

Halal and Kosher School Lunch Pilot Proposal

New York City Comptroller Scott M. Stringer

Bureaus of Policy and Research, Budget, and Public Affairs

MAY 2018

Halal and Kosher School Lunch Pilot Proposal

This plan, developed by the Office of New York City Comptroller Scott M. Stringer, proposes a pilot project that would offer halal and kosher meal options in certain New York City Department of Education (DOE) public school cafeterias. The plan describes the existing need for such a pilot, explores the challenges, defines the main objectives of the pilot, and identifies the principal activities, schedule, and deliverables.

Overview

The New York City Department of Education (DOE) has embarked on many initiatives in the past few years to provide equitable access to healthy food for all children, including universal free lunch, breakfast in the classroom, vegetarian schools, "Meatless Mondays," and "New York Thursdays."¹

A potential next step in equitably meeting student nutritional needs while also increasing participating in the school lunch program is to make halal and kosher foods available in school cafeterias. Due to religious dietary restrictions, some students have been left out of the City's recent efforts. With examples from other cities, including San Diego, California and Dearborn, Michigan, as well as university cafeterias, such as New York University and Columbia University, there is a precedent for providing a halal or kosher food option to a large and growing population of students.

Such an initiative requires thoughtful planning and cannot be implemented quickly. Meeting the needs of students and parents, while working within vendor supply and DOE facility constraints, will require a better understanding of current demand for halal and kosher meals, as well as the existing market for compliant food items. In order to design a program that is both cost effective and embraced by schools and students, time is required to solicit stakeholder feedback, survey vendors, and experiment with different models.

Given these challenges, Comptroller Stringer recommends that the City undertake a two-year pilot program to serve halal and kosher meals in some schools. A pilot would provide a better understanding of the benefits, costs, and potentially hidden opportunities of such an initiative. Data gathered from the pilot should be used in assessing the feasibility of scaling such a proposal citywide.

The following proposal documents the need for halal and kosher lunches in New York City schools, and identifies challenges and potential considerations that would need to be resolved in any plan that makes halal or kosher meals more accessible to students.

The Need for Halal and Kosher Lunches

City officials and education advocates have reported that about one in eight public school students are Muslim and 38 percent of students are Muslim or Jewish, totaling roughly 430,000 children.² Another 30,000 students attend non-public yeshivas in the city.³ While it is unknown how many of these students follow strict religious dietary customs that would prohibit participating in school lunch programs, it is possible that

thousands of students in New York City do not participate in DOE-provided school lunch because of their religious beliefs. This is significant for two key reasons: 1) the high prevalence of food insecurity among city students, and 2) the persistent, and growing, rates of discrimination against religious and immigrant groups.

Approximately 72 percent of New York City students qualify for free or reduced-price lunches, which indicates that many students may experience food instability and cannot rely on a packed lunch each day.⁴ For Muslim or Jewish students in this situation, offering halal or kosher meals in school would provide a much needed benefit. Overall, about 61 percent of students eligible for free or reduced-price lunch participate in school lunch, with higher participation in elementary schools, where about 74 percent of lower-income students opt for a school-provided lunch.⁵

DOE has endeavored to elevate the importance of equity in education and provide resources and guidance to make schools respectful and supportive environments for all students. As part of this focus on inclusiveness, the City has expanded its school holidays to include the Lunar New York, Eid al-Fitr, and Eid al-Adha in recognition of the large share of students and staff who observe these holidays. Prior to the change, in one Bay Ridge school 36 percent of students were absent when Eid al-Adha fell on a school day.⁶ By exploring ways to provide halal and kosher meals for students, the City can further enhance the inclusive and diverse environment it seeks to cultivate.

Challenges

The challenge of providing halal and kosher lunch options in a school system that serves 1.1 million students and more than 590,000 lunches per school day is not insignificant. To meet the challenge, DOE would have to procure a sufficient supply of food items that meet strict religious guidelines – and student tastes. DOE would also need to ensure that food is prepared, handled and stored properly and that it meets strict federal nutritional standards. Cost controls are also vital to the long-term sustainability of the program and enabling the City to expand these options to as many students as possible.

While the universe of students who may potentially want a halal or kosher lunch is large – about 430,000 students – determining how many student would actually participate is much more difficult. Many Jewish or Muslim students may not follow their religion's dietary customs, and among those who do, some may opt to bring a lunch to school. Others may observe some kosher or halal rules but not the strictest interpretation of the customs. Prior to engaging with students and parents, and experimenting with a small pilot, it is difficult to estimate how many students follow halal or kosher rules. Certainly, demand is likely to be far less than the total universe of Muslim and Jewish students.

A Pew Research Center report found that among Jews in the U.S., the denominations most likely to keep kosher make up smaller shares of the Jewish population.⁷ While about 92 percent of Orthodox Jews observe kosher rules, they make up only about 10 percent of the Jewish population. Among Jews who identify as Reform or do not identify with a specific denomination, less than 10 percent report keeping kosher; these groups account for two-thirds of the Jewish population. Furthermore, a large share of students opt to bring a lunch to school. Among students eligible for free and reduced-price lunch in school year 2016-17, nearly 40 percent did not participate in the school lunch program.

While challenges to offering halal and kosher meals are not insurmountable, they will require time and careful implementation. Notably, other school districts that have offered halal lunches initially began with a small pilot to test both the market and implementation. In Dearborn, Michigan in 2001, the district launched a pilot to provide halal lunch in one school.⁸ The effort was an experiment to learn whether increasing the food options would encourage more children to eat lunch and thus be better prepared to function in the

classroom. The pilot has expanded each year, and currently includes 25 of the district's 30 schools. Similarly, a high school in San Diego began a pilot in 2015 to offer a halal chicken bowl twice a week.

Halal and Kosher Dietary Rules

Halal and kosher dietary rules are similar in certain aspects, although kosher guidelines are more expansive and thus more challenging to follow in a school cafeteria.⁹ Both customs involve a complex and lengthy set of rules that can also be open to interpretation or debate, adding further complexity – and potentially, controversy – to implementing a school program. For both types of lunch offerings, supervision and certification by a religious inspector would be required.

Both halal and kosher rules prohibit certain foods, such as pork and pork products, and require animals to be slaughtered and processed in a certain way under supervision. Compliance under both sets of religious rules would require facilities to be managed in a way that avoids cross-contact with non-halal or non-kosher foods. Additionally, under halal rules the use of alcohol in food preparation is also prohibited, while kosher law prohibits shellfish as well as mixing meat and dairy products in the same meal or using the same utensils and cooking equipment for the preparation of meat and dairy products. Under halal guidelines, food can be prepared using the same facilities and equipment as non-halal food, as long as proper cleaning procedures are observed.

There would likely be higher barriers and costs to offering kosher meals in schools, largely due to kosher rules' restrictions on meat and dairy products, as well as the need for separate facilities. Because it would likely be cost prohibitive for school kitchens and cafeterias to maintain separate equipment and serving utensils for kosher meat, dairy, and non-kosher meat, the most sensible path forward for offering kosher meals may be pre-made, individually packaged meals. The inability to serve meat and dairy in the same meal would also require a more extensive menu redesign to ensure that kosher foods meet federal nutritional and caloric standards. Again, a Request for Proposal for individually packaged kosher meals would specify the exact nutritional and caloric needs, as well as the desired kosher standards, for distributing in schools.

On the other hand, for halal-compliant lunches, the DOE could largely maintain the current lunch menu but simply substitute halal-compliant meats. While halal rules do maintain restrictions on types of food allowed and require care in preventing exposure to non-halal foods, in general the guidance surrounding the halal diet are less strict than kosher and primarily refers to meat that is served. For example, a chicken patty prepared using halal chicken, could be served on a non-halal bun along with a vegetable and milk.

Because both halal and kosher rules involve strict restrictions on allowable food items, careful implementation and communication with the school community will be critical. To ensure the maximum value to schools, and to know that parents and students fully trust that lunches are made in compliance with religious dietary rules, proper staff training and facility inspection must be prioritized. Cafeteria workers will also need to be trained to ensure cross-exposure never occurs, and food preparation stations will need to be evaluated to ensure food storage and work spaces are sufficient. Implementation must also include complete transparency of the ingredients used in each meal and include regular communication with families to alert them to the quality and the source of the food being offered. As New York City currently requires for halal meat procured for city jails, a certification of halal or kosher compliance should also be required from every vendor. If pre-packaged kosher meals were offered, the kosher seal serves as an assurance of compliance with kosher rules.

Program Options

A halal or kosher school lunch program could be structured in different ways, and the program could potentially evolve over time. It is likely that different models would be more appropriate for serving either halal or kosher meals. Below are two possible program models, included here as an example. In developing an actual pilot, it is recommended that the DOE would work with a school community to determine the best program model to meet its dietary needs.

Example A: Request a meal. Similar to how airline passengers might request a vegetarian meal prior to a flight, this model would require students or families to request a kosher or halal meal accommodation when the student begins at the school. Schools would then be required to offer compliant meals for those students every day. This option would limit the number of students participating in the program but would present logistical challenges if daily food preparation were involved, to prevent cross-contamination with the non-kosher, non-halal school offerings. Cafeteria staff would also have to monitor which students take a halal or kosher meal to ensure that the daily supply is sufficient for all participating students. If the meal offerings are different than the regular lunch meal, this option may also unintentionally stigmatize participating students. Notably, one of the City's goals in offering universal free lunch was to create a more inclusive environment; providing different meals for different students may work against this goal.

For students who require a kosher meal, however, pre-ordered packaged kosher lunches designed specifically with the end user in mind would likely be the most sensible option. A certain number of kosher meals could be delivered daily or, depending on space considerations, weekly and stored in the school kitchen without concerns about cross-exposure to non-kosher foods.

Example B: One option for everyone. Another option is to offer halal or kosher meals to all students on certain days or every day. This approach is used in Dearborn, MI and San Diego, CA for halal lunches. At Crawford High School in San Diego, the school began serving a halal chicken bowl twice a week in 2015 to all students.¹⁰ The school reported increased lunch participation as a result. In Dearborn, 25 of 30 public schools offer a 100 percent halal menu to everyone.¹¹ The Director of Food Services in Dearborn notes that the all-halal menu simplifies ordering, warehousing, and distribution, in addition to lessening confusion for students and families.

With this model, a key program design question is how many days to serve meals that would be universally acceptable to all students. Again, due to constraints of kosher meal preparation, this approach would not be ideal for serving kosher to a diverse student body where not all students require or desire kosher meals. But for schools wishing to increase halal offerings, this model offers significant promise. In Dearborn, for example, schools adopt a fully halal menu for the entire student body, but a meat-based meal is not offered every day. Rather, a fish meal, such as shrimp poppers, fish nuggets, fish tacos, or fish patty, is served about once per week, and vegetarian meals are offered multiple days per week. (See Appendix A for a sample Dearborn menu.) In contrast, New York City's school lunch menu for the month of February 2018 offered a fish meal – a fish and cheese sandwich – on just one day in the entire month. (See Appendix B.) On the other days, Dearborn offers hamburgers, chicken nuggets or patties, hot dogs, turkey, or turkey sausage, all made with halal meat.

Other considerations

City schools currently offer cheese pizza on Fridays and often offer another vegetarian option at least one other day per week. However, some Muslim and Jewish students and parents may be skeptical that these

seemingly vegetarian options are truly vegetarian. An immediate step that the DOE could take would be to certify that current vegetarian offerings do not contain any meat products, for example, chicken broth in the tomato sauce, and train staff to use separate utensils and cooking equipment to avoid contact with meat products.

Specifically for expanding halal offerings, the DOE should attempt to design as many non-meat options as possible that are appetizing to students while remaining in compliance with nutritional standards. An expansion of vegetarian and fish options would partially mitigate challenges with halal meat supply and cost. Given that the City has implemented "Meatless Mondays" in many schools and now provides an all vegetarian menu to three elementary schools, the DOE has a significant head start in finding suitable vegetarian options.¹² Nonetheless, ultimately determining the number of days to offer halal meat options should be influenced by parent and student feedback. As with any school food offering, particularly for young children with developing taste buds, the options must be appealing to students.

The City will also need to determine how many schools to include in an initial pilot. An advisory taskforce including religious leaders, community-based organizations, local officials, and school representatives could help recommend neighborhoods and schools with the greatest demand. Ultimately, participation in the pilot should depend on the principal's eagerness to engage in the new initiative. Strong commitment from each pilot school's leadership is important to ensuring that the program is well implemented.

During the pilot phase, the DOE should consider a mix of program structures, including some schools that offer halal options, some schools that offer kosher options, and some schools that offer both. Experimenting with different program designs will allow DOE to evaluate the pros and cons of each.

Supply

Depending on the quantity of halal meats or kosher meals required by a pilot, the City may or may not be able to meet demand with existing suppliers. On the one hand, the market for kosher food in the U.S. is more regulated and more widely accessible than the market for halal meat. Unlike halal meat, certified kosher foods are labeled and available at most grocery stores. More than 40 percent of packaged food and beverage products in the U.S. is kosher certified, a growing trend.¹³

However, even though halal meat is not as regulated or prevalent as kosher meat, many purveyors of halal meat operate in New York City. While the City is home to about 300 kosher restaurants, the City is home to more than 680 restaurants and 200 grocery stores that serve halal food, according to Zabihah, an online aggregator of halal food purveyors.¹⁴

In addition, the City currently contracts with food service providers who provide halal meat and kosher meals to City agencies, including the Department of Correction (DOC) and the Department for the Aging (DFTA).

The DOC currently contracts with four separate vendors to provide halal meat to inmates and staff: Chef's Choice Cash & Carry Food Distributor, Inc.; Golden Platter; Jamac Frozen Food Corp.; and Nebraskaland, Inc.¹⁵ DOC's halal contracts total \$6 million and cover a 14-month period. Contracted items include beef patties, hot dogs, meatballs, and sliced turkey. Each contract includes a halal inspection certificate and information on the meat suppliers. According to the contracts, three suppliers produce the meat in New York State, including Golden Krust Bakery & Grill, which is based in the Bronx. One of the vendors that supplies Golden Krust's signature Jamaican style halal beef patties also is a food service distribution vendor for city public schools – Chef's Choice Cash & Carry Food Distributor, Inc. Chef's Choice is based in

Flatbush, Brooklyn and has a 5-year, \$31 million contract to serve food to Staten Island schools through October 2019. The Jamaican patties cost DOC about \$1.80 per pound.

Another current DOE food service vendor, Metropolitan Foods, Inc./Driscoll Foods, offers halal and kosher meat items to New York State government agencies in the downstate region through a state contract.¹⁶ Available items include halal chicken tenders, halal ground beef, kosher turkey breast, and kosher hot dogs. Driscoll Foods has two DOE contracts to serve schools in Queens, the Bronx, and Upper Manhattan.

Additionally, through DFTA the City currently procures about 1 million home delivered kosher meals each year for seniors.¹⁷

Current NYC Vendors and Suppliers with Halal/Kosher Offerings

*Indicates suppliers providing locally-sourced meat

Vendors	Suppliers
Chef's Choice Cash & Carry Food Distributor, Inc.	*Golden Krust Bakery & Grill
Golden Platter Foods, Inc	Crescent Foods Jennie-O Turkey Marcho Farms, Inc.
Jamac Frozen Food Corp	Integrity Foods Inc. *LJ Campbell *Old World Provisions *Golden Krust Caribbean Bakery & Grill Rajbhog Foods (NJ), Inc.
Nebraskaland, Inc.	Stahl-Meyer, Kingsland Prime Meats

Cost

The actual cost of a halal or kosher lunch program will depend on many factors, including the program structure, school and student participation, types of meal offerings, and the cost of the halal and kosher products. A pilot would help DOE understand all of these components. Over time, the price of halal and kosher products may also change as suppliers respond to demand, and the DOE's large purchasing power. Initially, prices could be higher if local supply is insufficient. Additional upfront funding would also be required for staff training, equipment purchase, outreach, and administration.

Currently, the City spends about \$4.15 per meal to procure, prepare, and serve every school lunch.¹⁸ These costs are offset by federal and state reimbursements. Beginning in the 2017-18 school year, the City receives federal reimbursement through the Community Eligibility Provision (CEP) program, which provides uniform reimbursement for all school lunches and allows all students to obtain free lunch. Under this program, the DOE receives federal reimbursement of \$3.37 per lunch.¹⁹ New York State provides additional reimbursement of about \$0.06 per lunch.²⁰

Halal pricing

While procuring halal meat would likely be more expensive than meat products currently purchased by DOE, meat is only one component of a school lunch. The full cost of school lunch includes equipment and staff costs to prepare and serve food; the food commodity component accounts for 42 percent of the total cost.²¹ The meat component is even less.

According to a recent pricing list for New York State's food contract with Driscoll Foods, halal meats are about 10 to 20 percent more expensive, compared to similar non-kosher and non-halal meat items.²² This aligns with reported costs from other districts that have implemented halal meals. The Director of Food Service in Dearborn reports that halal products are about 15 to 20 percent more expensive.²³

While storage and distribution are more challenging for city schools than city jails, DOC's current prices for halal meat are instructive. For example, as shown in Table 1, DOC procures halal meatballs for about \$2.40 per pound, compared to prices in DOE's Chef's Choice and Driscoll Foods contracts of roughly \$2.00 to \$2.50 per pound. Prices for halal turkey and salami are higher at about \$3.40 per pound for DOC, compared to prices in DOE's Chef's Choice contract of about \$2.90 per pound for oven roasted turkey and about \$2.80 per pound for salami. These price differences also suggest that halal meat may be roughly 10 to 20 percent more expensive than non-halal meat.

	Golden Platter Foods, Inc.	Nebraskaland, Inc.	Jamac Frozen Food Corp.	Chef's Choice Cash & Carry Food Dist, Inc.
Jamaican Style Beef Patties			\$1.82	\$1.78
Beef and Soy Burgers		\$1.57	\$2.16	
Frankfurters		\$2.96	\$2.94	
Meatballs	\$2.40		\$2.37	
Chicken Patties	\$1.51		\$1.86	
Meatloaf - Beef with Gravy	\$1.85		\$2.13	
Sliced Turkey	\$3.44	\$3.43		
Beef Salami	\$3.44	\$3.43		
Turkey Sausage	\$2.36	\$1.87		

Table 1: Price per Pound for Selected Halal Meats Procured by the NYC Department of Correction, by Vendor

Kosher pricing

Kosher meals are likely to be more expensive than halal meals, particularly if individually packaged, precooked meals are piloted for public schools. However, because there would be less preparation and food handling training required in the delivery of a packaged kosher meal, some overhead costs would be minimized. And yet, the City's Department for the Aging (DFTA) has reported that individually packaged home delivered kosher meals are \$1.38 more expensive than non-kosher meals.²⁴

The price of individual kosher items is typically higher for all products. For example, recent prices for smoked turkey breast through New York State's food contract with Driscoll Foods are 60 percent higher for kosher meat, a difference of about \$1.80 per pound.

Implementation Plan

Pilot project description: The pilot project would be implemented over two years and would be located in a district or districts selected for having a population of Muslim and/or Jewish students who follow religious dietary guidelines. A relatively low school lunch participation rate may also indicate a need for changing or expanding school lunch options to increase participate by better accommodate students' diets.

The project roll-out would include two phases:

Phase I would establish an advisory task force to map out the implementation plan for the pilot. The task force should include individuals from faith communities, food advocates, SchoolFood content experts, food service workers, parents, teachers and students. The task force's objectives would include: (1) selection of schools or district/s and school type (elementary, middle or high schools), (2) identifying halal and kosher vendor/s, (3) proposing an RFP for procuring halal and kosher meals, (4) reviewing and evaluating kitchen space retrofitting needs, including work areas, utensils, and food storage space, (5) establishing a menu, (6) devising and implementing a training curriculum and schedule for school-based food service employees, and (7) creating a community engagement platform to raise awareness of the pilot within the school community – including students, parents and caregivers, and teachers.

The task force could also propose different models to be piloted in schools, and thereby collect data on participation and costs based on a particular model. For example, different models could include serving halal or kosher options two times vs. four times each week, requesting that families opt-in to the halal/kosher option, or offering it universally.

Phase II would begin July 1st of the implementation year. This phase would be overseen by a project director tasked with ensuring continuity of service from suppliers and adequate support for in-school food service workers. The project director would conduct regular surveys of the program, including semi-regular in-school halal food prep inspections, to gather feedback from cafeteria workers, parents, students, and food suppliers. This would also allow DOE to better understand potential participation rates, costs, and supply constraints. During Phase II, at least two parent engagement events should be held to raise awareness of the goals of the pilot, establish transparency about the products included in the halal menu, and to gather feedback from families whose children are or are not participating.

Kosher and Halal School Lunch Pilot Proposal

Problem to be addressed: Muslim and Jewish students do not have halal and kosher options in public school cafeterias

Goals of the pilot project:

- To understand the cost and feasibility of providing halal and kosher food in New York City school cafeterias including the sourcing, procurement, distribution, preparation, storage, professional staff training and parent and student outreach; and
- 2) To better understand the benefit to students and families.

Questions to be answered over the course of pilot:

- How many more students ate school lunch than before the pilot?
- How many food service staff were fully trained?
- What is the most efficient way to prepare a typical school kitchen to provide halal meals? What unique food storage, preparation space or utensils must be considered?
- How many hours of training were required to prepare school-based food service workers?
- How many parent outreach events were held? What responses were received?
- What types of student outreach occurred? How did student outreach impact participation in the program?
- What was the unit cost? Did the unit cost increase over the course of the pilot? If so, by how much?
- Would supply constraints pose a hurdle to expanding the pilot to more schools?
- What was the cost of new equipment or facility renovations?
- What would be necessary to expand the pilot to more schools in the city?



Appendix A. Dearborn, Michigan Elementary School Halal Lunch Menu for March 2018

WWW.schoolfoodnyc.org						
	FEBRUARY 2	2018: Pre-K - 8	Lunch Menu			
Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday		
CHICKEN DELIGHTS	BURGER BASH	CULINARY	NEW YORK	PIZZA PARTY		
			New York Thursday 1			
			Hot Turkey Caprese	Classic Cheese Pizza		
			on Clabatta Bread	Meat Lovers Pizza		
			Mozzarella Sticks Marinara Sauce	Bacon & Sausage		
			New York Hot Pretzel			
			French Fries	Green Garden Salad		
			Salad Bar	Salad Bar		
			Kale Salad New York Apple Slices	Italian Marinated Cucumber Salad		
5 Popcorn Chicken	6 Jamaican Beef Patty	7 Steak & Cheese	New York Burger & Fries 8 100% Beef New York	Classic Cheese Pizza		
Dipping Sauce Cup		Empanada	Cheeseburgers			
With Mac-N-Cheese	Mozzarella Sticks Marinara Sauce	Frito-Lay ® SunChips ®	Served on Ciabatta Bread with Lettuce Tomato &	Extra Zesty Pizza		
Garlic Toast	Hot Confetti Corn		New York Onion	Garlic Knot		
	Roasted Broccoli	Onion Rings	New York French Fries	Roasted Chickpea with Basil Pesto		
veet Potato Wedge Fries		Salad Bar	New York Cookie Treat			
Salad Bar	Salad Bar Caesar Salad	Carrot & Lemon Salad	Salad Bar Celery & Apple Salad	Salad Bar Roasted Broccoli		
Italian Classico Salad			New York Apple Slices	& Cauliflower Salad		
Brunch for Lunch 12	13	14	New York Thursday 15	Midwinter Recess		
Brunch Crispy Chicken	100% Beef Hamburgers & Cheeseburgers	Baked Penne	Steamed Chicken Dumplings with Asian Dipping Sauce	Classic Cheese Pizza		
Waffle Sandwich served with syrup	Southwest Fish & Cheese	Mozzarella Sticks Marinara Sauce	Vegetable Fried Rice	Ranch Chicken Pizza with Popcorn Chicken		
	Sandwich	Roasted Zucchini	Crunchy Carrot Sticks			
Mac-N-Cheese	Served with Lettuce Tomato & New York Onion		Ţ	Garlic Knot		
Home Fries	French Fries	Dinner Roll	New York Cookie Treat	Kale Caesar Salad White Bean Salad		
Frito-Lay ® SunChips ®		Salad Bar	Salad Bar Asian Slaw	Salad Bar		
Salad Bar	Salad Bar	Spinach & Cranberry Salad	Fresh New York Apples	Fresh Marinated		
Green Garden Salad Midwinter Recess 19	Greek Zucchini Salad Midwinter Recess 20	Midwinter Recess 21	Midwinter Recess 22	Vegetable Salad Midwinter Recess		
Popcorn Chicken	100% Beef Hamburgers &	Steak & Cheese	Mozzarella Sticks	Classic Cheese Pizza		
Dipping Sauce Cup With	Cheeseburgers Burgers served with Lettuce,	Empanada	Marinara Sauce	Meat Lovers Pizza		
Mac-N-Cheese	Tomato & New York Onion	Seasoned Wedge Fries	French Fries	Bacon & Sausage		
Stewed Pinto Beans	"Sweet-N-Spicy"		Healthy Cole Slaw			
Salad Bar	Sweet Potato Waffle Fries	Baked! Tostitos® Scoops®	New York Cookie Treat	Green Garden Salad		
occoli and Cranberry Salad	Salad Bar Fresh Cilantro Slaw	Salad Bar Confetti Corn Salad	Salad Bar Kale Salad	Salad Bar Italian Marinated		
	Fresh Cliantro Slaw	Conretti Com Salad	New York Apple Slices	Cucumber Salad		
26	Burger Promo 27	28	* .			
Popcorn Chicken	100% Beef Greek Style	Cheesy Bread Marinara Sauce	(Call			
With	Served on Clabatta Bread		S CAL			
Mac-N-Cheese	Turkey Burger	Frito-Lay ® SunChips ®				
Garlic Toast	Burgers served with Lettuce Tomato & New York Onion	Roasted Broccoli	*			
west Batata Wadaa Erica	French Fries	Salad Bar	EW			
weet Potato Wedge Fries		Caesar Salad	EVERY THURSDAY WE'RE PROUDLY CELEBRATING			
Salad Bar Italian Classico Salad	Salad Bar Confetti Corn Salad		LOCALLY SOURCED & PRODUCED FOOD			
		OFFERED DAILY	PRODUCED FOOD			
tree Alternatives	<u>Milk</u>		Dressings	Flavor Station		
&J Sandwich eese Sandwich	1% Low-fat Fat Free	Fresh Fruit	Chipotle Ranch Balsamic Vinaigrette	Granulated Garlic Red Pepper Flakes		
ain Turkey Sandwich Immus Grab & Go	Fat Free Chocolate		Ranch Asian Sesame	Parmesan Cheese		
	Dipping Sauce Cups	No Artificial flavors, colors,	Honey Mustard Caesar	Pre-K - 8 Lunch Menu		
	BBQ, Ranch, Honey Mustard	or sweeteners in all SchoolFood Products	French	Lunch Menu		
	noncy mustaru		Italian Vinaigrette			
	All Pre-K Studen	ATTENTION: ts CANNOT be Offered CH	OCOLATE MILK			

Appendix B. NYC Elementary School Lunch Menu for February 2018

Endnotes

- 1 Sean Piccoli and Elizabeth A. Harris, "New York City Offers Free Lunch for All Public School Students" The New York Times (September 6, 2017), <u>https://www.nytimes.com/2017/09/06/nyregion/free-lunch-new-york-city-schools.html</u>.
- 2 Estimated number of children based on total enrollment of 1.1 million students in school year 2015-16, including prekindergarten and charter schools. "Mayor de Blasio and Chancellor Farina Designate Eid al-Fitr and Eid al-Adha Official School Holidays" (March 4, 2015), Columbia University Teachers College, "Post 9/11: NYC Muslim Students Feel Safe But Hyper-aware of Religious Identity" (April 30, 2008); and Susan Edelman, "NYC Public Schools May be Required to Serve Kosher and Halal Options" New York Post (April 23, 2017).
- 3 Ben Chapman, "Jewish Group Slams Mayor de Blasio's Free School Lunch Plan for Not Offering Kosher Foods" New York Daily News (October 2, 2017), <u>http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/education/nyc-free-school-lunch-plan-ripped-not-offering-kosher-foods-article-1.3535036</u>.
- 4 New York State Council on Children and Families, "Children Receiving Free or Reduced-price School Lunch Public Schools: 2016-17" Kids' Well-being Indicators Clearinghouse, <u>http://www.nyskwic.org/get_data/indicator_profile.cfm?subIndicatorID=52&indYear1=2016&go.x=15&go.y=18&go =Submit&indYear2=2017.</u>
- 5 Based on data provided by the New York State Education Department for March 2017.
- 6 "Mayor de Blasio and Chancellor Farina Designate Eid al-Fitr and Eid al-Adha Official School Holidays" (March 4, 2015), <u>http://schools.nyc.gov/Offices/mediarelations/NewsandSpeeches/2014-2015/Mayor+De+Blasio+and+Chancellor+Fari%C3%B1a+Designate+Eid+Al-Fitr+and+Eid+Al-Adha+Official+School+Holidays.htm</u>.
- 7 Pew Research Center, A Portrait of Jewish Americans: Findings from a Pew Research Center Survey of U.S. Jews (October 1, 2013), pp. 10 and 77, <u>http://assets.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/11/2013/10/jewish-american-full-report-for-web.pdf</u>.
- 8 The Associated Press, "School System in Michigan Plans to Serve Muslim Food" The New York Times (February 25, 2001), <u>http://www.nytimes.com/2001/02/25/us/school-system-in-michigan-plans-to-serve-muslim-food.html</u>.
- 9 American Halal Foundation, "General Guidelines for Use of the Term 'Halal," <u>http://www.halalfoundation.org/guidelineHal.htm</u>; and Orthodox Union, "The Kosher Primer," <u>https://oukosher.org/the-kosher-primer/</u>.
- 10 Megan Burks, "San Diego's Crawford High School Pilots Halal School Lunches" KPBS (May 20, 2015), http://www.kpbs.org/news/2015/may/20/crawford-high-school-pilots-halal-school-lunches/.
- 11 Communication with Jeff Murphy, Director of Food Services, Dearborn Public Schools (October 23, 2017).
- 12 Isabel Putinja, "Brooklyn Gets Its First All-vegetarian Public School" Forks Over Knives (November 10, 2017), https://www.forksoverknives.com/brooklyn-gets-first-vegetarian-public-school/#gs.7bcYtnc.
- 13 Deena Shanker, "Less than 2% of the U.S. Population is Jewish. So Why is 41% of the Country's Packaged Food Kosher?" Quartz (June 8, 2015), <u>https://qz.com/407157/less-than-2-of-the-us-population-is-jewish-so-why-is-41-of-the-countrys-packaged-food-kosher/</u>.
- 14 Aaron Elstein, "Inside the Business of Making New York's Restaurants Kosher" Crain's New York (March 6, 2016), <u>http://www.crainsnewyork.com/article/20160306/HOSPITALITY_TOURISM/160309906.</u>; and "Zabinah: New York City" (accessed February 9, 2018), <u>https://www.zabihah.com/reg/United-States/New-York/New-York-</u> <u>City/fHIzOtdQhd</u>.
- 15 NYC Comptroller's Office analysis of Department of Correction contracts.
- 16 New York State Office of General Services, "Food Retail (Downstate Region," https://www.ogs.state.ny.us/purchase/spg/awards/0245022688CAN.HTM.
- 17 "New DFTA Funding Addresses Rising Food Costs" (July 17, 2014), http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dfta/downloads/pdf/pr/dfta_food_budget_pr.pdf.
- 18 Data provided by the New York City Office of Management and Budget. Also see, New York City Independent Budget Office, If No Student Pays: Cost to Provide Free Lunch for All of New York City's Elementary School

Students (February 2017), <u>http://www.ibo.nyc.ny.us/iboreports/if-no-student-pays-cost-to-provide-free-lunch-for-all-of-new-york-citys-elementary-school-students.html</u>.

- 19 Data provided by the New York City Office of Management and Budget. At the beginning of the 2017-18 school year, the City announced that all students would have access to free lunch through the federal Community Eligibility Provision (CEP). Under this program, schools are reimbursed for meal spending based on the share of qualified students at the district or school level, as determined by food stamps, public assistance, or Medicaid enrollment. See, New York State Education Department, "2017-18 Community Eligibility Provision (CEP) Application and Instructions" (April 17, 2017), http://www.cn.nysed.gov/content/2017-18-community-eligibility-provision-cep-application-and-instructions; Federal Register, "National School Lunch, Special milk, and School Breakfast Programs, National Average Payments/Maximum Reimbursement Rates" (July 28, 2017), https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2017/07/28/2017-15956/national-school-lunch-special-milk-and-school-breakfast-programs-national-average-paymentsmaximum; and New York City Independent Budget Office, If No Student Pays: Cost to Provide Free Lunch for All of New York City's Elementary School Students (February 2017), http://www.ibo.nyc.ny.us/iboreports/if-no-student-pays-cost-to-provide-free-lunch-for-all-of-new-york-citys-elementary-school-students.html.
- 20 New York State provides reimbursement of \$0.20 for reduced-price lunch and \$0.06 for free and full-price lunch. New York State Education Department, "2017-2018 Reimbursement Rates" http://www.cn.nysed.gov/content/2017-2018-reimbursement-rates.
- 21 Based on actual FY 2017 Department of Education expenditures for School Food Services in the New York City Financial Management System.
- 22 New York State Office of General Services, "Food Retail (Downstate Region" (prices for the week of February 12, 2018), <u>http://www.ogs.ny.gov/purchase/spg/pdfdocs/0245022688WPL_MetropolitanFoods.xlsx</u>.
- 23 Merinda Valley, "Dearborn Schools a National Model for Halal Options" The Arab American News (September 4, 2015), <u>http://www.arabamericannews.com/2015/09/04/Dearborn-schools-a-national-model-for-halal-options/</u>.
- 24 "New DFTA Funding Addresses Rising Food Costs" (July 17, 2014), http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dfta/downloads/pdf/pr/dfta_food_budget_pr.pdf.