help local governments and asylum seekers

- While comprehensive immigration reform is needed to address the root causes of a broken immigration system, the federal government can and should do more to support cities welcoming new arrivals.
- The federal government can provide <u>more funding</u>⁴⁶ and flexibility in reimbursing localities for the cost of providing shelter, case management, workforce development, and legal services.
- When war broke out in Ukraine, we saw what our federal government can do 47 when we decide to compassionately welcome people who have been displaced by turmoil.
- Under <u>federal law</u>, ⁴⁸ asylum applicants are not eligible for work authorization until six months after they file their asylum applications. The federal government can increase

access to work authorization for new arrivals by expanding humanitarian parole⁴⁹ and Temporary Protected Status⁵⁰ designations.

o Providing more lawful immigration pathways reduce unlawful immigration. Between 2022 and 2023, illegal crossings from Ukrainians, Haitians, Venezuelans, Cubans, and Nicaraguans sharply decreased⁵¹ after lawful pathways to entry through humanitarian parole⁵² were implemented for those countries.

FACT: This is not an unprecedented surge in immigration

While New York City is seeing an unprecedented number⁵³ of asylum seekers relying on the City's shelter system, the U.S. and New York City have seen periods of comparable or greater growth in our immigrant population in the past:

- The immigrant population in the U.S. has only risen marginally since 2021 -- the growth of our immigrant population in 2022 is 2 million less than⁵⁴ what the U.S. Census Bureau previously projected.
- The period from 2012 to 2022 saw slower growth in the immigrant share of the population⁵⁵ than the 2000s, 1990s, 1980s and 1970s.
- In the 1990s, the U.S. immigrant population grew exponentially. The number of immigrants in the U.S. grew⁵⁶ from 19 million to over 30 million between 1990-2000, an almost 5% increase in immigrants as a share of the total U.S. population.

The undocumented population in the U.S. has largely remained stable over the past 15 years.

- The undocumented population peaked in 2007. The number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. rose⁵⁷ from an estimated 3.5 million people to a high of 12 million people between 1990 and 2007.
- Since 2007 until 2021, the undocumented population in the United States has remained stable.⁵⁸ It has not grown, but rather hovered around 11 million people nationwide for the last 15 years.
- The undocumented population in New York City has been declining⁵⁹ over the last decade. Approximately 476,000 undocumented immigrants lived in NYC in 2019, the most recent year data is available, as compared to 504,000 in 2018.

FACT: The world is experiencing a global refugee crisis

Though New York City has seen periods of comparable or greater growth in our immigrant population in the past, it is important to understand current increases in a global context. The world is currently experiencing a global refugee crisis – more people have been forced to leave their home countries than ever before.

• Globally, <u>over 100 million people</u>⁶⁰ have been displaced due to armed conflict, instability, and violence. That includes <u>over 6 million Ukrainians</u>⁶¹ displaced by Russian invasion and <u>over 7 million Venezuelans</u>⁶² displaced by economic collapse.

The duty to welcome displaced people has disproportionately fallen on countries other than the U.S.:

- The vast majority, <u>76%</u>, ⁶³ of displaced people are hosted by low- and middle-income countries, not countries like the U.S.
- About 6 million out of the over 7 million <u>displaced Venezuelans</u>⁶⁴ have migrated to other Latin American or Caribbean countries.
- Three countries whose populations are a mere fraction of the U.S. total population, Turkey, Iran, and Colombia, host the most refugees in the world. 65 Colombia, which has a population of about 51 million, has taken in 2.5 million displaced people.

FACT: New York City is the greatest immigrant city the world has ever seen

- New York City has a rich history of welcoming immigrants and was once the epicenter of mass migration to the U.S.:
 - o It has been estimated that close to <u>40 percent of all current U.S. citizens</u>⁶⁶ can trace at least one of their ancestors to Ellis Island.
 - More than <u>12 million people</u>⁶⁷ entered through Ellis Island between 1892 and 1954. NYC's population increased⁶⁸ by over 1.3 million people from 1900 to 1910.
 - In just one day in 1907, over <u>11,000 immigrants</u>⁶⁹ entered New York City through Ellis Island.
 - \circ Today with twice as many people as in 1907, New York City welcomes up to $\underline{600}$ migrants a day 70 seeking shelter.
- New York City is still a city of immigrants. Over 3 million New York City residents are immigrants, comprising about 40% of our city's population.⁷¹
- New York City has the largest number of people of Bangladeshi, Colombian, Chinese, Dominican, Ecuadorian, Ghanaian, Guyanese, Haitian, Indian, Irish, Italian, Jamaican, Jewish, Nigerian, Pakistani, Russian, Senegalese, and Ukrainian descent in the U.S.

Endnotes

¹ State Demographics Data – New York, Migration Policy Institute (2021), https://www.migrationpolicy.org/data/state-profiles/state/workforce/NY.

² Pierre Azoulay, Benjamin F. Jones, J. Daniel Kim, Javier Miranda, *Immigrants to the U.S. Create More* Jobs than They Take, Kellogg School of Management (Oct. 5, 2020), https://insight.kellogg.northwestern.edu/article/immigrants-to-the-u-s-create-more-jobs-than-theytake.

³ Immigrants in New York, American Immigration Council (2021), https://map.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/locations/new-york/.

⁴ Id.

⁵ Immigration and New York City: The Contributions of Foreign-Born Americans to New York's Renaissance, 1975–2013, Americas Society/Council of the Americas (April 2014), https://www.ascoa.org/sites/default/files/NYCImmigrationReport2014.pdf.

⁶ Samra Brouk and Rachel May, *How Immigrants Sparked an Upstate Resurgence*, City and State (Oct. 2, 2023), https://www.cityandstateny.com/opinion/2023/10/opinion-how-immigrants-sparked-upstateresurgence/390858/.

⁷ Susan Hartman, How Utica Became a City Where Refugees Came to Rebuild, Literary Hub (June 9, 2022), https://lithub.com/how-utica-became-a-city-where-refugees-came-torebuild/#:~:text=And%20the%20Bosnians%20bought%20hundreds,they%20put%20in%20extra%20bedr ooms.

⁸ New Study on Buffalo and Syracuse Shows the Economic Power of Immigrants, New American Economy (Feb. 21, 2017), https://www.newamericaneconomy.org/press-release/new-study-on-buffalo-andsyracuse-shows-the-economic-power-of-immigrants/#:~:text=In%202014%2C%20foreignborn%20residents%20in%20Syracuse%20contributed%20%241.7%20billion,%24607.8%20million%20in %20spending%20power.

⁹ Michael A. Clemens, The Economic and Fiscal Effects on the United States from Reduced Numbers of Refugees and Asylum Seekers, Center for Global Development (March 2022), https://www.cgdev.org/sites/default/files/economic-and-fiscal-effects-united-states-reduced-numbersrefugees-and-asylum-seekers.pdf.

¹⁰ For a definition of undocumented immigrant, see here: https://immigrantsrising.org/resource/defining- undocumented/.

¹¹ Alexia Fernández Campbell, Trump says undocumented immigrants burden the safety net. He's wrong, Vox (Feb. 6, 2019), https://www.vox.com/2019/2/6/18213888/trump-undocumented-immigrants-factcheck.

¹² Catherine E. Shoichet, *Undocumented immigrants are paying their taxes today, too*, CNN (April 18, 2023), https://www.cnn.com/2023/04/18/us/undocumented-immigrants-taxes-

cec/index.html#:~:text=In%202019%2C%20according%20to%20the,annually%20through%20payroll%20 tax%20deductions.

- ¹³ Steven Hubbard, Dispelling the Myth: How Undocumented Immigrants Pay Taxes and Contribute to the US Tax Base, Immigration Impact (March 22, 2023) https://immigrationimpact.com/2023/03/22/how-undocumented-immigrants-pay-taxes-itin/.
- ¹⁴ Immigrants in New York, American Immigration Council (2021), https://map.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/locations/new-york/.
- ¹⁵ Nicole Prchal Svajlenka, *Protecting Undocumented Workers on the Pandemic's Front Lines*, The Center for American Progress (Dec. 2, 2023), https://www.americanprogress.org/article/protectingundocumented-workers-pandemics-front-lines-2/.
- ¹⁶ Immigrants Comprise 31 Percent of Workers in New York State Essential Businesses and 70 Percent of the State's Undocumented Labor Force Works in Essential Businesses, Center for Migration Studies (April 23, 2020), https://cmsny.org/publications/new-york-essential-workers/.
- ¹⁷ William H. Frey, New census estimates show a tepid rise in U.S. population growth, buoyed by immigration, The Brookings Institution (Jan. 4, 2023), https://www.brookings.edu/articles/new-censusestimates-show-a-tepid-rise-in-u-s-population-growth-buoyed-by-immigration/.
- ¹⁸ Jeffrey S. Passel and D'Vera Cohn, *Immigration projected to drive growth in U.S. working-age* population through at least 2035, Pew Research Center (March 8, 2017), https://www.pewresearch.org/short-reads/2017/03/08/immigration-projected-to-drive-growth-in-u-sworking-age-population-through-at-least-2035/.
- ¹⁹ Foreign-born Workers: Labor Force Characteristics 2022, U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (May 18, 2023)https://www.bls.gov/news.release/pdf/forbrn.pdf.
- ²⁰ 2021 Report, New York City Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs (March 2022), https://www.nyc.gov/assets/immigrants/downloads/pdf/MOIA-2021-Report.pdf.
- ²¹ Alex Nowrasteh, *Three Reasons Why Immigrants Aren't Going to Take Your Job*, Cato Institute (April 22, 2020), https://www.cato.org/blog/three-reasons-why-immigrants-arent-going-take-job.
- ²² Peter Dizikes, Study: Immigrants in the U.S. are more likely to start firms, create jobs, MIT News (May 9, 2022) ,https://news.mit.edu/2022/study-immigrants-more-likely-start-firms-create-jobs-0509.
- ²³ Pierre Azoulay, et al, *Immigrants to the U.S. Create More Jobs than They Take*, Kellogg Insight (Oct. 5, 2020) https://insight.kellogg.northwestern.edu/article/immigrants-to-the-u-s-create-more-jobs-thanthey-take.
- ²⁴ Alex Nowrasteh, Wage Effects of Immigration Are Small, Cato Institute (April 10, 2017) https://www.cato.org/blog/wage-effects-immigration-aresmall?utm content=buffer1cae3&utm medium=social&utm source=twitter.com&utm campaign=buff er.

- ²⁷ David Madland and Nick Bunker, Legal Status for Undocumented Workers Is Good for American Workers, Center for American Progress (March 20, 2013), https://www.americanprogress.org/article/legal-status-for-undocumented-workers-is-good-foramerican-workers-2/.
- ²⁸ Stephanie Ferguson, *Understanding America's Labor Shortage*, U.S. Chamber of Commerce (Dec. 19, 2023), https://www.uschamber.com/workforce/understanding-americas-labor-shortage.
- ²⁹ Stephanie Ferguson and Isabella Lucy, *America Works Data Center*, U.S. Chamber of Commerce (Dec. 19, 2023), https://www.uschamber.com/workforce/america-works-data-center.
- ³⁰ Local Area Unemployment Statistics New York City, U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (last accessed Jan. 2, 2024), https://www.bls.gov/regions/northeast/data/xg-tables/ro2xglausnyc.htm.
- ³¹ New York by the Numbers Monthly Economic and Fiscal Outlook, Office of the NYC Comptroller (Dec. 12, 2023), https://comptroller.nyc.gov/newsroom/newsletter/new-york-by-the-numbers-monthlyeconomic-and-fiscal-outlook-no-84-december-12th-2023/.
- ³² Local Area Unemployment Statistics New York City, U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (last accessed Jan. 2, 2024), https://www.bls.gov/regions/northeast/data/xg-tables/ro2xglausnyc.htm.
- ³³ Emily Eisner, Workforce Report: Labor Shortage Mitigation in New York's Home Care Sector, Fiscal Policy Institute (March 2023), https://fiscalpolicy.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/03/Fiscal-Policy-Institute-March-2023-Workforce-Report-Labor-Shortage-Mitigation-in-New-Yorks-Home-Care-Sector-1.pdf.
- ³⁴ Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey News Release, U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (Jan. 3, 2024), https://www.bls.gov/news.release/jolts.htm.
- ³⁵ New York Job Openings and Labor Turnover June 2023, U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (June 2023), https://www.bls.gov/regions/northeast/news-release/jobopeningslaborturnover_newyork.htm.
- ³⁶ Supplemental Survey Report: Wages Up 5-6 Percent in the Past Year; Gains Expected to Moderate over the Next Year, Federal Reserve Bank of New York (Feb. 2023) https://www.newyorkfed.org/medialibrary/media/Survey/business leaders/2023/2023 02supplement al.pdf?sc lang=en&hash=8C28F63BEB38D8870B3BFBDCD42CE7CD.
- ³⁷ Kate Lisa, *DOL: Nearly 40k jobs identified for NY migrants*, Spectrum Local News (Dec. 18, 2023), https://spectrumlocalnews.com/nys/central-ny/politics/2023/12/19/dol--nearly-40kjobs-identified-for-ny-migrants.

²⁵ New York by the Numbers Monthly Economic and Fiscal Outlook, New York City Comptroller (Sept. 12th, 2022), https://comptroller.nyc.gov/newsroom/newsletter/new-york-by-the-numbers-monthlyeconomic-and-fiscal-outlook-no-69-september-12th-2022/.

²⁶ Spotlight: Care Workers and the New York City Economy, New York City Comptroller (March 21, 2023), https://comptroller.nyc.gov/reports/spotlight-care-workers-and-the-new-york-city-economy/.

- ⁴⁰ Id. See also Obtaining Asylum in the United States, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, (last updated Sept. 13, 2023)), https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/refugees-and-asylum/asylum/obtaining-<u>asylum-in-the-united-states</u> (explaining procedure for asylum processing).
- ⁴¹ Aaron Reichlin-Melnick, *Immigration Policies Based on Deterrence Don't Work*, Immigration Impact, (April 2, 2021), https://immigrationimpact.com/2021/04/02/immigrants-coming-to-the-borderdeterrence-policies/.
- ⁴² Alex Nowrasteh, President Trump Reduced Legal Immigration. He Did Not Reduce Illegal Immigration, Cato Institute, (Jan. 20, 2021), https://www.cato.org/blog/president-trump-reduced-legal-immigrationhe-did-not-reduce-illegal-immigration.
- ⁴³ 2022 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: Venezuela, U.S. Department of State (March 20, 2023), https://www.state.gov/reports/2022-country-reports-on-human-rights-practices/venezuela/.
- ⁴⁴ 2022 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: Mauritania, U.S. Department of State (March 20, 2023), https://www.state.gov/reports/2022-country-reports-on-human-rights-practices/mauritania/.
- ⁴⁵ 2022 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: Haiti, U.S. Department of State (March 20, 2023), https://www.state.gov/reports/2022-country-reports-on-human-rights-practices/haiti.
- ⁴⁶ Shelter and Services Program Awards, U.S. Federal Emergency Management Agency (last updated Oct. 2, 2023), https://www.fema.gov/grants/preparedness/shelter-services-program/awards (NYC was awarded over \$106 million in federal Shelter and Services Program grant reimbursement). But see Accounting for Asylum Seekers - Fiscal Impacts, New York City Comptroller (Dec. 15, 2023), https://comptroller.nyc.gov/reports/accounting-for-asylum-seekers/#budget-implications (the City of New York spent \$1.4 billion for asylum seeker shelter and services in the fiscal year that ended in June 2023).
- ⁴⁷ President Biden to Announce Uniting for Ukraine, a New Streamlined Process to Welcome Ukrainians Fleeing Russia's Invasion of Ukraine, U.S. Department of Homeland Security (April 21, 2022), https://www.dhs.gov/news/2022/04/21/president-biden-announce-uniting-ukraine-new-streamlinedprocess-welcome-ukrainians.
- ⁴⁸ 8 U.S.C § 1158(d)(2), available at https://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/8/1158.
- ⁴⁹ Humanitarian or Significant Public Benefit Parole for Individuals Outside the United States, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (last updated Oct. 23, 2023), https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/humanitarian parole#:~:text=The%20Immigration%20and%20Nat ionality%20Act,(d)(5).
- ⁵⁰ Temporary Protected Status, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (last updated Dec. 13, 2023), https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/temporary-protected-status.

³⁸ Convention relating to the Status of Refugees (189 U.N.T.S. 150, entered into force April 22, 1954). United Nations. 1951, available at https://www.unhcr.org/us/about-unhcr/who-we-are/1951-refugee- convention.

³⁹ 8 U.S.C § 1158(a)(1), available at https://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/8/1158.

- 55 David J. Bier, New Data: Immigrant Population Is 2 Million Below 2017 Census Projections, Cato Institute (Sept. 21, 2023), https://www.cato.org/blog/new-census-bureau-data-2022-immigrantpopulation-2-million-below-2017projections#:~:text=The%20Census%20Bureau%20estimated%20that,projection%20for%20the%20first %20time.
- ⁵⁶ U.S. Immigrant Population and Share over Time, 1850-Present, Migration Policy Institute (2022), https://www.migrationpolicy.org/programs/data-hub/charts/immigrant-population-over-time.
- ⁵⁷ Robert Siegel and Selena Simmons-Duffin, How Did We Get To 11 Million Unauthorized Immigrants?, NPR (March 7, 2017), https://www.npr.org/2017/03/07/518201210/how-did-we-get-to-11-millionunauthorized-immigrants.
- ⁵⁸ Jennifer Van Hook, et al, A Turning Point for the Unauthorized Immigrant Population in the United States, Migration Policy Institute (Sept. 2023), https://www.migrationpolicy.org/news/turning-point-usunauthorized-immigrant-population.
- ⁵⁹ State of Our Immigrant City Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs Annual Report 2020, New York City Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs (March 2021), https://www.nyc.gov/assets/immigrants/downloads/pdf/MOIA-Annual-Report-for-2020.pdf.
- ⁶⁰ Refugee crisis: 100 million displaced, International Rescue Committee (last accessed Jan. 3, 2024), https://www.rescue.org/topic/refugee-crisis-100-million-displaced.
- ⁶¹ Ukraine Emergency, UNHCR: The UN Refugee Agency (last accessed Jan. 3, 2024), https://www.unrefugees.org/emergencies/ukraine/#:~:text=Emergencies&text=There%20are%20nearly %205.1%20million,(as%20of%20May%202023).&text=More%20than%206.2%20million%20refugees,(as %20of%20July%202023.
- 62 Venezuela Humanitarian Crisis, UNHCR: The UN Refugee Agency (last accessed Jan. 3, 2024), https://www.unrefugees.org/emergencies/venezuela/.

⁵¹ David J. Bier, Parole Sponsorship Is a Revolution in Immigration Policy, Cato Institute, (Sept. 18, 2023), https://www.cato.org/briefing-paper/parole-sponsorship-revolution-immigration-policy#parolesponsorships-effects-border-migration.

⁵² Processes for Cubans, Haitians, Nicaraguans, and Venezuelans, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (last updated September 20, 2023), https://www.uscis.gov/CHNV; Uniting for Ukraine, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (last updated Dec. 5, 2023), https://www.uscis.gov/ukraine.

⁵³ Accounting for Asylum Seeker Services – Asylum Seeker Census, New York City Comptroller (last updated Dec. 15, 2023), https://comptroller.nyc.gov/services/for-the-public/accounting-for-asylumseeker-services/asylum-seeker-census/.

⁵⁴ David J. Bier, *No, America Is Not Seeing an Unprecedented Surge in Immigration. New Census Data* Prove It., Cato Institute (Oct. 3, 2023), https://www.cato.org/commentary/no-america-not-seeingunprecedented-surge-immigration-new-census-data-prove-it.

- ⁶⁵ Figures at a glance: 108.4 million people worldwide were forcibly displaced, UNHCR: The UN Refugee Agency, (last accessed Jan. 3, 2024), https://www.unhcr.org/us/about-unhcr/who-we-are/figuresglance.
- ⁶⁶ Ellis Island, History, (last updated Feb. 13, 2023), https://www.history.com/topics/immigration/ellis- island.
- ⁶⁷ Lesley Kennedy, At Peak, Most Immigrants Arriving at Ellis Island Were Processed in a Few Hours, History (last updated Aug. 24, 2023), https://www.history.com/news/immigrants-ellis-island-shortprocessing-time.
- 68 Total Population New York City & Boroughs 1900 to 2010, New York City Department of Planning, https://www.nyc.gov/assets/planning/download/pdf/data-maps/nyc-population/historicalpopulation/nyc total pop 1900-2010.pdf.
- 69 Olivia B. Waxman, Ellis Island's Busiest Day Ever Was 110 Years Ago. Here's Why, Time (April 17, 2017), https://time.com/4740248/ellis-island-busiest-day/.
- ⁷⁰ As Number Of Asylum Seekers In City's Care Tops 64,100, City Announces Additional Policies For Asylum Seekers In City Shelters, Office of the NYC Mayor, (Oct. 16, 2023), https://www.nyc.gov/office-ofthe-mayor/news/780-23/as-number-asylum-seekers-city-s-care-tops-64-100-city-additional-policiesfor.
- ⁷¹ 2022 Annual Report, New York City Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs (Sept. 2023), https://www.nyc.gov/assets/immigrants/downloads/pdf/MOIA WeLoveImmigrantNYC AR 2023 final. pdf.

⁶³ Figures at a glance: 108.4 million people worldwide were forcibly displaced, UNHCR: The UN Refugee Agency (last accessed Jan. 3, 2024), https://www.unhcr.org/us/about-unhcr/who-we-are/figures- glance.

⁶⁴ Venezuela Humanitarian Crisis, UNHCR: The UN Refugee Agency (last accessed Jan. 3, 2024), https://www.unrefugees.org/emergencies/venezuela/.