



City of New York

OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER

Scott M. Stringer
COMPTROLLER



SPECIAL REPORTS

Marjorie Landa

Deputy Comptroller for Audit

Analysis of the Financial and Operating
Practices of Union-Administered Benefit
Funds with Fiscal Years Ending in
Calendar Year 2012

SR15-089S

January 5, 2016

<http://comptroller.nyc.gov>



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER
1 CENTRE STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10007

SCOTT M. STRINGER
COMPTROLLER

January 5, 2016

To the Residents of the City of New York:

My office has analyzed the financial practices of 107 union-administered benefit funds that received approximately \$1.14 billion in City contributions during 2012. Benefit funds provide City employees, retirees and dependents with a variety of supplemental health benefits not provided under City-administered health insurance plans.

The purpose of this report is to provide a comparative analysis of the overall financial activities of union-administered benefit funds that received City contributions. The analyses contained in this report provide a means of comparing the operations of the funds and performance of fund trustees and administrators.

In summary, this report identifies the following financial issues that need to be addressed:

- Certain funds spent a large percentage of their revenue on administrative expenses. Reducing administrative expenses would allow funds to increase benefits for members.
- Certain funds had large operating surpluses resulting in high reserves. Excess reserves may indicate that funds should increase members' benefits.
- The expenses of certain funds exceeded their revenues, resulting in operating deficits. Operating deficits could deplete fund reserves, which could ultimately lead to insolvency.

This report contains eight recommendations that are addressed to the funds' trustees and three recommendations to the Office of Labor Relations.

If you have any questions concerning this report, please e-mail my Audit Bureau at audit@comptroller.nyc.gov.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Scott M. Stringer".

Scott M. Stringer

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
Findings and Conclusion	1
Recommendations.....	2
REPORT OF ANALYSIS.....	5
Background	5
City Oversight of Benefit Funds	7
Objectives.....	8
Scope of Analysis	8
FUND EXPENSES	10
Welfare Funds: Administrative Expenses	12
Annuity Funds: Administrative Expenses.....	14
High Percentage Increases and Decreases in Revenue Spent on Administration	15
Administrative Expenses Versus Total Expenses.....	17
EXPENDITURES FOR BENEFITS.....	18
RESERVE LEVELS.....	22
OPERATING DEFICITS	25
ANALYSIS OF TOTAL REVENUE.....	27
Funds Should Address Financial and Operating Issues to Ensure Maximum Use of Revenue and Continued Financial Solvency	28
EXCEPTIONS ON FUND OPERATIONS	30
CPA Opinions	30
Late Submission of Directive #12 Reports.....	32
CPAs Were Not Selected from Comptroller's Prequalified List.....	34
Eligibility Delay	34
Consolidation of Professional Services.....	35
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	36
Administrative and Benefit Expenses	36
Recommendations	36

Reserves	36
Recommendations	36
Exceptions on Fund Operations	37
Recommendations	37

EXHIBITS:

- A. Schedule of Official Fund Names
- B. Schedule of Financial Data
- C. Schedule of Administrative Expenses
- D. Schedule of Available Benefits
- E. Schedule of Benefit Fund Ratios
- F. Schedule of Funds that Do Not Use the Comptroller's List of Prequalified CPAs

APPENDICES:

- A. Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directive #12
- B. Commonly Found Unacceptable Practices of Welfare Funds
- C. Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds Issued in Fiscal Years 1985–2015
- D. Funds Using Common Professional Service Providers

THE CITY OF NEW YORK OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER SPECIAL REPORTS

Analysis of the Financial and Operating Practices of Union-Administered Benefit Funds with Fiscal Years Ending in Calendar Year 2012

SR15-089S

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report provides a comparative analysis of the overall financial activities of 90 union-administered active and retiree welfare funds and annuity funds that received approximately \$1.1 billion in City contributions for 2012. It is prepared annually based on independently audited financial reports and other information filed by the funds in accordance with New York City Comptroller's Directive #12. The report aggregates reported information and compares funds of similar type and size of City contribution in order to compare and evaluate the amounts that are spent on administration, operating surplus/deficits, benefits provided, and year-end reserves.¹

Findings and Conclusion

In 2012, \$94.1 million (8.76 percent) of total revenue for all welfare and annuity funds was spent on administration as compared to \$97.2 million (7.26 percent) spent on administration in 2011. Of these, twenty-five welfare funds spent a larger percentage of their revenue on administrative expenses than other funds of a similar type and size. In addition, five welfare funds expended lower-than-average amounts for benefits and maintained high reserves, while six funds had benefit expenditures that exceeded their revenues, causing each fund to dip into their reserves. Moreover, in 2012, 20 welfare funds in our analysis incurred operating deficits totaling \$40.7 million, which reduced their available reserves. The deficits ranged from \$2,013 to approximately \$21.2 million.

¹The Comptroller's Office issued Directive #12 to ensure uniform reporting and auditing requirements for all union-administered benefit funds that receive contributions from the City. The Comptroller's Directives are used to establish policies governing internal controls, accountability, and financial reporting.

In summary, we identified the following financial issues in one or more of the funds that should be addressed by those funds:

- Expenses that exceeded revenues, resulting in operating deficits;
- Administrative expenses that exceeded the average for that category of fund; and
- Operating surpluses that resulted in higher than average reserves.

The analysis also identified other areas of concern, which include:

- Seventeen funds received qualified opinions from their independent auditors.
- Fifty-two funds did not submit their Directive #12 reports in a timely manner.
- Seventy-four funds did not use a CPA firm listed on the Comptroller's prequalified list as recommended by Directive #12.
- One fund delays benefit eligibility for new members in violation of its agreement with the City of New York.

Recommendations

As a result of our analysis, we make 11 recommendations, eight to the Trustees of funds and three to the Office of Labor Relations (OLR):

- Trustees of funds with higher than average percentages of administrative costs as compared to total revenues and/or low percentages of benefit expenses as compared with their total revenues should reduce administrative expenses and increase benefits to members.
- Trustees of funds that use the same professional service providers for similar services should consider jointly negotiating future contracts with these providers to reduce administrative expenses through economies of scale.
- Trustees of funds with low reserve levels should take steps to ensure that their funds remain solvent. To accomplish this goal, funds should seek to reduce administrative expenses. If this is not possible or does not provide sufficient funds to ensure solvency, the trustees should attempt to reduce costs associated with benefits.
- Trustees of funds that have incurred operating deficits, particularly those with low reserve levels, should ensure that anticipated benefit and administrative expenses will not exceed projected total revenue.

- Trustees of funds with higher than average reserve levels, particularly those whose funds spend less than average amounts of their revenue on benefits, should consider enhancing their members' benefits.
- Trustees of funds are required to submit to the Comptroller's Office an annual report showing the fund's condition and affairs in accordance with Directive #12 and that submission must be filed within nine months after the close of a fund's fiscal year-end. Trustees should ensure that these filings are timely made in accordance with Directive #12.
- Trustees of funds should contract with CPAs that are listed on the Comptroller's prequalified list.
- Trustees of funds that delay members' eligibility for benefits beyond their first day of employment must revise their fund's policy to comply with their union's welfare fund agreement with the City.
- OLR should use the information in this report to ensure that the trustees of the funds correct the conditions cited in qualified opinions received from their independent accountants.
- OLR should consider withholding City contributions from delinquent funds that failed to submit their Directive #12 reports to the Comptroller's Office or fail to otherwise abide by the terms of that Directive and/or their Welfare Fund Agreements with the City.
- OLR should recover the portion of City contributions from those funds that do not provide benefits to members from their first day of employment.

In 2012, the analysis identified 11 funds that had potential financial issues that should be addressed by fund management as shown in the chart on the following page.

Funds with Potential Financial Problems Identified in this Report
(Problem Areas Highlighted)

FUND	TOTAL REVENUE	OVERALL EXPENSES	SURPLUS OR OPERATING (DEFICIT)	BENEFITS EXPENSE		ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSE		FUND BALANCE			CPA OPINIONS	RISK OF INSOLVENCY* (SEE LEGEND)
				TOTAL	% OF REVENUE	TOTAL	% OF REVENUE	TOTAL	% OF REVENUE	BALANCE/ DEFICIT*		
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF**	\$36,946,024	\$49,156,935	(\$12,210,911)	\$47,305,544	128.04%	\$1,851,391	5.01%	\$19,468,260	52.69%	-159	Unqualified	ST
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM**	\$27,065,466	\$29,181,133	(\$2,115,667)	\$26,586,877	98.23%	\$2,594,256	9.59%	\$6,557,852	24.23%	-310	Unqualified	ST
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal	\$5,420,121	\$5,644,313	(\$224,192)	\$4,780,650	88.20%	\$863,663	15.93%	\$3,392,128	62.58%	-1513	Qualified***	LT
Doctors Council WF	\$1,518,058	\$1,963,968	(\$445,910)	\$1,616,498	106.48%	\$347,470	22.89%	\$4,379,735	288.51%	-982	Unqualified	N
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF**	\$1,485,816	\$1,524,799	(\$38,983)	\$1,308,114	88.04%	\$216,685	14.58%	\$1,066,746	71.80%	-2736	Unqualified	LT
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	\$1,320,553	\$1,510,397	(\$189,844)	\$1,312,323	99.38%	\$198,074	15.00%	\$1,027,092	77.78%	-541	Unqualified	LT
United Probation Officers Assoc WF	\$1,259,769	\$1,246,570	\$13,199	\$890,680	70.70%	\$355,890	28.25%	\$1,297,772	103.02%	N/A	Unqualified	N
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	\$793,686	\$747,542	\$46,144	\$492,480	62.05%	\$255,062	32.14%	\$5,498,868	692.83%	N/A	Unqualified	N
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF**	\$686,900	\$614,721	\$72,179	\$423,652	61.68%	\$191,069	27.82%	\$481,667	70.12%	N/A	Qualified***	N
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund	\$213,314	\$81,964	\$131,350	\$57,310	26.87%	\$24,654	11.56%	\$947,052	443.97%	N/A	Unqualified	N
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF**	\$93,429	\$139,837	(\$46,408)	\$107,987	115.58%	\$31,850	34.09%	\$138,602	148.35%	-299	Unqualified	ST

Legend

N - Currently Not at Risk of Insolvency
ST – Short-term Risk of Insolvency within 1 - 3 years
LT - Long-term Risk of Insolvency greater than 3 years
N/A – Not Applicable

* A ratio estimating the number of years that a fund can operate before being "in the red" if all factors remain constant. For example, number "101" would indicate the fund has approximately one year before becoming insolvent.

** These funds were also cited for Potential Financial Problems in 2011.

*** See Table XXI where the specific issue for this fund with a "Qualified" opinion is detailed.

REPORT OF ANALYSIS

Background

New York City has provided various health insurance benefits to its employees since 1947. Since 1966, the City has provided its active employees, their families, and retirees with basic health and hospitalization coverage. As a result of collective bargaining with the unions that represent City employees, the City agreed to contribute to union-administered benefit funds that provide employees with additional health and various other benefits beyond those provided by the City. In some cases, separate funds were established for the retirees. For certain workers, in addition to contributing to the union-administered welfare funds, the City contributes to annuity funds that provide lump sum payments at retirement.

Pursuant to collective bargaining agreements, the City's contributions to the union-administered benefit funds are placed in legally established trusts administered by trustees appointed by the unions or associations. City officials are not directly involved in fund administration.

The determination of the types of benefits to be provided to members, the amounts paid, deductibles, and other terms of the operations and benefits provided is left to the trustees' discretion. The benefits provided are listed in the fund agreements between the City and the unions. Some funds now provide legal assistance and educational activities in addition to health benefits. Other funds, such as the Uniformed Officers' Funds, receive additional City contributions to operate Civil Legal Representation Funds that provide various types of legal services to their members. Some funds are self-insured; other funds provide most of their benefits through insurance companies. Typical benefits provided by funds to members and their families include:

- dental benefits—including regular exams;
- optical benefits for examinations and eyeglasses;
- prescription drug reimbursement;
- life insurance; and
- supplemental health and hospitalization.

Fund managers have a fiduciary responsibility to provide optimum benefits to members while keeping administrative costs to a minimum. A fund that accumulates excessive reserves or expends large amounts for administrative costs does not achieve its basic goal of providing optimum benefits to members.

For 2012, the City contributed approximately \$1.14 billion to 107 union-administered active and retiree welfare funds² and annuity funds. The annual contribution to each welfare fund varied based on its union's collective bargaining agreement with the City.

² Some unions offer education, legal services, and disability benefits through separate funds. For purposes of this report, we consolidated these separate funds with their respective welfare-benefit funds.

As of the end of their 2012 fiscal years, net assets available for plan benefits for the 107 benefit funds totaled \$8.1 billion, including nearly \$2.1 billion for the 76 welfare funds and \$6.0 billion for the 31 annuity funds.

In 2012, 23 benefit funds received more than \$10 million each from the City, accounting for approximately 82 percent of the City's contributions to all 107 funds as shown in Table I.

Table I

Funds Receiving More Than \$10 Million*
in New York City Contributions in 2012

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>NYC Contribution**</u>
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF	\$288,116,502	\$280,657,380
DC 37 WF	255,805,208	225,668,519
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM	52,293,102	44,480,455
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF	44,986,871	37,763,025
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	36,643,137	36,350,976
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	36,946,024	36,298,835
Local 237 Teamsters WF	34,510,087	31,093,374
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM	27,065,466	26,839,131
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) WF/RWF/CLRF	20,366,478	19,838,341
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	22,022,554	17,705,969
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF	28,734,406	17,648,297
Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF	22,151,959	17,544,789
Local 237 Teamsters RWF	19,981,940	16,882,661
Local 237 Teamsters AF	34,948,405	15,551,406
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	15,302,045	14,843,196
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF	19,027,926	14,692,532
NYS Nurses Assoc WF	14,080,986	13,145,454
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF	16,196,780	12,465,669
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF	13,200,094	12,168,749
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF	12,567,794	11,843,623
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF	12,813,339	11,162,611
Local 371 Social Service Employees AF	15,132,480	11,087,033
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF	11,388,135	10,284,925
Total (23 Funds)	\$1,054,281,718	\$936,016,950
Total (all 107 Funds)		\$1,141,375,939
Percent of Total		82%

* This cutoff figure is used for descriptive purposes only and has not other.

** The difference between Total Revenue and New York City (NYC) contributions consists of revenue from interest, dividends, other employer contributions, investments, miscellaneous income, and losses on investments.

ADM = Administration Fund Legal = Legal Services Fund
 AF = Annuity Fund RWF = Retiree Welfare Fund
 CLRF = Civil Legal Representation Fund WF = Welfare Fund
 ED = Education Fund

Table II identifies the number and types of funds that received contributions from the City in 2012 by size:

Table II
Number and Categories of
Benefit Plans in 2012 Survey

<u>NYC Contributions</u> <u>Revenue Category</u>	<u>Active and</u> <u>Retiree</u>	<u>Annuity</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Total NYC</u> <u>Contributions</u>
Up to \$1 million	16	7	23	\$9,081,948
\$1 million to \$3 million	18	3	21	34,795,306
\$3 million to \$10 million	11	12	23	134,714,739
\$10 million to \$20 million	11	4	15	216,865,255
More than \$20 million	8	0	8	719,151,695
Funds in Survey	64	26	90	\$1,114,608,943
Funds excluded from analysis because they would have distorted the results ³	<u>12</u>	<u>5</u>	<u>17</u>	<u>\$26,766,996</u>
Total All Funds	<u>76</u>	<u>31</u>	<u>107</u>	<u>\$1,141,375,939</u>

City Oversight of Benefit Funds

Although City officials are not directly involved in fund administration, the benefit fund agreements with OLR require all union-administered benefit funds that receive City contributions to comply with Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directive #12. First published in 1977, Comptroller's Directive #12 provides uniform reporting and auditing requirements for all benefit funds. In 1997, it was revised to include provisions that modified fund reporting requirements, required assessments of consultant services, modified the criteria for contracting services through competitive bids, and expanded the requirements for hiring independent certified public accountants to audit the funds. (Appendix A contains the revised Directive #12 in use during Fiscal Year 2012.)

The benefit fund agreements, along with Directive #12 reporting requirements, help the City, the funds and their members monitor the funds' financial and operating activities. Towards that end, the follow requirements are imposed:

- The fund trustees are required to keep accurate records in conformance with generally accepted accounting principles (GAAP). The funds are audited annually by a certified public accountant (CPA) selected by the trustees. Comptroller's Directive #12 strongly recommends that funds select independent certified public accountants through a competitive proposal process and that funds contract only with firms listed on the

³ See page 4 of Exhibit B at the end of this report for a complete list of the 17 funds and the reason each fund was excluded from this analysis.

Comptroller's prequalified list of CPAs. The CPA audit report must be submitted by the fund to the Comptroller's Office. Funds are also subject to further audit by the Comptroller's Office.

- Nine months after the close of its fiscal year, each fund's trustees must file a report with the Comptroller's Office showing the fund's "condition and affairs" during its fiscal year.⁴ The report must contain information as prescribed in Comptroller's Directive #12. In addition, an annual membership report must be mailed to all fund members that summarizes the financial condition of the fund.

In addition to providing a uniform reporting mechanism, Directive #12 requires that the funds' CPAs prepare management letters commenting upon weaknesses in internal and management controls that were identified during their audits. These management letters are submitted to the City Comptroller along with the audited financial statements. Further, Directive #12 requests comments on management matters, such as investment policies, bidding practices, staff utilization, and accounting allocations. Directive #12 also requires that every year each fund report the percentage of administrative costs to total annual revenue. Overall, this percentage is expected to be "reasonable."

Objectives

Our objective was to provide comparative data on the overall financial activities of 90 of the 107 union-administered active and retiree welfare, education, and annuity funds⁵ that received City contributions during the funds' Fiscal Year 2012.⁶

Scope of Analysis

The purpose of this report is to provide a comparative analysis of the overall financial activities of the funds and their benefits. The individual analyses also supplement the independent CPA audits by providing additional information to assess the performance of the fund trustees and administrators with reference to fund expenditures. This report is based upon Fiscal Year 2012 financial reports and other information filed by the 107 funds with the Comptroller's Office, as required by Comptroller's Directive #12.⁷ (See Exhibit A for a list of funds with their official and abbreviated names.)

We reviewed the financial information for all 107 benefit funds. However, we limited the computation of category averages and other financial analyses to 90 of the funds, which received \$1.11 (98 percent) of \$1.14 billion in total City contributions, while providing benefits to the bulk of the City's work force, during the funds' 2012 Fiscal Year. The remaining 17 funds, which received a total of \$26.8 million (2 percent) of the City's contributions in 2012, were excluded for different reasons: 9 funds received more than 90 percent of their revenue

⁴ The main component of the "condition and affairs" is the financial statements, which are audited and certified by an independent CPA firm. Most of the other documents (i.e., Administrative and Benefit Expense Schedules) include various calculations derived from information contained in the financial statements.

⁵ At the end of the report, Exhibit B has financial data for all 107 funds.

⁶ Most of the funds' fiscal years ended in either June or December 2012.

⁷ Directive #12 filings are generally received during the following calendar year because, according to Directive #12, the funds have up to nine months after the close of their fiscal years (some of which end on December 31) to submit the required data.

from sources other than the City; 3 funds included other groups that received substantial revenue from sources other than the City; one College Scholarship Fund provided benefits only to public high school students; three funds had fiscal year-ends different from their associated welfare funds; and one fund no longer received contributions from the City. (See Exhibit B for Revenues, Expenses and Fund Balances.)

This comparative analysis of fund operations for the 90 included funds identifies operational norms and deviations during Fiscal Year 2012. The analysis is based on the financial activities of benefit funds receiving contributions from the City during Calendar Year 2012. To perform these analyses, we compute 10 category averages that are used to compare each of the 90 funds to funds of similar type and size of City contribution as shown in the chart below. Our results can then be used by fund trustees and administrators to perform their own internal analyses.

Comparative Analysis: Categories of Similar Funds

CAT	FUND TYPE		CITY CONTRIBUTION	FUNDS	TOTAL
1	Active & Retiree Welfare Funds	Self – Insured Benefits	Up to \$1 million	12	
2			\$1 million to \$3 million	17	
3			\$3 million to \$10 million	11	
4			\$10 million to \$20 million	11	
5			More than \$20 million	8	
6		Insured Benefits	Up to \$3 million	5	
7	Annuity Funds		Up to \$1 million	7	
8			\$1 million to \$3 million	3	
9			\$3 million to \$10 million	12	
10			More than \$10 million	4	
TOTAL					90

This report's tables, exhibits, and appendices can be a starting point for fund trustees and administrators to identify areas for cost reduction or other appropriate action to ensure financial solvency. No conclusions should be drawn from any single exhibit in this report. For example, even though an exhibit might show that a particular fund's benefit expenses exceeded its revenues, it might not be a problem if the fund has sufficient or high reserves. On the other hand, funds incurring high administrative costs relative to other funds of a similar size should review their costs carefully and reduce them whenever possible.

Our examination was performed in accordance with the City Comptroller's responsibilities under Chapter 5, §93, of the New York City Charter, and under the provisions of agreements between the City and the individual unions.

FUND EXPENSES

For purposes of this report, benefit expenses include costs directly associated with providing benefits to members, such as salaries or other payments to professionals who provide direct services to members, such as attorneys who provide legal services to members, instructors who conduct in-house training for members, and physicians who examine members for worker's disability purposes. Administrative expenses include salaries for fund employees, insurance company retention fees,⁸ overhead costs involved in doing business (e.g., costs associated with processing claims), rent for office space and office expenses, professional fees paid for legal, accounting, and consultant services, and expenditures for travel and conferences. (See Exhibit C for a breakdown of Administrative Expenses.)

In 2012, more than \$94.1 million (8.76 percent) of total revenue was spent on administering the 90 funds as compared to \$97.2 million (7.26 percent) for 91 funds in 2011. The largest single component—salaries for administrative and clerical staff totaling \$42.6 million—represented 45.3 percent of total administrative expenses in 2012. Other major administrative expenses included \$15.5 million for consultant services, \$12.8 million for office-related expenses, \$7.7 million for rent, \$6.7 million for investment and custodial services, \$4.3 million for legal, accounting, and auditing services, and \$1.1 million for insurance retention charges.

For comparison purposes, we categorized the funds into the following three groups:

- Self-insured active and retiree welfare funds;
- Insured active and retiree welfare funds (we classified a fund as insured if at least 80 percent of its benefits was provided by insurance companies rather than directly by the fund); and
- Annuity funds.

Current funds' agreements do not specify what portion of the funds' total revenue may be reasonably spent on administrative expenses. In the absence of such guidelines, we calculated the average for each fund category (based on funds of similar size) to enable us to identify those funds whose administrative expenses deviated significantly from these averages. Table III indicates, by fund category, the average amount and percentages of total revenue expended by the 90 funds on administrative costs and the range of such percentages in 2012.

⁸ In health insurance, the retention fee is the fraction of the premium amount which goes toward administrative costs.

Table III

Average Amount, Percentage of Total Revenue and Percentage Range
Spent on Administration* by Fund Category

Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Funds</u>	<u>Average Amount</u>	<u>Percent</u>	<u>Percentage Range</u>
Up to \$1 million	12	\$97,418	19.02%	9.62 to 34.09%
\$1 million to \$3 million	17	219,388	13.28	6.19 to 28.25
\$3 million to \$10 million	11	660,369	8.66	5.19 to 15.93
\$10 million to \$20 million	11	941,277	5.74	3.11 to 10.06
More than \$20 million	8	7,653,796	8.32	5.01 to 11.16
Overall Average 2012	59	\$1,419,442	11.00%	
Overall Average 2011	61	\$1,418,075	8.10%	

Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Funds</u>	<u>Average Amount</u>	<u>Percent</u>	<u>Percentage Range</u>
Up to \$3 million	5	\$72,551	10.62%	2.72 to 18.03%
Overall Average 2012	5	\$72,551	10.62%	
Overall Average 2011	5	\$72,585	10.82%	

Annuity Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Funds</u>	<u>Average Amount</u>	<u>Percent</u>	<u>Percentage Range</u>
Up to \$1 million	7	\$96,519	7.90%	0 to 14.40%
\$1 million to \$3 million	3	229,298	6.06	4.47 to 7.02
\$3 million to \$10 million	12	435,046	4.01	0.88 to 9.18
\$10 million to \$20 million	4	856,909	4.02	1.99 to 5.97
Overall Average 2012	26	\$385,066	5.50%	
Overall Average 2011	25	\$411,571	3.86%	

* Our analysis of the administrative expenses as reported on the financial statements is uniformly evaluated for the purpose of our report. At times, we may be required to reclassify specific expenses (i.e., insurance retention) to ensure that all funds are evaluated uniformly.

Welfare Funds: Administrative Expenses

Welfare funds provide benefits on a self-insured or insured basis. Whether a fund is self-insured or insured significantly affects the level of its reported administrative expenses. Self-insured funds categorize claims processing costs as administrative expenses, while insured funds include most claims processing costs as part of their insurance premiums and thus categorize them as benefit expenses. Therefore, reported administrative expenses of self-insured funds are generally higher than those of insured funds. To make comparisons between self-insured and insured funds more meaningful, we transferred insurance company retention charges to administrative costs whenever possible. Table IV lists selected self-insured and insured welfare funds that spent at least 30 percent higher-than-average percentage of their revenue on administrative expenses in 2012.

Table IV

Active and Retiree Welfare Funds with
High Administrative Expense-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
<u>Self-Insured: Up to \$1 million</u>			
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	19.02%	34.09%	79.24%
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF*	19.02	32.14	68.97
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF	19.02	27.82	46.25
<u>Self-Insured: \$1 million to \$3 million</u>			
United Probation Officers Assoc WF*	13.28	28.25	112.76
Doctors Council WF*	13.28	22.89	72.39
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	13.28	20.17	51.88
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF*	13.28	19.21	44.71
<u>Self-Insured: \$3 million to \$10 million</u>			
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal*	8.66	15.93	83.99
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED*	8.66	11.33	30.85
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF*	8.66	11.28	30.26
<u>Self-Insured: \$10 million to \$20 million</u>			
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF*	5.74	10.06	75.34
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF*	5.74	9.31	62.29
Local 237 Teamsters RWF*	5.74	8.64	50.53
<u>Self-Insured: More than \$20 million</u>			
Local 237 Teamsters WF*	8.32	11.16	34.17
<u>Insured: Up to \$1 million</u>			
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF	10.62	18.03	69.71
Local 333 United Marine Division WF*	10.62	15.61	46.98

* These funds also incurred higher-than-average administrative costs in 2011.

Table V lists selected self-insured and insured welfare funds that spent at least 30 percent lower-than-average percentage of their revenue on administrative expenses in 2012.

Table V

Active and Retiree Welfare Funds with
Low Administrative Expense-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
<u>Self-Insured: Up to \$1 million</u>			
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF	19.02%	9.62%	(49.39%)
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF	19.02	11.29	(40.61)
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund *	19.02	11.56	(39.23)
<u>Self-Insured: \$1 million to \$3 million</u>			
Correction Captains Assoc RWF*	13.28	6.19	(53.41)
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF*	13.28	6.36	(52.08)
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF*	13.28	8.41	(51.72)
Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF	13.28	8.59	(35.30)
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF	13.28	8.64	(34.97)
<u>Self-Insured: \$3 million to \$10 million</u>			
NYC RWF	8.66	5.19	(40.10)
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF	8.66	5.28	(39.01)
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF*	8.66	5.43	(37.25)
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF*	8.66	5.66	(34.62)
<u>Self-Insured: \$10 million to \$20 million</u>			
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF*	5.74	3.11	(45.77)
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF*	5.74	3.62	(36.96)
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF*	5.74	3.63	(36.71)
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF*	5.74	3.67	(36.08)
<u>Self-Insured: More than \$20 million</u>			
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF*	8.32	5.01	(39.74)
<u>Insured: Up to \$1 million</u>			
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	10.62	2.72	(74.36)

* These funds also incurred lower-than-average administrative costs in 2011.

Without full audits of the individual welfare funds, it is not possible to determine why these funds incurred higher-than-average or lower-than-average administrative costs compared to their category averages.

Annuity Funds: Administrative Expenses

In addition to contributing to the active and retiree welfare funds, the City contributes to annuity funds for uniformed employees and other specific workers on active duty. These funds pay out annuities upon a covered employee's termination from City service. The amounts of the lump sum distributions are based on the value of the covered employees' accounts and can include City contributions plus interest and dividends, investment appreciation (depreciation), or other income.

Annuity funds differ from active and retiree welfare funds in that they derive a significant portion of their total revenue from investment income and generally provide only one type of benefit. The percentage of revenue that annuity funds spend on benefits and administration is not comparable to the percentages spent by active and retiree welfare funds. Therefore, we computed category averages for the 26 annuity funds covered in this report separately from those calculated for active and retiree welfare funds. Table VI highlights six annuity funds that spent at least 30 percent higher-than-average percentage of their revenue on administrative expenses in 2012.

Table VI

Annuity Funds with High Administrative
Expense-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
<u>Up to \$3 million</u>			
Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF*	7.90%	14.40%	83.23%
Local 300 Civil Service Forum AF	6.06	7.02	15.80
<u>\$3 million to \$10 million</u>			
DC 37 AFSCME AF*	4.01	9.18	128.95
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF	4.01	9.08	126.60
Detectives Endowment Assoc AF*	4.01	5.37	34.08
<u>\$10 million to \$20 million</u>			
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF	4.02	5.97	48.65

* This fund also incurred higher-than-average administrative costs in 2011.

Without full audits of the individual annuity funds, it is not possible to determine why these funds' administrative costs exceeded their category averages.

Reducing administrative expenses would increase the members' equity and result in larger annuity payments to members.

High Percentage Increases and Decreases in Revenue Spent on Administration

There may be many reasons why administrative expenses change significantly from one year to the next. For example, funds may contract with providers (e.g., accountants, attorneys, and consultants) in one year and not another, or trustees may change the basis of expense allocations between the union and the fund. However, without full audits of the individual funds, it is not possible to determine whether changes in administrative expenses reflect improvements or deteriorations for the funds, or neither. Table VII shows select funds that have increased the percentage of their revenues spent on administration by at least 30 percent from 2011 to 2012. Table VIII shows select funds that reduced the percentage of their revenues spent on administration by at least 30 percent from 2011 to 2012.

Table VII

High Percentage Increase of Revenue Spent on Administration

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Administrative Expense Percent of Total Revenue</u>		<u>Percentage Increase</u>
	<u>2011</u>	<u>2012</u>	
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF	1.57%	9.08%	478.54%
Superior Officers Council (Police) AF	0.64	2.68	318.49
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	5.47	19.99	265.53
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF	1.68	5.97	255.61
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc AF*	1.52	2.64	73.46
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	12.63	20.17	59.67
Local 371 Social Service Employees AF	2.50	3.69	47.44
United Probation Officers Assoc WF*	19.36	28.25	45.92

* These funds also incurred high percentage increases in administrative expense-to-revenue percentages in 2011.

Table VIII**High Percentage Decrease of
Revenue Spent on Administration**

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Administrative Expense Percent of Total Revenue</u>		<u>Percentage Decrease</u>
	<u>2011</u>	<u>2012</u>	
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens AF	144.88%	8.64%	(94.04%)
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF	12.66	2.13	(83.17)
Correction Captains Assoc AF	36.96	8.72	(76.40)
Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers AF	3.40	0.88	(74.24)
Detectives Endowment Assoc AF	20.17	5.37	(73.35)
Local 246 SEIU NYC AF	14.38	4.47	(68.93)
Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF	8.06	2.71	(66.41)
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM*	17.69	9.38	(46.98)
Local 237 Teamsters AF	8.14	4.43	(45.57)
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	58.53	32.14	(45.09)
Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF	24.92	14.40	(42.21)
Local 891(IUOE) AF	11.25	6.69	(40.51)

Administrative Expenses Versus Total Expenses

Administrative expenses are directly related to benefit expenses and volume since an increased number of claims processed could result in a need for require increased staffing, greater personnel costs and increased need for supplies and ancillary costs. Table IX illustrates the category average percentages of administrative expenses to total revenue and to total expenses.

Table IX

Administrative Expenses as a Percentage of Total Revenue and Total Expenses

Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Number of Funds</u>	<u>Percentage of Revenue</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
Up to \$1 million	12	19.02%	20.55%
\$1 million to \$3 million	17	13.28	13.81
\$3 million to \$10 million	11	8.66	9.43
\$10 million to \$20 million	11	5.74	6.79
More than \$20 million	8	8.32	7.96
Overall Average 2012	59	11.00%	11.71%
Overall Average 2011	61	8.10%	8.05%

Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Number of Funds</u>	<u>Percentage of Revenue</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
Up to \$3 million	5	10.62%	11.50%
Overall Average 2012	5	10.62%	11.50%
Overall Average 2011	5	8.11%	9.77%

Annuity Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Number of Funds</u>	<u>Percentage of Revenue</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
Up to \$1 million	7	7.90%	9.93%
\$1 million to \$3 million	3	6.06	20.50
\$3 million to \$10 million	12	4.01	9.43
\$10 million to \$20 million	4	4.02	10.17
Overall Average 2012	26	5.50%	12.51%
Overall Average 2011	25	3.86%	9.00%

EXPENDITURES FOR BENEFITS

The City has not established guidelines for welfare funds regarding the percentage of annual revenue that should be spent on benefits. In the absence of such guidelines, we calculated category averages for the funds listed below in Table X to illustrate by category the average amount and percentages of total revenue expended by funds on benefits. Wherever funds insured some or all of their benefits, we reduced the total premiums by the retention charges and other overhead costs involved in doing business (e.g., costs associated with processing claims) to calculate net benefit expenses.

Table X

Percentage of Total Revenue
Spent on Benefits by Fund Category

Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Percentage of Revenue</u>
Up to \$1 million	75.34%
\$1 million to \$3 million	81.44
\$3 million to \$10 million	83.56
\$10 million to \$20 million	79.44
More than \$20 million	96.62
Overall Average 2012	83.28%
Overall Average 2011	92.48%

Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Percentage of Revenue</u>
Up to \$3 million	84.81%
Overall Average 2012	84.81%
Overall Average 2011	99.88%

Although these percentages do not indicate the quality of benefits provided, they do provide a benchmark for comparison and further study. (Exhibit D at the end of this report indicates the amounts expended and the types of benefits provided by the funds.)

Some funds spent more for benefits than the average for funds within their size category and others spent less. Table XI lists selected funds whose benefit expenses exceeded the averages in their respective category averages. However, when a fund's expenses exceed the category average, it does not necessarily represent a problem. For example, Doctors Council WF exceeded the category average, but still had sufficient reserves to ensure its continued financial solvency.

By contrast, Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF spent more on benefits than was the average for other funds in its size category and at the same time, had a large operating deficit and declining reserves (down 51.1 percent over a two-year period). Fund officials need to examine the relationship of benefit expenditures to total revenues to ensure the fund achieves a proper balance. (See Table XVII for more details.)

Table XI

Self-Insured and Insured
Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
with High Benefit-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Benefits as a Percentage of Total Revenue</u>		
	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation from Category Average</u>
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	75.34%	115.58%	53.41%
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF*	96.62	128.04	32.52
Doctors Council WF*	81.44	106.48	30.75
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF*	81.44	105.44	29.47
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF	83.56	105.46	26.21
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	81.44	99.38	22.02

* These funds also incurred higher-than-average benefit costs in 2011.

In contrast, Table XII lists selected funds whose benefit expenses were below their respective category averages. This indicates that the funds should consider enhancing their members' benefits, especially if their fund reserves are large. For example, in 2012, Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF paid out 28.5 percent less in benefits than was the average for the other funds in its size category, while its reserves approached \$4.4 million, amounting to nearly five times its benefit expense.

Table XII

Self-Insured and Insured
Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
with Low Benefit-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Benefits as a Percentage of Total Revenue</u>		
	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation from Category Average</u>
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund*	75.34%	26.87%	(64.34%)
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	79.44	50.54	(36.39)
NYC RWF*	83.56	56.88	(31.93)
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF*	81.44	58.27	(28.45)
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF	84.81	66.74	(21.30)
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED*	83.56	65.98	(21.04)
Local 3 IBEW City Electricians WF	81.44	64.50	(20.80)

* These funds also incurred lower-than-average benefit costs in 2011.

The benefit expenses for the six funds listed in Table XIII exceeded total revenue, causing the funds to dip into their reserves. The use of reserves for benefits may indicate that the benefits provided were not evaluated in relation to the resources available to the funds.

Table XIII

Self-Insured and Insured
Active and Retiree Welfare Funds with
Benefit Expenses that Exceeded Their Revenue

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>Benefit Expense</u>	<u>Percentage of Revenue Spent on Benefits</u>	<u>2011-2012 Percentage Decrease in Reserves</u>	<u>Ending Fund Balance 2012</u>
<u>Self-Insured: Up to \$1 million</u>					
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	\$93,429	\$107,987	115.58%	23.62%	\$138,602
<u>Self-Insured: \$1 million to \$3 million</u>					
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF*	1,193,453	1,258,414	105.44	3.63	4,033,404
Doctors Council WF*	1,518,058	1,616,498	106.48	9.24	4,379,735
<u>Self-Insured: \$3 million to \$10 million</u>					
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF*	4,448,611	4,691,365	105.46	4.34	10,690,214
<u>Self-Insured: More Than \$20 million</u>					
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	36,946,024	47,305,544	128.04	39.08	19,468,260
DC 37 WF	255,805,208	257,276,499	100.58	9.61	198,903,127

* These funds also had high reserves (fund balances) in relation to annual revenue (see Table XVI), so the benefit spending in excess of revenue is not a major concern.

Fund trustees should carefully examine the relationship of benefit expenditures to revenues. If a fund overspends on benefits, it may use up necessary reserves. If a fund underspends on benefits, it may provide insufficient benefits for its members while building unnecessary reserves. The funds should achieve a proper balance.

RESERVE LEVELS

Reserves held by the self-insured and insured active and retiree welfare funds provide a cushion if claims for benefits exceed revenues in any particular year. Reserves accumulate when fund revenues exceed fund expenses. (See Exhibit B.) These amounts are separate and distinct from any amounts held by insurance carriers. Table XIV shows the reserve averages for each fund category.

Table XIV

Average Amount of Reserves
and Percentage of Reserves to
Annual Revenue by Category

Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Number of Funds</u>	<u>Average Amount</u>	<u>Percent of Total Revenue</u>
Up to \$1 million	12	\$1,517,747	359.01%
\$1 million to \$3 million	17	3,946,676	221.61
\$3 million to \$10 million	11	13,735,778	186.03
\$10 million to \$20 million	11	23,583,005	137.39
More than \$20 million	8	77,287,754	80.46
<hr/>			
Overall Average 2012	59	\$24,014,192	196.90%
Overall Average 2011	61	\$18,109,117	103.40%

Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds:

<u>NYC Contributions Revenue Category</u>	<u>Number of Funds</u>	<u>Average Amount</u>	<u>Percent of Total Revenue</u>
Up to \$3 million	5	\$793,558	109.12%
<hr/>			
Overall Average 2012	5	\$793,558	109.12%
Overall Average 2011	5	\$773,228	115.23%

For insured active and retiree welfare funds: using 100 percent of total annual revenue as a reasonable level for reserves, we identified three funds that had reserves in excess of this amount in 2012, which are listed in Table XV. All three funds also had reserves of more than 100 percent to total revenue in 2011.

Table XV

Insured Active and Retiree
Welfare Funds Reserves in Excess
of 100 Percent of Revenue

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Fund Reserves</u>	<u>Percentage of Reserves to Total Revenue</u>
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC RWF	\$79,598	148.42%
LOCAL 30A-C OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS WF/RWF	2,940,574	122.48
FIRE ALARM DISPATCHERS BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF	432,463	121.58

For self-insured active and retiree welfare funds: using 200 percent of total annual revenue as a reasonable level for reserves, we identified 23 funds that had reserves in excess of this amount, which are listed in Table XVI.

Table XVI

Self-Insured Active and Retiree
Welfare Funds Reserves in Excess
of 200 Percent of Revenue

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Fund Reserves</u>	<u>Percentage of Reserves to Total Revenue</u>
Local 14 –14B IUOE WF/RWF*	\$1,138,003	816.33%
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF *	5,498,868	692.83
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF*	1,578,378	585.44
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund*	947,052	443.97
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF*	797,269	442.62
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF*	8,058,278	405.12
1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF*	6,850,281	375.47
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF*	7,710,015	361.45
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF*	15,163,917	359.86
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF*	4,033,404	337.96
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED*	35,694,252	307.84
Doctors Council WF*	4,379,735	288.51
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF*	4,420,742	271.22
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF*	4,677,544	265.90
Doctors Council RWF*	2,596,312	255.91
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF*	785,373	244.76
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF*	10,690,214	240.30
Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF*	2,888,632	238.28
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF*	38,275,397	236.31
NYC RWF	16,989,459	227.93
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	852,722	222.04
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF*	1,678,722	208.73
Detectives Endowment Assoc WF*	19,899,497	207.65

* These funds also had reserves of more than 200 percent to total revenue in 2011.

OPERATING DEFICITS

In 2012, 20 of the 64 (31 percent) active and retiree welfare funds in our analysis incurred operating deficits totaling \$40.7 million, as shown in Table XVII. The deficits ranged from \$2,013 to approximately \$21.2 million. One fund, the Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF continued to deplete its reserves this year by 39.1 percent as of June 30, 2012, a decline of 51.1 percent from its 2010 reserves of \$39,775,940.

Table XVII

Funds with Operating Deficits and Declining Reserves

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>2012 Operating Deficit</u>	<u>2012 Reserves</u>	<u>2011 Reserves</u>	<u>2011-2012 Percentage Decrease in Reserves</u>
DC 37 WF*	\$21,159,709	\$198,903,127	\$220,045,229	(9.61%)
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF*	12,210,911	19,468,260	31,956,833	(39.08)
Local 237 Teamsters WF*	2,239,075	46,940,190	50,483,972	(7.02)
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM*	2,115,667	6,557,852	8,775,046	(25.27)
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF	681,141	17,668,523	18,349,664	(3.71)
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF*	484,530	10,690,214	11,174,744	(4.34)
Doctors Council WF*	445,910	4,379,735	4,825,645	(9.24)
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal**	224,192	3,392,128	2,355,940	43.98
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF*	209,970	12,053,238	12,411,008	(2.88)
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	189,844	1,027,092	1,155,120	(11.08)
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	188,480	2,185,185	2,345,314	(6.83)
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	172,390	43,077,007	43,249,397	(0.40)
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF*	168,016	4,033,404	4,185,546	(3.63)
Doctors Council RWF*	50,344	2,596,312	2,646,656	(1.90)
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF*	46,408	138,602	181,466	(23.62)
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF*	38,983	1,066,746	1,150,158	(7.25)
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	37,295	1,719,996	1,774,700	(3.08)
1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF	12,971	6,850,281	6,863,252	(0.19)
Local 14 -14B IUOE WF/RWF	3,120	1,138,003	1,141,123	(0.27)
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF	2,013	79,598	81,611	(2.47)
Total	\$40,680,969	\$383,965,493	\$425,152,424	(9.69%)

* These funds were also identified as incurring operating deficits and declining reserves in 2011.

** Despite an operating deficit, this fund increased its reserves due to a transfer of the reserves from CWA Local 1183 Health & Welfare Fund when the funds merged (effective October 1, 2011).

We identified welfare funds that are either insolvent or have significantly low levels of reserves in relation to their total revenue and expenses. In identifying these funds, we considered the funds' year-end cash reserves, their 2012 years' operating results, and the ratios of their reserves to the funds' total annual revenue and total expenses. Table XVIII identifies funds that may have current or future solvency problems.

Table XVIII

Funds with Low Reserve Levels

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>2012 Reserves</u>	<u>Excess of Revenue Over Expenses*</u>	<u>Percentage of Reserves to Total Revenue</u>	<u>Percentage of Reserves to Total Expenses</u>
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF**	\$75,168	\$3,012	51.24%	52.31%
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	138,602	(46,408)	148.35	99.12
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF**	481,667	72,179	70.12	78.36
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	1,027,092	(189,844)	77.78	68.00
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF**	1,066,746	(38,983)	71.80	69.96
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF	1,173,543	48,885	94.16	98.00
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal**	3,392,128	(224,192)	62.58	60.10
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM**	6,557,852	(2,115,667)	24.23	22.47
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF	7,178,141	829,633	64.12	69.25
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF	8,850,723	1,053,215	67.05	72.86
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF	12,053,238	(209,970)	105.84	103.92
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	13,295,070	813,940	86.88	91.77
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF**	19,468,260	(12,210,911)	52.69	39.60
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM	36,386,553	2,204,451	69.58	72.64
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF	38,994,710	20,413	86.68	86.72
DC 37 WF**	198,903,127	(21,159,709)	77.76	71.82
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF**	227,974,334	539,128	79.13	79.27

* Negative \$ amount indicates funds whose expenses exceeded revenue in 2012.

** Indicates funds whose expenses exceeded revenue in 2011.

High reserve levels may indicate that funds do not spend enough of their total annual revenue on benefits. Low reserve levels may point to excessive amounts of revenue spent on benefits and administrative expenses.

ANALYSIS OF TOTAL REVENUE

In 2012, the 64 welfare funds in our survey had revenue totaling \$1.084 billion. Expenses for these funds totaled \$1.079 billion — \$84.1 million for fund administration and \$994.7 million for benefits to members. The \$5.5 million surplus (revenues over expenses) increased the funds' reserves.

In previous sections, we analyzed the funds' usage of their total revenues. Table XIX identifies funds that, compared to averages for their size categories, have high administrative costs and/or low benefit costs.

Table XIX

Self-Insured and Insured, Active and Retiree Welfare Funds with
High Administration Expenses and/or Low Benefit Expenses
as a Percentage of Total Revenue

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>Percentage of Administrative Expenses to Total Revenue</u>		<u>Percentage of Benefit Expenses to Total Revenue</u>	
		<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund</u>	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund</u>
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM	\$27,065,466	9.84%	21.75%	96.62%	86.07%
Local 237 Teamsters RWF	19,981,940	5.74	8.64	79.44	75.32
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	16,196,780	5.74	3.62	79.44	50.54
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF	12,813,339	5.74	10.06	79.44	72.18
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED	11,595,210	8.66	11.33	83.56	65.98
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF	11,388,135	5.74	9.31	79.44	92.53
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF	10,849,193	8.66	11.28	83.56	95.00
New York City Retirees WF	7,453,903	8.66	5.19	83.56	56.88
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal*	5,420,121	8.66	15.93	83.56	88.20
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF	1,989,105	13.28	9.78	81.44	64.50
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF*	1,629,926	13.28	10.70	81.44	58.27
Doctors Council WF*	1,518,058	13.28	22.89	81.44	106.48
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	1,377,737	13.28	20.17	81.44	93.51
United Probation Officers Assoc WF	1,259,769	13.28	28.25	81.44	70.70
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF*	1,246,330	13.28	19.21	81.44	76.86
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF*	793,686	19.02	32.14	75.34	62.05
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF	686,900	19.02	27.82	75.34	61.68
Local 333 United Marine Division WF*	431,760	10.62	15.61	84.81	77.91
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF*	355,711	10.62	18.03	84.81	66.74
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund*	213,314	19.02	11.56	75.34	26.87
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	93,429	19.02	34.09	75.34	115.58

Boldface - fund had high administrative expenses and/or low benefit expenses in 2012.

* This fund also had high administrative expenses and/or low benefit expenses in 2011.

The basic objective of a welfare fund is to provide benefits to their members while keeping administrative costs to a minimum. This can be better achieved by keeping administrative costs to a minimum. Funds that accumulate excessive reserves or expend large amounts for administration at the expense of members' benefits do not achieve their basic objective. Therefore, the trustees of these funds should evaluate how they expend total revenue and best ensure that the objective of the welfare fund is met.

Funds Should Address Financial and Operating Issues to Ensure Maximum Use of Revenue and Continued Financial Solvency

In summary, we identified financial issues that, in our opinion, should be addressed by the fund management. Specifically, these include:

- Expenses that exceeded revenues, resulting in operating deficits. Operating deficits could deplete fund reserves, which could ultimately lead to insolvency.
- Administrative expenses that exceeded the averages for other funds in the same size category. Reducing administrative expenses would provide funds to increase benefits for members.
- Operating surpluses that resulted in high reserves. Excess reserves may indicate that funds should increase members' benefits.

Fund managers have a fiduciary responsibility to their members. A fund that accumulates excessive reserves or expends large amounts for administrative costs is not achieving its basic goal of providing optimum benefits to members while achieving financial solvency. Accordingly, the trustees of the funds listed in Table XX should evaluate how fund resources could be better used.

Table XX lists 11 funds with potential financial issues in 2012 that, in our opinion, should be addressed.

Table XX

**Funds with Potential Financial Problems Identified in this Report
(Problem Areas Highlighted)**

FUND	TOTAL REVENUE	OVERALL EXPENSES	SURPLUS OR OPERATING (DEFICIT)	BENEFITS EXPENSE		ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSE		FUND BALANCE			CPA OPINIONS	RISK OF INSOLVENCY* (SEE LEGEND)
				TOTAL	% OF REVENUE	TOTAL	% OF REVENUE	TOTAL	% OF REVENUE	BALANCE/ DEFICIT*		
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF**	\$36,946,024	\$49,156,935	(\$12,210,911)	\$47,305,544	128.04%	\$1,851,391	5.01%	\$19,468,260	52.69%	-159	Unqualified	ST
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM**	\$27,065,466	\$29,181,133	(\$2,115,667)	\$26,586,877	98.23%	\$2,594,256	9.59%	\$6,557,852	24.23%	-310	Unqualified	ST
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal	\$5,420,121	\$5,644,313	(\$224,192)	\$4,780,650	88.20%	\$863,663	15.93%	\$3,392,128	62.58%	-1513	Qualified***	LT
Doctors Council WF	\$1,518,058	\$1,963,968	(\$445,910)	\$1,616,498	106.48%	\$347,470	22.89%	\$4,379,735	288.51%	-982	Unqualified	N
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF**	\$1,485,816	\$1,524,799	(\$38,983)	\$1,308,114	88.04%	\$216,685	14.58%	\$1,066,746	71.80%	-2736	Unqualified	LT
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	\$1,320,553	\$1,510,397	(\$189,844)	\$1,312,323	99.38%	\$198,074	15.00%	\$1,027,092	77.78%	-541	Unqualified	LT
United Probation Officers Assoc WF	\$1,259,769	\$1,246,570	\$13,199	\$890,680	70.70%	\$355,890	28.25%	\$1,297,772	103.02%	N/A	Unqualified	N
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	\$793,686	\$747,542	\$46,144	\$492,480	62.05%	\$255,062	32.14%	\$5,498,868	692.83%	N/A	Unqualified	N
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF**	\$686,900	\$614,721	\$72,179	\$423,652	61.68%	\$191,069	27.82%	\$481,667	70.12%	N/A	Qualified***	N
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund	\$213,314	\$81,964	\$131,350	\$57,310	26.87%	\$24,654	11.56%	\$947,052	443.97%	N/A	Unqualified	N
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF**	\$93,429	\$139,837	(\$46,408)	\$107,987	115.58%	\$31,850	34.09%	\$138,602	148.35%	-299	Unqualified	ST

Legend

N - Currently Not at Risk of Insolvency
 ST – Short-term Risk of Insolvency within 1 - 3 years
 LT - Long-term Risk of Insolvency greater than 3 years
 N/A – Not Applicable

* A ratio estimating the number of years that a fund can operate before being "in the red" if all factors remain constant. For example, number "101" would indicate the fund has approximately one year before becoming insolvent.

** These funds were also cited for Potential Financial Problems in 2011.

*** See Table XXI where the specific issue for this fund with a "Qualified" opinion is detailed.

EXCEPTIONS ON FUND OPERATIONS

In accordance with Comptroller's Directive #12, each fund must annually engage a certified public accountant (CPA) to issue an opinion on financial statements prepared by the funds, and accompanying that opinion, the CPA must issue a management letter that comments the fund's management practices and internal control systems. In 2012, some of the management letters identified internal control issues that could affect the financial statements. Based on our review of the funds' financial statements, the opinions and management letters submitted by the CPAs and the booklets distributed by the funds describing their benefits, we found that a number of funds did not comply with certain aspects of Directive #12 and their agreements with the City.

CPA Opinions

As noted, CPAs audit, certify and render opinions on the funds' financial statements. The fund agreements between the City and the unions require the preparation of each fund's financial statements on the accrual basis of accounting and in conformity with GAAP. CPAs may render one of the following opinions:

<u>Opinion</u>	<u>Description</u>
Unqualified	Financial statements present fairly, in all material respects, the financial position, results of operations, and cash flows of the entity in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles.
Qualified	Except for the effects of the matter(s) to which the qualification relates, the financial statements present fairly, in all material respects, the financial position, results of operations, and cash flows of the entity in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles.
Adverse	Financial statements do not present fairly the financial position, results of operations, or cash flows of the entity in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles.
Disclaimer	The auditor does not express an opinion on the financial statements.

Seventy-three of the 90 funds reviewed received unqualified opinions. However, 17 funds received qualified opinions from independent auditors because the funds' independent CPAs concluded that each of the 17 financial statements were not presented in accordance with GAAP. In each case this was because post-retirement and other benefit obligations must be presented on the fund's financial statements (see Table XXI).

Table XXI

**Funds that Received Qualified Opinions or Disclaimers
from their Independent Auditors**

FUND	OPINION	INDEPENDENT AUDITOR COMENTS
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Correction Captains Assoc RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
DC 37 WF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Local 891 School Custodian & Engineers WF/RWF/ED	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
NYS Court Officers Assoc RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
Surrogates & Supreme Court Reporters Assoc RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF	Qualified	Excludes postretirement benefit obligations.*

* These funds' financial statements exclude postretirement benefit obligation as required by Government Accounting Standards Board Statement No. 43, Financial Reporting for Postemployment Benefit Plans Other Than Pension Plans ("GASB No. 43")

Funds that received qualified opinions from their independent auditors should take immediate action to correct these problems.

Late Submission of Directive #12 Reports

In 2012, 52 of the 107 funds (48.6 percent) in our analysis failed to make timely submissions of their Directive #12 reports to the Comptroller's Office. Comptroller's Directive #12 requires that within nine months after the close of a fund's fiscal year, each fund's trustees must submit a report to the City Comptroller showing the fund's condition and affairs during its preceding fiscal year. Included in the fund's annual Directive #12 filing is an audited financial statement and a CPA-prepared management letter commenting upon internal and management controls that were assessed during the CPA audit. Further, Directive #12 also requires that each fund comment on management matters such as investment policies, bidding practices, staff utilization, and accounting allocations. The Directive #12 reports provide a basis for a comparative analysis of fund operations and for the identification of deviations from the norm.

Of the 52 late submissions:

- Two fund submitted its Directive #12 reports in excess of two years after its due date – 34 months after its fiscal year-end.
- Fifteen funds submitted their Directive #12 reports between one and two years after their due dates – 21 to 29 months after their fiscal year-end.
- Four funds submitted their Directive #12 reports between six months and one year after their due dates – 15 to 21 months after their fiscal year-end.
- Thirteen funds submitted their Directive #12 reports between three and six months after their due dates – 12 to 15 months after their fiscal year-end.
- Eighteen funds submitted their Directive #12 reports less than three months after their due dates.

Table XXII lists the 21 funds that submitted their Directive #12 reports in excess of six months after their due dates – 15 months after their fiscal year-end.

Table XXII

**Funds that Significantly Delayed
Submission of a Directive #12 Report**

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>2012 Fiscal Year Ended</u>	<u>Directive #12 Due 9 months After the Fund's Fiscal-Year-End</u>	<u>Date Received</u>	<u>Number of Days Past Due</u>
<u>More than 2 years late: (2 Funds)</u>				
Local 858 IBT, (OTB) Branch Office Managers WF	03/31/12	12/31/12	03/11/15	800
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF*	06/30/12	03/31/13	06/05/15	796
<u>1 year - 2 years late: (15 Funds)</u>				
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF*	05/31/12	02/28/13	01/29/15	700
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF*	03/31/12	12/31/12	11/17/14	686
Local 1 Plumbing Industry AF	12/31/12	09/30/13	06/15/15	623
Committee of Interns and Residents ED	06/30/12	03/31/13	12/09/14	618
Captains Endowment Assoc CLRF	12/31/12	09/30/13	05/29/15	606
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF*	09/30/12	06/30/13	11/17/14	596
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF*	09/30/12	06/30/13	11/17/14	505
Local 40 Iron Workers AF*	12/31/12	09/30/13	12/17/14	443
Local 40 Iron Workers WF*	12/31/12	09/30/13	12/17/14	443
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF*	12/31/12	09/30/13	11/24/14	420
NYC RWF*	12/31/12	09/30/13	11/13/14	409
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF*	12/31/12	09/30/13	11/07/14	403
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF*	12/31/12	09/30/13	11/07/14	403
Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF	12/31/12	09/30/13	11/07/14	403
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF*	12/31/12	09/30/13	11/03/14	399
<u>6 months - 1 year late: (4 Funds)</u>				
DC 37 WF	06/30/12	03/31/13	11/08/13	222
DC 37 AFSCME AF	06/30/12	03/31/13	11/08/13	222
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF*	06/30/12	03/31/13	11/01/13	215
Local 3 IBEW Electrical Workers Industry AF	09/30/12	06/30/13	01/27/14	211

* These funds also significantly delayed their Directive #12 submission in 2011.

Fund trustees and administrators have a contractual responsibility to submit their Directive #12 reports on time. The information generated as a result of a Directive #12 report provides a basis for our comparative analyses of fund operations to identify deviations from the norm. The timely release of this comparative analysis allows those funds that deviate from the norm to take corrective action and evaluate how fund resources could be better used.

CPAs Were Not Selected from Comptroller's Prequalified List

Directive #12 recommends that funds should only contract with CPA firms that are listed on the Comptroller's prequalified list. CPA firms on the prequalified list are registered with the New York State Education Department to practice in the State of New York and have had a peer review within the last three years. The peer review is performed to determine whether the firm's system of quality control for its accounting and auditing practice is designed to provide the firm with reasonable assurance of performing and reporting in conformity with applicable professional standards in all material respects and whether it is in fact followed. The peer review must be conducted in accordance with American Institute of Certified Public Accountants (AICPA) Standards and the firm must receive a rating of *pass* or *pass with deficiencies*.

By contracting with a CPA firm on the Comptroller's prequalified list, the funds will have assurance that the CPA firm has had a system peer review and received a peer review rating of *pass*. Our review found that only 33 funds (30.8 percent) of the 107 funds that submitted a Directive #12 filing in 2012 selected a CPA firm on the Comptroller's prequalified list. (See Exhibit F for a list of the 74 funds that did not use a prequalified CPA firm.)

Eligibility Delay

The intent of the standard benefit fund agreements between the City and the unions is that welfare fund benefits be available during each member's entire period of employment with the City.

Specifically, the standard fund agreements between the City and the unions state:

The Union agrees to provide from the Fund for each Covered Employee the supplementary benefits described in the schedule annexed to this Agreement marked as Appendix 'C', for the period of employment with the City of each such Covered Employee during the term of this Agreement, whether or not any payment or payments made to the Union pursuant to the formula prescribed in section 2(c) of this Agreement actually included the full sum prescribed by Appendix 'B' on account of such Employee during the twenty-eight (28) day cycle for which such payment or payments are made.

Thus, funds should make their members eligible for benefits beginning on their first day of employment with the City.

However, as has been repeatedly noted in prior years' Welfare Fund Surveys, one fund (District Council 9 Painters Industry Welfare Fund) delays eligibility for its new members for 90 days.⁹ Since 2007, OLR has advised this fund that its eligibility rules are not in compliance

⁹ Our analysis focused on the delay to new employees enrolled in welfare benefit funds (active) because the members of retiree funds and annuity funds qualify to receive benefits once they leave active service.

with the welfare fund agreement signed by the parties and that the fund must provide coverage effective on a member's first day of employment. However, in a telephone conversation with the fund's administrator on November 10, 2015, we confirmed that the fund continues to delay eligibility for its members. Consequently, members or their dependents who may need benefits during the fund waiting period cannot obtain them.

Consolidation of Professional Services

Most funds receiving City contributions enter into contracts with professionals for various types of services such as accounting-auditing and legal counsel. Many funds use the same professional service provider for similar services. One CPA firm, for example, Gould, Kobrick & Schlapp, provides accounting services for 17 different unions representing 30 separate funds. (Appendix D lists the funds using the same providers for similar professional services.)

Trustees of funds using the same providers for similar services may reduce their funds' administrative expenses by negotiating future contracts jointly.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Administrative and Benefit Expenses

There continues to be a variance in administrative costs as a percentage of total revenue for funds in each revenue category. Concurrently, some funds spend a significantly lower percentage of their revenue on benefits compared to other funds.

Recommendations

1. Trustees of funds with higher than average percentages of administrative costs as compared to total revenues and/or low percentages of benefit expenses as compared with their total revenues should reduce administrative expenses and increase benefits to members.
2. Trustees of funds that use the same professional service providers for similar services should consider jointly negotiating future contracts with these providers to reduce administrative expenses through economies of scale.

Reserves

Several funds have incurred operating deficits and maintain very low levels of reserves, which may indicate potential future solvency problems. Other funds continue to maintain extremely high levels of reserves.

Recommendations

3. Trustees of funds with low reserve levels should take steps to ensure that their funds remain solvent. To accomplish this goal, funds should seek to reduce administrative expenses. If this is not possible or does not provide sufficient funds to ensure solvency, the trustees should attempt to reduce costs associated with benefits.
4. Trustees of funds that have incurred operating deficits, particularly those with low reserve levels, should ensure that anticipated benefit and administrative expenses will not exceed projected total revenue.
5. Trustees of funds with high reserve levels, particularly those whose funds spend less than average amounts of their revenue on benefits, should consider enhancing their members' benefits.

Exceptions on Fund Operations

As in previous years, we identified various funds that do not comply with all aspects of their unions' agreements with the City and with Comptroller's Directive #12.

Recommendations

6. Trustees of funds are required to submit to the Comptroller's Office an annual report showing the fund's condition and affairs in accordance with Directive #12 and that submission must be filed within nine months after the close of a fund's fiscal year-end. Trustees should ensure that these filings are timely made in accordance with Directive #12.
7. Trustees of funds should contract with CPAs that are listed on the Comptroller's prequalified list.
8. Trustees of funds that delay members' eligibility for benefits beyond their first day of employment must revise their fund's policy to comply with their union's welfare fund agreement with the City.
9. OLR should use the information in this report to ensure that the trustees of the funds correct the conditions cited in qualified opinions received from their independent accountants.
10. OLR should consider withholding City contributions from delinquent funds that failed to submit their Directive #12 reports to the Comptroller's Office or fail to otherwise abide by the terms of that Directive and/or their Welfare Fund Agreements with the City.
11. OLR should recover the portion of City contributions from those funds that do not provide benefits to members from their first day of employment.

2012 SCHEDULE OF OFFICIAL FUND NAMES

<u>Name of Fund Used in this Report</u>	<u>Official Name of Fund</u>
1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF	1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses Welfare Fund
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens AF	Assistant Deputy Wardens/Deputy Wardens Association Annuity Fund
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF	Assistant Deputy Wardens/Deputy Wardens Association Security Benefit Fund
Civil Service Bar Assoc AF	Civil Service Bar Association Annuity Trust Fund
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF	Civil Service Bar Association Security Benefits Fund
* Committee of Interns and Residents ED	House Staff Benefits Plan of CIR - Committee of Interns and Residents Professional Education Plan (PEP)
Correction Captains Assoc AF	Correction Captains Association Annuity Fund
Correction Captains Assoc RWF	Correction Captains Association Security Benefits Fund - Retirees
Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF	Correction Captains Association Security Benefits Fund/Civil Legal Representation Fund
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc AF	Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Annuity Fund
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF	Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Security Benefits Fund – Retirees
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Security Benefits Fund – Actives
Council of Supervisors and Administrators AF	CSA Compensation Accrual Fund
DC 37 AFSCME AF	District Council 37 AFSCME Annuity Fund Plan
DC 37 WF	District Council 37 Benefits Fund Trust and Affiliated Funds
* DC 9 Painting Industry AF (Local 1969)	Painting Industry Annuity Fund
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	Painting Industry Insurance Fund and Subsidiary
Detectives Endowment Assoc AF	Detectives' Endowment Association Annuity Fund
* Detectives Endowment Assoc CLRF	Detectives' Endowment Association Civil Legal Representation Fund
Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF	Detectives' Endowment Association Health Benefits Fund – Retirees
Detectives Endowment Assoc WF	Detectives' Endowment Association Health Benefits Fund
Doctors Council AF	Doctors Council Annuity Fund
Doctors Council RWF	Doctors Council Retiree Welfare Fund
Doctors Council WF	Doctors Council Welfare Fund
* Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF	Fire Alarm Dispatchers' Benevolent Association, Inc. - Welfare Fund
House Staff Comm of Interns & Residents WF/Legal	House Staff Benefits Plan of the Committee of Interns and Residents

FUND ABBREVIATIONS:

ADM-Administrative; AF-Annuity; Assoc-Association; CLRF-Civil Legal Representation; ED-Education; Legal-Legal Benefits; RWF-Retirees Welfare; and WF-Welfare.

2012 SCHEDULE OF OFFICIAL FUND NAMES

<u>Name of Fund Used in this Report</u>	<u>Official Name of Fund</u>
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF	CSA Retiree Welfare Fund
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF	CSA Welfare Fund
* Local 1 Plumbing Industry AF	Plumbers Local Union No. 1 Additional Security Benefit Fund
Local 1180 CWA Members AF	Communications Workers of America Local 1180 Members' Annuity Fund
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM	CWA Local 1180 Security Benefit Fund/Retirees Benefits Fund/Legal Benefits Fund/Education Fund/Administrative
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF	CWA Local 1181 Security Benefits Fund
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal	CWA Local 1182 Security Benefits Fund
* Local 1199 Nat Ben Fund Hosp Health Care WF/RWF	1199 SEIU National Benefit Fund for Health and Human Service Employees
Local 14 –14B IUOE WF/RWF	International Union of Operating Engineers Local 14 –14B Welfare Fund City of NY Employees
Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF	Annuity Trust Fund For the Municipal Employees of the Operating Engineers Union Local 15, 15A, 15C
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	International Union of Operating Engineers Local Unions 15, 15A, 15C Municipal Employees Welfare Fund
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF	United Federation of Teachers Welfare Fund
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF	Allied Building Inspectors Local Union No. 211 I.U.O.E Welfare Fund
Local 237 Teamsters AF	Teamsters Local 237 Additional Security Benefit Fund
Local 237 Teamsters RWF	Teamsters Local 237 Retirees' Benefit Fund
Local 237 Teamsters WF	Teamsters Local 237 Welfare Fund
Local 246 SEIU NYC AF	New York City, Local 246, S.E.I.U. Annuity Fund
Local 246 SEIU RWF	New York City Local 246 Retiree Welfare Fund
Local 246 SEIU WF	New York City Local 246 Welfare Fund
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	City Employees Welfare Fund Local Union # 3 IBEW
Local 3 IBEW Communications Electricians AF	IBEW Local 3 NYC Communications Electricians Annuity Plan
* Local 3 IBEW Electrical Workers Industry AF	Annuity Plan of the Electrical Industry
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF	IBEW Local 3 NYC Electrical Division Health & Welfare Fund – Retired
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF	IBEW Local 3 NYC Electrical Division Health & Welfare Fund – Active
Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF/RWF	Operating Engineers Union Local 30 Municipal Employees Welfare Trust Fund
Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers AF	International Union of Operating Engineers Local 30 City Employees Annuity Fund

FUND ABBREVIATIONS:

ADM-Administrative; AF-Annuity; Assoc-Association; CLRF-Civil Legal Representation; ED-Education; Legal-Legal Benefits; RWF-Retirees Welfare; and WF-Welfare.

2012 SCHEDULE OF OFFICIAL FUND NAMES

<u>Name of Fund Used in this Report</u>	<u>Official Name of Fund</u>
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	Local 300 SEIU, AFL-CIO Civil Service Forum Retired Employees' Welfare Fund
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	Local 300 SEIU, AFL-CIO Civil Service Forum Active Employees' Welfare Fund
Local 300 Civil Service Forum AF	Service Employees International Union, Local 300 Civil Service Forum Annuity Fund
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	Local 306 Health and Welfare Fund for Municipal Workers
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF	Local 333 Insurance Fund for N.Y.C. Retirees
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	Local 333 Insurance Fund for N.Y.C. Employees
Local 371 Social Service Employees AF	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Annuity Fund
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Welfare Fund/Educational/Legal/Administrative
* Local 40 Iron Workers AF	Iron Workers Locals 40, 361 and 417 Annuity Fund
* Local 40 Iron Workers WF	Iron Workers Locals 40, 361 and 417 Health Fund
Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF	Local 444 Sanitation Officers' Compensation Accrual Fund
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF	Local 444 Sanitation Officers' Retirees Welfare Fund
Local 444 Sanitation Officers Supplemental AF	Local 444 Sanitation Officers' Supplemental Annuity Fund
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF	Local 444 Sanitation Officers' Security Benefits Fund
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF	Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association Compensation Accrual Fund
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF	Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association Retirees' Welfare Fund
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF	Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association Security Benefits Fund
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc AF	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Annuity Fund
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Retired Fire Officers Family Protection Plan
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Family Protection Plan
* Local 858 IBT, (OTB) Branch Office Managers WF	Local 858 I.B. of T. Branch Office Managers (O.T.B.) Welfare Fund
Local 891 School Custodian & Engineers WF/RWF/ED	Local 891 International Union of Operating Engineers, School Custodians and School Custodian Engineers Welfare Fund
Local 891(IUOE) AF	International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 891 Annuity Fund
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF	Compensation Accrual Fund of the Uniformed Firefighters Association and Subsidiary
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	Retired Firefighters Security Benefit Fund of the Uniformed Firefighters Association
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF	Security Benefit Fund of the Uniformed Firefighters Association
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund	Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust Fund

FUND ABBREVIATIONS:

ADM-Administrative; AF-Annuity; Assoc-Association; CLRF-Civil Legal Representation; ED-Education; Legal-Legal Benefits; RWF-Retirees Welfare; and WF-Welfare.

2012 SCHEDULE OF OFFICIAL FUND NAMES

<u>Name of Fund Used in this Report</u>	<u>Official Name of Fund</u>
* NYC DC of Carpenters AF	New York City District Council of Carpenters Annuity Fund
* NYC DC of Carpenters WF/RWF	New York City District Council of Carpenters Welfare Fund
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc AF	New York City Deputy Sheriffs Association Annuity Fund
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF	New York City Deputy Sheriffs Association Security Benefits Fund Retirees
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	New York City Deputy Sheriffs Association Security Benefits Fund
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF	New York City Municipal Steamfitters and Steamfitter Helpers Retirees Health and Welfare Fund
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF	New York City Municipal Steamfitters and Steamfitter Helpers Health and Welfare Fund
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF	New York City Municipal Plumbers and Pipefitters Health and Welfare Fund
NYC RWF	New York City Retirees Benefits Fund
* NYS Court Clerks Assoc RWF	New York State Court Clerks Association Retirees' Security Benefits Fund
* NYS Court Officers Assoc RWF	New York State Court Officers Association Security Benefit Fund
NYS Nurses Assoc WF	New York State Nurses Association Welfare Plan for New York City Employed Registered Professional Nurses
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED	Organization of Staff Analysts Welfare and Education Funds
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF	Annuity Fund of the Patrolmen's Benevolent Association of the City of New York
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF	Retiree Health and Welfare Fund of the Patrolmen's Benevolent Association of the City of New York
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	Health and Welfare Fund of the Patrolmen's Benevolent Association of the City of New York
* Pavers & Road Builders District Council WF	Pavers and Road Builders District Council AFL-CIO Welfare Fund
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	PSC - CUNY Welfare Fund
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF	Sergeants Benevolent Association of the City of New York, Inc. Annuity Fund
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) WF/RWF/CLRF	Sergeants Benevolent Association of the City of New York, Inc. Health and Welfare Fund/CLRF
Superior Officers Council (Police) AF	Superior Officers Council Annuity Trust Fund
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF	Superior Officers Council Retiree Health and Welfare Fund
Superior Officers Council (Police) WF/CLRF	Superior Officers Council Health and Welfare Fund/Civil Legal Representation Fund
* Surrogates & Supreme Court Reporters Assoc RWF	Welfare Fund of the Retirees of the Association of Surrogate's and Supreme Court Reporters within the City of New York
* UFT Albert Shanker College Scholarship Fund	Albert Shanker College Scholarship Fund of the United Federation of Teachers
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF	United Probation Officers Association Retirement Welfare Fund
United Probation Officers Assoc WF	United Probation Officers Association Welfare Fund

FUND ABBREVIATIONS:

ADM-Administrative; AF-Annuity; Assoc-Association; CLRF-Civil Legal Representation; ED-Education; Legal-Legal Benefits; RWF-Retirees Welfare; and WF-Welfare.

2012 SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA

NAME OF FUND	REF	NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS	NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE	OTHER REVENUE	TOTAL REVENUE	BENEFIT EXPENSES	ADMIN EXPENSES	TOTAL EXPENSES	EXCESS OF REVENUE OVER EXPENSES	FUND BALANCE	FUND BAL/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
SELF-INSURED WF & RWF												
NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$1 MILLION												
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF		56	\$92,625	\$804	\$93,429	\$107,987	\$31,850	\$139,837	-\$46,408	\$138,602	148%	-52.17%
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund		84	\$133,630	\$79,684	\$213,314	\$57,310	\$24,654	\$81,964	\$131,350	\$947,052	444%	43.14%
Local 14 -14B IUOE WF/RWF		37	\$135,478	\$3,926	\$139,404	\$122,540	\$19,984	\$142,524	-\$3,120	\$1,138,003	816%	597.17%
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF		87	\$159,901	\$20,222	\$180,123	\$126,145	\$20,344	\$146,489	\$33,634	\$797,269	443%	42.70%
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF		86	\$211,630	\$57,974	\$269,604	\$211,594	\$25,949	\$237,543	\$32,061	\$1,578,378	585%	88.75%
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF		59	\$320,560	\$317	\$320,877	\$230,810	\$55,611	\$286,421	\$34,456	\$785,373	245%	-21.09%
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF		48	\$383,580	\$459	\$384,039	\$290,599	\$76,786	\$367,385	\$16,654	\$852,722	222%	-28.41%
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF		38	\$494,273	\$299,413	\$793,686	\$492,480	\$255,062	\$747,542	\$46,144	\$5,498,868	693%	123.37%
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF		110	\$663,450	\$23,450	\$686,900	\$423,652	\$191,069	\$614,721	\$72,179	\$481,667	70%	-77.39%
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF		2	\$763,195	\$41,064	\$804,259	\$640,121	\$125,140	\$765,261	\$38,998	\$1,678,722	209%	-32.71%
Doctors Council RWF		21	\$784,244	\$230,302	\$1,014,546	\$888,582	\$176,308	\$1,064,890	-\$50,344	\$2,596,312	256%	-17.49%
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF		54	\$789,319	\$182,415	\$971,734	\$842,770	\$166,259	\$1,009,029	-\$37,295	\$1,719,996	177%	-42.93%
TOTAL UP TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY		12 FUNDS:	\$4,931,885	\$940,030	\$5,871,915	\$4,434,590	\$1,169,016	\$5,603,606	\$268,309	\$18,212,964	310%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 TO \$3 MILLION												
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF		85	\$1,007,295	\$186,158	\$1,193,453	\$1,258,414	\$103,055	\$1,361,469	-\$168,016	\$4,033,404	338%	85.93%
Doctors Council WF		22	\$1,089,778	\$428,280	\$1,518,058	\$1,616,498	\$347,470	\$1,963,968	-\$445,910	\$4,379,735	289%	58.73%
Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF		6/6.1	\$1,169,400	\$42,868	\$1,212,268	\$1,013,841	\$104,148	\$1,117,989	\$94,279	\$2,888,632	238%	31.09%
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF		32	\$1,171,974	\$74,356	\$1,246,330	\$957,966	\$239,479	\$1,197,445	\$48,885	\$1,173,543	94%	-69.64%
United Probation Officers Assoc WF		109	\$1,199,862	\$59,907	\$1,259,769	\$1,246,570	\$890,680	\$355,890	\$1,246,570	\$13,199	103%	-43.32%
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF		55	\$1,275,362	\$45,191	\$1,320,553	\$1,312,323	\$198,074	\$1,510,397	-\$189,844	\$1,027,092	78%	-57.21%
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)		20	\$1,352,791	\$24,946	\$1,377,737	\$1,288,378	\$277,839	\$1,566,217	-\$188,480	\$2,185,185	159%	-12.74%
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF		50	\$1,426,524	\$203,402	\$1,629,926	\$949,715	\$174,375	\$1,124,090	\$505,836	\$4,420,742	271%	49.22%
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF		3	\$1,455,089	\$30,727	\$1,485,816	\$1,308,114	\$216,685	\$1,524,799	-\$38,983	\$1,066,746	72%	-60.50%
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF		65	\$1,609,258	\$149,885	\$1,759,143	\$1,431,950	\$111,927	\$1,543,877	\$215,266	\$4,677,544	266%	46.29%
1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF		68	\$1,615,420	\$209,030	\$1,824,450	\$1,588,206	\$249,215	\$1,837,421	-\$12,971	\$6,850,281	375%	106.57%
Local 246 SEIU RWF		46	\$1,621,777	\$244,657	\$1,866,434	\$1,370,024	\$189,386	\$1,559,410	\$307,024	\$3,679,289	197%	8.45%
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF		51	\$1,623,877	\$365,228	\$1,989,105	\$1,282,927	\$194,605	\$1,477,532	\$511,573	\$8,058,278	405%	122.88%
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF		42	\$1,673,828	\$459,244	\$2,133,072	\$1,416,381	\$136,736	\$1,553,117	\$579,955	\$7,710,015	361%	98.86%
Local 246 SEIU WF		47	\$2,196,550	\$271,959	\$2,468,509	\$1,962,135	\$258,712	\$2,220,847	\$247,662	\$4,589,247	186%	2.28%
Correction Captains Assoc RWF		5	\$2,449,075	\$117,039	\$2,566,114	\$2,034,739	\$158,736	\$2,193,475	\$372,639	\$3,934,431	153%	-15.65%
Local 891 School Custodian & Engineers WF/RWF/ED		80	\$2,506,350	\$311,332	\$2,817,682	\$1,990,270	\$413,263	\$2,403,533	\$414,149	\$5,121,554	182%	0.00%
TOTAL \$1 TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY		17 FUNDS:	\$26,444,210	\$3,224,209	\$29,668,419	\$23,672,561	\$3,729,595	\$27,402,156	\$2,266,263	\$67,093,490	226%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 TO \$10 MILLION												
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF		64	\$3,455,075	\$758,816	\$4,213,891	\$3,635,156	\$222,573	\$3,857,729	\$356,162	\$15,163,917	360%	96.29%
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF		77	\$4,084,857	\$363,754	\$4,448,611	\$4,691,365	\$241,776	\$4,933,141	-\$484,530	\$10,690,214	240%	31.08%
Superior Officers Council (Police) WF/CLRF		106	\$4,170,045	\$211,878	\$4,381,923	\$3,584,928	\$363,649	\$3,948,577	\$433,346	\$4,541,736	104%	-43.46%
House Staff Comm of Interns & Residents WF/Legal		24	\$4,419,191	\$429,942	\$4,849,133	\$4,318,404	\$482,507	\$4,800,911	\$48,223	\$8,410,679	173%	-5.39%
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal NYC RWF		33	\$5,230,275	\$189,846	\$5,420,121	\$4,780,650	\$863,663	\$5,644,313	-\$224,192	\$3,392,128	63%	-65.86%
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF		89	\$6,947,960	\$505,943	\$7,453,903	\$4,239,515	\$386,662	\$4,626,177	\$2,827,726	\$16,989,459	228%	24.33%
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF		78	\$7,608,030	\$3,586,747	\$11,194,777	\$9,731,309	\$633,835	\$10,365,144	\$829,633	\$7,178,141	64%	-65.02%
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF		105	\$7,860,364	\$565,528	\$8,425,892	\$6,157,107	\$643,052	\$6,800,159	\$1,625,733	\$11,465,015	136%	-25.78%
Detectives Endowment Assoc WF		16	\$8,030,819	\$1,552,470	\$9,583,289	\$8,672,023	\$888,414	\$9,560,437	\$22,852	\$19,899,497	208%	13.26%
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF		73	\$9,703,978	\$1,145,215	\$10,849,193	\$10,306,382	\$1,223,952	\$11,530,334	-\$681,141	\$17,668,523	163%	-11.17%
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED		93	\$9,954,847	\$1,640,363	\$11,595,210	\$7,650,370	\$1,313,973	\$8,964,343	\$2,630,867	\$35,694,252	308%	67.91%
TOTAL \$3 TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY		11 FUNDS:	\$71,465,441	\$10,950,502	\$82,415,943	\$67,767,209	\$7,264,056	\$75,031,265	\$7,384,679	\$151,093,561	183%	

2012 SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA

NAME OF FUND	REF	NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS	NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE	OTHER REVENUE	TOTAL REVENUE	BENEFIT EXPENSES	ADMIN EXPENSES	TOTAL EXPENSES	EXCESS OF REVENUE OVER EXPENSES	FUND BALANCE	FUND BAL/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
<u>SELF-INSURED WF & RWF (continued)</u>												
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 TO \$20 MILLION</u>												
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF	25	6,007	\$10,284,925	\$1,103,210	\$11,388,135	\$10,537,478	\$1,060,627	\$11,598,105	-\$209,970	\$12,053,238	106%	-23.90%
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF	26	7,419	\$11,162,611	\$1,650,728	\$12,813,339	\$9,248,568	\$1,289,354	\$10,537,922	\$2,275,417	\$19,312,516	151%	8.38%
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF	7	7,476	\$12,168,749	\$1,031,345	\$13,200,094	\$11,662,670	\$484,209	\$12,146,879	\$1,053,215	\$8,850,723	67%	-51.79%
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF	83	8,059	\$12,465,669	\$3,731,111	\$16,196,780	\$13,838,677	\$741,859	\$14,580,536	\$1,616,244	\$38,275,397	236%	69.92%
NYS Nurses Assoc WF	92	8,138	\$13,145,454	\$935,532	\$14,080,986	\$10,736,076	\$801,480	\$11,537,556	\$2,543,430	\$27,174,759	193%	38.77%
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF	72	7,400	\$14,692,532	\$4,335,394	\$19,027,926	\$15,271,934	\$592,186	\$15,864,120	\$3,163,806	\$16,239,973	85%	-38.63%
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	9	7,773	\$14,843,196	\$458,849	\$15,302,045	\$13,932,313	\$555,792	\$14,488,105	\$813,940	\$13,295,070	87%	-37.53%
Local 237 Teamsters RWF	44	2,024	\$16,882,661	\$3,099,279	\$19,981,940	\$15,049,773	\$1,726,129	\$16,775,902	\$3,206,038	\$31,795,083	159%	14.42%
Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF	15	11,472	\$17,544,789	\$4,607,170	\$22,151,959	\$15,680,831	\$1,290,899	\$16,971,730	\$5,180,229	\$35,757,545	161%	16.07%
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	81	10,413	\$17,705,969	\$4,316,585	\$22,022,554	\$11,129,425	\$796,663	\$11,926,088	\$10,096,466	\$34,080,589	155%	11.28%
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) WF/RWF/CLRF	113	11,881	\$19,838,341	\$528,137	\$20,366,478	\$18,567,258	\$1,014,852	\$19,582,110	\$784,368	\$22,578,166	111%	-20.29%
TOTAL \$10 TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY	11 FUNDS:		<u>\$160,734,896</u>	<u>\$25,797,340</u>	<u>\$186,532,236</u>	<u>\$145,655,003</u>	<u>\$10,354,050</u>	<u>\$156,009,053</u>	<u>\$30,523,183</u>	<u>\$259,413,059</u>	<u>139%</u>	
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION MORE THAN \$20 MILLION</u>												
Local 237 Teamsters WF	45	7,549	\$31,093,374	\$3,416,713	\$34,510,087	\$32,898,859	\$3,850,303	\$36,749,162	-\$2,239,075	\$46,940,190	136%	70.79%
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM	62	16,483	\$26,839,131	\$226,335	\$27,065,466	\$26,586,877	\$2,594,256	\$29,181,133	-\$2,115,667	\$6,557,852	24%	-69.58%
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	101	19,608	\$36,298,835	\$647,189	\$36,946,024	\$47,305,544	\$1,851,391	\$49,156,935	-\$12,210,911	\$19,468,260	53%	-33.84%
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	97	22,870	\$36,350,976	\$292,161	\$36,643,137	\$33,466,794	\$3,348,733	\$36,815,527	-\$172,390	\$43,077,007	118%	47.61%
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF	96	23,915	\$37,763,025	\$7,223,846	\$44,986,871	\$41,831,116	\$3,135,342	\$44,966,458	\$20,413	\$38,994,710	87%	8.84%
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM	30	14,640	\$44,480,455	\$7,812,647	\$52,293,102	\$45,183,671	\$4,904,980	\$50,088,651	\$2,204,451	\$36,386,553	70%	-12.63%
DC 37 WF	10	151,220	\$225,668,519	\$30,136,689	\$255,805,208	\$257,276,499	\$19,688,418	\$276,964,917	-\$21,159,709	\$198,903,127	78%	-2.37%
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF	41	172,925	\$280,657,380	\$7,459,122	\$288,116,502	\$265,720,430	\$21,856,944	\$287,577,374	\$539,128	\$227,974,334	79%	-0.65%
TOTAL MORE THAN \$20 MILLION CATEGORY	8 FUNDS:		<u>\$719,151,695</u>	<u>\$57,214,702</u>	<u>\$776,366,397</u>	<u>\$750,269,790</u>	<u>\$61,230,367</u>	<u>\$811,500,157</u>	<u>-\$35,133,760</u>	<u>\$618,302,033</u>	<u>80%</u>	
TOTAL SELF-INSURED FUNDS	59 FUNDS:		<u>\$982,728,127</u>	<u>\$98,126,783</u>	<u>\$1,080,854,910</u>	<u>\$991,799,153</u>	<u>\$83,747,083</u>	<u>\$1,075,546,236</u>	<u>\$5,308,674</u>	<u>\$1,114,115,107</u>	<u>103%</u>	
<u>INSURED WF & RWF</u>												
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$3 MILLION</u>												
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF	12	39	\$52,479	\$1,151	\$53,630	\$51,646	\$3,997	\$55,643	-\$2,013	\$79,598	148%	26.76%
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	13	108	\$146,708	\$1	\$146,709	\$139,700	\$3,997	\$143,697	\$3,012	\$75,168	51%	-56.24%
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF	23	N/A	\$315,717	\$39,994	\$355,711	\$237,419	\$64,133	\$301,552	\$54,159	\$432,463	122%	3.83%
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	60	273	\$421,352	\$10,408	\$431,760	\$336,369	\$67,418	\$403,787	\$27,973	\$439,985	102%	-12.97%
Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF/RWF	57	1,486	\$2,384,003	\$16,780	\$2,400,783	\$2,109,785	\$223,210	\$2,332,995	\$67,788	\$2,940,574	122%	4.60%
TOTAL UP TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY	5 FUNDS:		<u>\$3,320,259</u>	<u>\$68,334</u>	<u>\$3,388,593</u>	<u>\$2,874,919</u>	<u>\$362,755</u>	<u>\$3,237,674</u>	<u>\$150,919</u>	<u>\$3,967,788</u>	<u>117%</u>	
TOTAL SELF-INSURED AND INSURED FUNDS	64 FUNDS:		<u>\$986,048,386</u>	<u>\$98,195,117</u>	<u>\$1,084,243,503</u>	<u>\$994,674,072</u>	<u>\$84,109,838</u>	<u>\$1,078,783,910</u>	<u>\$5,459,593</u>	<u>\$1,118,082,895</u>	<u>103%</u>	

2012 SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA

NAME OF FUND	REF	NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS	NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE	OTHER REVENUE	TOTAL REVENUE	BENEFIT EXPENSES	ADMIN EXPENSES	TOTAL EXPENSES	EXCESS OF REVENUE OVER EXPENSES	FUND BALANCE	FUND BAL/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
ANNUITY FUNDS												
NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$3 MILLION												
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens AF	1	144	\$126,294	\$682,050	\$808,344	\$673,955	\$69,850	\$743,805	\$64,539	\$6,845,009	847%	9.45%
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc AF	11	108	\$154,659	-\$18,881	\$135,778	\$33,069	\$0	\$33,069	\$102,709	\$1,400,700	1032%	33.34%
Local 3 IBEW Communications Electricians AF	127	39	\$448,491	\$146,233	\$594,724	\$431,790	\$34,144	\$465,934	\$128,790	\$5,865,064	986%	27.46%
Civil Service Bar Assoc AF	130	870	\$464,215	\$102,342	\$566,557	\$261,705	\$48,985	\$310,690	\$255,867	\$4,109,956	725%	-6.24%
Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF	117	457	\$595,701	\$1,261,648	\$1,857,349	\$1,335,481	\$267,484	\$1,602,965	\$254,384	\$16,599,265	894%	15.51%
Local 444 Sanitation Officers Supplemental AF	133	2,096	\$627,692	\$96,656	\$724,348	\$555,450	\$66,394	\$621,844	\$102,504	\$1,395,135	193%	-75.11%
Correction Captains Assoc AF	4	760	\$796,755	\$1,367,369	\$2,164,124	\$1,768,752	\$188,778	\$1,957,530	\$206,594	\$16,792,582	776%	0.29%
TOTAL UP TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY	7 FUNDS:		\$3,213,807	\$3,637,417	\$6,851,224	\$5,060,202	\$675,635	\$5,735,837	\$1,115,387	\$53,007,711	774%	
Local 300 Civil Service Forum AF	125	762	\$1,095,349	\$622,534	\$1,717,883	\$442,156	\$120,543	\$562,699	\$1,155,184	\$12,856,099	748%	23.90%
Local 891(IUOE) AF	126	1,010	\$2,405,639	\$2,490,982	\$4,896,621	\$1,055,419	\$327,720	\$1,383,139	\$3,513,482	\$28,771,394	588%	-2.72%
Local 246 SEIU NYC AF	128	1,985	\$2,466,105	\$2,896,711	\$5,362,816	\$1,222,725	\$239,631	\$1,462,356	\$3,900,460	\$30,715,172	573%	-5.17%
TOTAL \$1 TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY	3 FUNDS:		\$5,967,093	\$6,010,227	\$11,977,320	\$2,720,300	\$687,894	\$3,408,194	\$8,569,126	\$72,342,665	604%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 - 10 MILLION												
Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF	63	1,015	\$3,037,832	\$6,446,517	\$9,484,349	\$4,653,655	\$256,750	\$4,910,405	\$4,573,944	\$46,040,616	485%	-48.98%
Doctors Council AF	124	1,273	\$3,563,302	\$1,733,421	\$5,296,723	\$926,550	\$142,451	\$1,069,001	\$4,227,722	\$37,451,907	707%	-25.69%
Local 1180 CWA Members AF	119	8,386	\$3,649,388	\$4,468,141	\$8,117,529	\$2,911,995	\$319,472	\$3,231,467	\$4,886,062	\$63,156,546	778%	-18.23%
Council of Supervisors and Administrators AF	132	5,926	\$4,195,608	\$829,686	\$5,025,294	\$328,522	\$93,434	\$421,956	\$4,603,338	\$16,894,610	336%	-64.67%
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc AF	76	3,916	\$4,344,525	\$8,092,415	\$12,436,940	\$6,062,689	\$327,914	\$6,390,603	\$6,046,337	\$154,807,859	1245%	30.82%
DC 37 AFSCME AF	121	32,941	\$4,388,835	\$5,506,118	\$9,894,953	\$3,805,940	\$908,130	\$4,714,070	\$5,180,883	\$84,634,988	855%	-10.11%
Detectives Endowment Assoc AF	14	5,234	\$4,856,161	\$16,937,750	\$21,793,911	\$12,801,356	\$1,171,334	\$13,972,690	\$7,821,221	\$178,355,686	818%	-13.99%
Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers AF	114	1,213	\$5,258,442	\$7,967,190	\$13,225,632	\$3,815,489	\$115,827	\$3,931,316	\$9,294,316	\$89,589,534	677%	-28.81%
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF	112	4,683	\$6,423,384	-\$1,355,567	\$5,067,817	\$5,542,390	\$460,317	\$6,002,707	-\$934,890	\$170,158,678	3358%	252.88%
Superior Officers Council (Police) AF	104	4,805	\$6,500,731	\$4,837,015	\$11,337,746	\$10,319,050	\$303,665	\$10,622,715	\$715,031	\$228,646,707	2017%	111.95%
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF	82	17,893	\$7,523,589	\$11,312,035	\$18,835,624	\$6,091,314	\$401,440	\$6,492,754	\$12,342,870	\$145,281,443	771%	-18.94%
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc AF	8	10,173	\$9,507,501	\$5,023,803	\$14,531,304	\$6,367,501	\$719,815	\$7,087,316	\$7,443,988	\$69,958,201	481%	-49.40%
TOTAL \$3 TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY	12 FUNDS:		\$63,249,298	\$71,798,524	\$135,047,822	\$63,626,451	\$5,220,549	\$68,847,000	\$66,200,822	\$1,284,976,775	951%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION MORE THAN \$10 MILLION												
Local 371 Social Service Employees AF	123	16,483	\$11,087,033	\$4,045,447	\$15,132,480	\$3,659,996	\$557,774	\$4,217,770	\$10,914,710	\$91,707,276	606%	-14.53%
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF	95	30,863	\$11,843,623	\$724,171	\$12,567,794	\$9,125,683	\$750,839	\$9,876,522	\$2,691,272	\$202,187,162	1609%	126.88%
Local 237 Teamsters AF	43	8,345	\$15,551,406	\$19,396,999	\$34,948,405	\$9,915,155	\$1,548,355	\$11,463,510	\$23,484,895	\$199,887,984	572%	-19.34%
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF	71	6,000	\$17,648,297	\$11,086,109	\$28,734,406	\$8,397,271	\$570,669	\$8,967,940	\$19,766,466	\$154,197,693	537%	-24.32%
4 FUNDS:			\$56,130,359	\$35,252,726	\$91,383,085	\$31,098,105	\$3,427,637	\$34,525,742	\$56,857,343	\$647,980,115	709%	
TOTAL ANNUITY FUNDS	26 FUNDS:		\$128,560,557	\$116,698,894	\$245,259,451	\$102,505,058	\$10,011,715	\$112,516,773	\$132,742,678	\$2,058,307,266	839%	
GRAND TOTAL	90 FUNDS:		\$1,114,608,943	\$214,894,011	\$1,329,502,954	\$1,097,179,130	\$94,121,553	\$1,191,300,683	\$138,202,271	\$3,176,390,161	239%	

2012 SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA

FROM ANALYSIS OF FINANCIAL AND OPERATING PRACTICES

<u>NAME OF FUND</u>	<u>REASON FUND IS EXCLUDED (SEE NOTE)</u>	<u>REF</u>	<u>NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS</u>	<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE</u>	<u>TOTAL REVENUE</u>	<u>NYC % OF TOTAL REVENUE</u>	<u>FUND BALANCE</u>
NYS Court Officers Assoc RWF	(1)	91	2	\$1,660	\$897,211	0.19%	\$10,211,594
Surrogates & Supreme Court Reporters Assoc RWF	(1)	108	N/A	\$2,813	\$262,028	1.07%	\$575,808
Local 40 Iron Workers WF	(1)	118	79	\$108,742	\$102,029,600	0.11%	\$111,852,113
DC 9 Painting Industry AF (Local 1969)	(1)	19	814	\$308,560	\$68,818,679	0.45%	\$438,161,425
Pavers & Road Builders District Council WF	(1)	100	284	\$592,381	\$28,947,711	2.05%	\$32,933,020
Local 40 Iron Workers AF	(1)	111	45	\$1,188,720	\$89,469,927	1.33%	\$639,372,404
NYC DC of Carpenters WF/RWF	(1)	88	1,220	\$1,950,878	\$329,637,678	0.59%	\$236,877,886
Local 1199 Nat Ben Fund Hosp Health Care WF/RWF	(1)	35	2,581	\$3,870,310	\$1,420,962,376	0.27%	\$555,816,499
Local 3 IBEW Electrical Workers Industry AF	(1)	49	1,100	\$9,096,659	\$89,865,734	10.12%	\$1,222,807,470
NYS Court Clerks Assoc RWF	(2)	90	8	\$8,835	\$1,203,532	0.73%	\$1,265,780
Local 1 Plumbing Industry AF	(2)	27	481	\$60,762	\$11,051,902	0.55%	\$82,850,142
NYC DC of Carpenters AF	(2)	116	679	\$6,405,844	\$154,220,415	4.15%	\$1,576,905,800
UFT Albert Shanker College Scholarship Fund	(3)	40	2	\$1,043,383	\$1,043,753	99.96%	\$535,313
Captains Endowment Assoc CLRF	(4)	106.1	825	\$61,945	\$62,136	99.69%	\$198,194
Detectives Endowment Assoc CLRF	(4)	16.1	5,149	\$384,972	\$549,495	70.06%	\$3,698,969
Committee of Interns and Residents ED	(4)	122	N/A	\$1,680,533	\$1,817,567	92.46%	\$2,059,889
Local 858 IBT, (OTB) Branch Office Managers WF	(5)	79	111	\$0	\$18,309	0.00%	\$583,689
Total NYC Contribution				\$26,766,996			

N/A - Fund did not specify the Number of NYC Members

NOTE: The above listed funds have been excluded from this analysis because:

- (1) These funds received a substantial portion of their revenues from sources other than the City.
- (2) These funds would distort category averages since they include other groups' that received a substantial portion of their revenues from sources other than the City.
- (3) Under the United Federation of Teachers' collective bargaining agreement, scholarship benefits are paid only to public high school students.
- (4) These funds had different fiscal year-end dates than their associated welfare funds so that consolidation would have distorted the information reported.
- (5) This fund has a balance though it no longer receives contributions from the City, effective December 7, 2010 (FY11), when OTB closed its operations.

2012 SCHEDULE OF ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES

<u>NAME OF FUND</u>	<u>REF</u>	<u>TOTAL ADMIN. EXPENSE</u>	<u>RENT</u>	<u>SALARIES</u>	<u>FEES & COMMISSN</u>	<u>LEGAL</u>	<u>ACCTG</u>	<u>TRAVEL & CONF.</u>	<u>TELE- PHONE</u>	<u>OFFICE EQUIP & RENTAL</u>	<u>OTHER OFFICE EXPENSE</u>	<u>INSUR- ANCE</u>	<u>REPAIRS & MAINT</u>	<u>OTHER</u>	<u>INSURANCE RETENTION</u>	<u>INVEST & CUSTODIAL SERVICES</u>
SELF-INSURED WF & RWF																
NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$1 MILLION																
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	56	\$31,850	\$0	\$0	\$13,728	\$8,264	\$5,390	\$46	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,986	\$0	\$436	\$0	\$2,000
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund	84	\$24,654	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$24,654	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Local 14 –14B IUOE WF/RWF	37	\$19,984	\$2,023	\$8,183	\$0	\$0	\$2,775	\$0	\$147	\$445	\$2,846	\$3,443	\$0	\$122	\$0	\$0
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF	87	\$20,344	\$0	\$0	\$7,796	\$1,500	\$8,458	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,540	\$0	\$50	\$0	\$0
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF	86	\$25,949	\$0	\$0	\$12,232	\$2,500	\$8,458	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$42	\$2,662	\$0	\$55	\$0	\$0
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF	59	\$55,611	\$2,211	\$21,819	\$5,442	\$1,000	\$18,490	\$0	\$543	\$702	\$465	\$3,903	\$234	\$803	\$0	\$0
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	48	\$76,786	\$0	\$0	\$25,527	\$31,674	\$10,138	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,329	\$8,118	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	38	\$255,062	\$31,909	\$156,782	\$0	\$4,000	\$12,000	\$487	\$4,912	\$6,946	\$7,530	\$8,889	\$4,554	\$0	\$0	\$17,053
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF	110	\$191,069	\$37,816	\$0	\$475	\$4,487	\$22,800	\$1,145	\$1,893	\$11,584	\$8,246	\$1,170	\$900	\$100,253	\$0	\$300
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF	2	\$125,140	\$19,080	\$31,939	\$20,659	\$7,500	\$8,000	\$10,070	\$977	\$0	\$12,377	\$1,234	\$0	\$200	\$0	\$13,104
Doctors Council RWF	21	\$176,308	\$58,486	\$42,267	\$40,393	\$5,367	\$7,559	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$6,370	\$1,091	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$14,775
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	54	\$166,259	\$23,961	\$30,599	\$60,237	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$6,616	\$0	\$3,283	\$9,381	\$886	\$624	\$834	\$0	\$9,838
TOTAL UP TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY	12 FUNDS:	\$1,169,016	\$175,486	\$291,589	\$186,489	\$76,292	\$114,068	\$18,364	\$8,472	\$22,960	\$73,240	\$35,922	\$6,312	\$102,753	\$0	\$57,070
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 TO \$3 MILLION																
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF	85	\$103,055	\$0	\$0	\$51,887	\$9,115	\$10,726	\$19,303	\$0	\$0	\$585	\$5,973	\$0	-\$4,419	\$0	\$9,885
Doctors Council WF	22	\$347,470	\$38,316	\$101,921	\$62,479	\$55,801	\$17,795	\$902	\$0	\$0	\$42,643	\$2,406	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$25,207
Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF	6/6.1	\$104,148	\$8,194	\$10,793	\$37,306	\$9,008	\$13,000	\$5,694	\$2,752	\$539	\$2,673	\$856	\$0	\$4,936	\$8,397	\$0
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF	32	\$239,479	\$50,736	\$0	\$68,321	\$9,600	\$11,100	\$44,621	\$5,701	\$2,387	\$3,762	\$1,508	\$6,435	\$33,129	\$0	\$2,179
United Probation Officers Assoc WF	109	\$355,890	\$76,077	\$246,675	\$950	\$8,975	\$22,800	\$2,274	\$5,917	\$21,833	\$14,825	\$3,378	\$1,200	-\$49,314	\$0	\$300
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	55	\$198,074	\$23,961	\$43,508	\$78,205	\$15,234	\$10,000	\$5,312	\$0	\$4,471	\$7,331	\$2,084	\$0	\$1,441	\$0	\$6,527
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	20	\$277,839	\$3,540	\$82,318	\$185,996	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,537	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$4,448
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF	50	\$174,375	\$5,278	\$79,328	\$38,994	\$5,260	\$5,250	\$3,151	\$2,898	\$1,213	\$8,389	\$2,226	\$0	\$7,192	\$0	\$15,196
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF	3	\$162,685	\$1,032	\$6,000	\$174,535	\$6,863	\$13,750	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,144	\$9,852	\$0	\$3,509	\$0	\$0
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF	65	\$111,927	\$0	\$10,175	\$32,896	\$4,400	\$11,000	\$5,694	\$0	\$0	\$30,000	\$1,579	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$16,183
1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF	68	\$249,215	\$37,751	\$58,666	\$73,422	\$15,073	\$9,500	\$8,945	\$2,461	\$23,538	\$3,059	\$1,925	\$2,398	\$1,586	\$10,890	\$0
Local 246 SEIU RWF	46	\$189,386	\$18,653	\$57,731	\$50,501	\$6,000	\$6,500	\$12,667	\$2,050	\$3,481	\$3,343	\$3,296	\$0	\$2,518	\$0	\$22,646
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF	51	\$194,605	\$4,522	\$80,527	\$41,727	\$7,219	\$8,500	\$609	\$3,268	\$2,868	\$6,722	\$2,573	\$0	\$3,555	\$0	\$32,515
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF	42	\$136,736	\$22,368	\$34,144	\$36,019	\$10,000	\$17,500	\$0	\$2,324	\$142	\$2,284	\$11,955	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Local 246 SEIU WF	47	\$258,712	\$25,758	\$83,574	\$73,931	\$10,500	\$6,500	\$9,437	\$2,830	\$5,771	\$6,856	\$6,862	\$0	\$388	\$0	\$26,304
Correction Captains Assoc RWF	5	\$158,736	\$17,702	\$1,777	\$83,817	\$7,136	\$10,000	\$7,876	\$5,946	\$1,166	\$6,582	\$1,298	\$0	\$277	\$7,576	\$7,584
Local 891 School Custodian & Engineers WF/RWF/ED	80	\$413,263	\$0	\$0	\$57,037	\$24,500	\$43,000	\$5,068	\$715	\$39,266	\$12,447	\$2,766	\$0	\$202,741	\$0	\$25,723
TOTAL \$1 TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY	17 FUNDS:	\$3,729,595	\$333,888	\$897,138	\$1,148,023	\$204,684	\$216,921	\$131,553	\$36,862	\$108,212	\$152,645	\$60,537	\$10,033	\$207,540	\$26,863	\$194,697
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 TO \$10 MILLION																
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF	64	\$222,573	\$0	\$28,248	\$85,504	\$4,400	\$11,000	\$2,634	\$0	\$0	\$30,000	\$5,124	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$55,663
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF	77	\$241,776	\$19,667	\$122,835	\$0	\$17,151	\$18,707	\$3,776	\$1,280	\$0	\$5,334	\$2,748	\$0	\$0	\$50,278	\$0
Superior Officers Council (Police) WF/CLRF	106	\$363,649	\$19,121	\$104,518	\$5,000	\$23,744	\$17,130	\$502	\$2,844	\$5,887	\$6,179	\$3,159	\$0	\$4,363	\$171,202	\$0
House Staff Comm of Interns & Residents WF/Legal	24	\$482,507	\$5,748	\$208,749	\$31,761	\$1,800	\$29,680	\$7,767	\$1,846	\$49,768	\$14,688	\$12,573	\$0	\$66,033	\$0	\$52,094
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal	33	\$863,663	\$69,187	\$321,417	\$334,217	\$27,000	\$19,190	\$28,335	\$8,158	\$13,295	\$12,885	\$14,760	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$15,219
NYC RWF	89	\$386,662	\$0	\$0	\$286,695	\$2,500	\$23,050	\$28,762	\$0	\$0	\$8,885	\$7,909	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$28,861
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF	78	\$633,835	\$31,466	\$206,047	\$0	\$27,435	\$19,415	\$3,275	\$1,883	\$1,169	\$3,444	\$4,303	\$0	\$0	\$335,398	\$0
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF	105	\$643,052	\$19,121	\$105,784	\$6,088	\$27,340	\$17,302	\$302	\$2,844	\$8,444	\$8,381	\$3,974	\$0	\$733	\$442,739	\$0
Detectives Endowment Assoc WF	16	\$888,414	\$42,000	\$348,267	\$405,460	\$26,500	\$15,750	\$0	\$2,394	\$20,797	\$5,903	\$1,289	\$0	\$1,380	\$0	\$18,673
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF	73	\$1,223,952	\$198,636	\$434,967	\$144,976	\$51,924	\$11,008	\$0	\$6,601	\$46,878	\$137,363	\$12,391	\$142,007	\$6,220	\$0	\$30,981
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED	93	\$1,313,973	\$164,217	\$790,976	\$259,609	\$0	\$17,500	\$375	\$6,847	\$13,116	\$40,276	\$9,779	\$0	\$11,278	\$0	\$0
TOTAL \$3 TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY	11 FUNDS:	\$7,264,056	\$569,163	\$2,671,808	\$1,559,310	\$209,794	\$199,732	\$75,728	\$34,697	\$159,354	\$273,338	\$78,009	\$142,007	\$90,007	\$999,617	\$201,491

2012 SCHEDULE OF ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES

NAME OF FUND	REF	TOTAL ADMIN. EXPENSE	RENT	SALARIES	FEES & COMMISSN	LEGAL	ACCTG	TRAVEL & CONF.	TELE- PHONE	OFFICE EQUIP & RENTAL	OTHER OFFICE EXPENSE	INSUR- ANCE	REPAIRS & MAINT	OTHER	INSURANCE RETENTION	INVEST & CUSTODIAL SERVICES
<u>SELF-INSURED WF & RWF (continued)</u>																
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 TO \$20 MILLION</u>																
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF	25	\$1,060,627	\$86,105	\$530,252	\$272,360	\$7,200	\$37,943	\$13,847	\$5,613	\$35,437	\$28,899	\$20,541	\$0	\$1,262	\$0	\$21,168
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF	26	\$1,289,354	\$106,425	\$655,387	\$325,794	\$7,200	\$30,290	\$443	\$6,937	\$43,798	\$47,353	\$20,098	\$0	\$9,291	\$0	\$36,338
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF	7	\$484,209	\$0	\$0	\$106,005	\$0	\$25,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$15,246	\$0	\$0	\$337,958	\$0	\$0
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF	83	\$741,859	\$37,186	\$493,347	\$112,770	\$18,000	\$12,000	\$3,369	\$3,870	\$40,963	\$14,433	\$5,921	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
NYS Nurses Assoc WF	92	\$801,480	\$64,750	\$75,250	\$432,754	\$15,000	\$14,400	\$9,449	\$7,000	\$10,500	\$17,948	\$10,797	\$0	\$33,944	\$74,976	\$34,712
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF	72	\$592,186	\$27,042	\$149,148	\$291,843	\$22,529	\$50,996	\$0	\$7,000	\$2,549	\$14,695	\$616	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$25,768
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	9	\$555,792	\$0	\$0	\$159,261	\$0	\$45,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$573	\$0	\$0	\$350,958	\$0	\$0
Local 237 Teamsters RWF	44	\$1,726,129	\$120,092	\$980,735	\$237,619	\$51,606	\$27,466	\$44,641	\$9,261	\$38,841	\$158,305	\$14,553	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$43,010
Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF	15	\$1,290,899	\$42,000	\$358,344	\$719,154	\$8,500	\$15,750	\$952	\$5,194	\$45,126	\$12,810	\$6,274	\$0	\$2,994	\$0	\$73,801
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	81	\$796,663	\$37,185	\$315,913	\$275,213	\$9,700	\$12,000	\$3,021	\$3,870	\$39,651	\$19,331	\$5,008	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$75,771
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) WF/RWF/CLRF	113	\$1,014,852	\$13,293	\$512,641	\$361,049	\$48,000	\$26,296	\$0	\$8,411	\$22,895	\$18,691	\$3,576	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
TOTAL \$10 TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY	11 FUNDS:	\$10,354,050	\$534,078	\$4,071,017	\$3,293,822	\$187,735	\$297,141	\$75,722	\$57,156	\$279,760	\$348,284	\$87,384	\$0	\$736,407	\$74,976	\$310,568
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION MORE THAN \$20 MILLION</u>																
Local 237 Teamsters WF	45	\$3,850,303	\$140,347	\$2,396,375	\$657,129	\$200,211	\$60,035	\$11,482	\$11,080	\$167,027	\$160,681	\$21,696	\$77,044	-\$249,136	\$0	\$196,332
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM	62	\$2,594,256	\$225,013	\$1,701,300	\$268,837	\$127,000	\$45,750	\$10,385	\$23,448	\$124,997	\$127,843	\$21,316	\$42,998	-\$169,220	\$26,669	\$17,920
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	101	\$1,851,391	\$173,516	\$1,275,708	\$145,887	\$64,508	\$41,044	\$21,776	\$14,440	\$15,025	\$57,804	\$15,482	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$26,201
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	97	\$3,348,733	\$312,813	\$1,912,233	\$643,782	\$120,960	\$113,399	\$0	\$28,412	\$83,245	\$56,771	\$45,613	\$30,730	\$0	\$0	\$775
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF	96	\$3,135,342	\$273,729	\$1,771,398	\$708,432	\$61,440	\$91,007	\$0	\$22,171	\$79,048	\$57,783	\$40,108	\$29,519	\$0	\$0	\$707
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM	30	\$4,904,980	\$341,639	\$2,192,273	\$729,395	\$79,730	\$61,000	\$28,547	\$75,951	\$478,627	\$466,433	\$63,934	\$87,193	\$214,577	\$0	\$85,681
DC 37 WF	10	\$19,688,418	\$1,224,868	\$10,368,378	\$169,266	\$300,380	\$154,811	\$94,157	\$52,933	\$5,140,696	\$1,463,698	\$200,152	\$98,851	\$253,868	\$0	\$166,360
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF	41	\$21,856,944	\$3,181,708	\$11,706,313	\$4,864,095	\$105,968	\$75,218	\$26,631	\$125,176	\$545,587	\$358,417	\$89,455	\$444,937	\$1,314	\$0	\$332,126
TOTAL MORE THAN \$20 MILLION CATEGORY	8 FUNDS:	\$61,230,367	\$5,873,633	\$33,323,978	\$8,186,823	\$1,060,197	\$642,264	\$192,978	\$353,611	\$6,634,252	\$2,749,430	\$497,756	\$811,272	\$51,403	\$26,669	\$826,102
TOTAL SELF-INSURED FUNDS	59 FUNDS:	\$83,747,083	\$7,486,247	\$41,255,530	\$14,374,467	\$1,738,702	\$1,470,126	\$494,345	\$490,798	\$7,204,537	\$3,596,937	\$759,608	\$969,624	\$1,188,110	\$1,128,125	\$1,589,928
<u>INSURED WF & RWF</u>																
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$3 MILLION</u>																
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF	12	\$3,997	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$3,900	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$97	\$0	\$0
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	13	\$3,997	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$3,900	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$97	\$0	\$0
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF	23	\$64,133	\$12,087	\$28,210	\$8,792	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$3,089	\$0	\$5,351	\$5,304	\$698	\$602	\$0	\$0
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	60	\$67,418	\$3,487	\$34,415	\$0	\$1,000	\$19,350	\$0	\$857	\$1,107	\$1,054	\$4,689	\$369	\$1,090	\$0	\$0
Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF/RWF	57	\$223,210	\$5,170	\$43,126	\$69,962	\$36,000	\$34,146	\$5,746	\$903	\$5,724	\$8,641	\$8,548	\$5,244	\$0	\$0	\$0
TOTAL UP TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY	5 FUNDS:	\$362,755	\$20,744	\$105,751	\$78,754	\$37,000	\$61,296	\$5,746	\$4,849	\$6,831	\$15,046	\$18,541	\$6,311	\$1,886	\$0	\$0
TOTAL SELF-INSURED AND INSURED FUNDS	64 FUNDS:	\$84,109,838	\$7,506,991	\$41,361,280	\$14,453,221	\$1,775,702	\$1,531,422	\$500,091	\$495,647	\$7,211,368	\$3,611,983	\$778,149	\$975,936	\$1,189,996	\$1,128,125	\$1,589,928

2012 SCHEDULE OF ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES

NAME OF FUND	REF	TOTAL ADMIN. EXPENSE	RENT	SALARIES	FEES & COMMISSN	LEGAL	ACCTG	TRAVEL & CONF.	TELE- PHONE	OFFICE EQUIP & RENTAL	OTHER OFFICE EXPENSE	INSUR- ANCE	REPAIRS & MAINT	OTHER	INSURANCE RETENTION	INVEST & CUSTODIAL SERVICES
ANNUITY FUNDS																
NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$3 MILLION																
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens AF	1	\$69,850	\$0	\$0	\$7,200	\$5,000	\$4,500	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$3,926	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$49,224
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc AF	11	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Local 3 IBEW Communications Electricians AF	127	\$34,144	\$0	\$0	\$10,623	\$8,066	\$7,500	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$7,955	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Civil Service Bar Assoc AF	130	\$48,985	\$0	\$0	\$31,395	\$6,105	\$7,525	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$3,794	\$0	\$166	\$0	\$0
Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF	117	\$267,484	\$4,411	\$184,230	\$0	\$10,000	\$12,000	\$325	\$581	\$1,860	\$2,079	\$5,651	\$531	\$0	\$0	\$45,816
Local 444 Sanitation Officers Supplemental AF	133	\$66,394	\$0	\$42,675	\$14,186	\$0	\$3,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$398	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$6,040
Correction Captains Assoc AF	4	\$188,778	\$9,248	\$9,721	\$15,000	\$15,913	\$11,000	\$7,877	\$3,107	\$609	\$1,294	\$6,861	\$0	\$1,401	\$0	\$106,747
TOTAL UP TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY	7 FUNDS:	\$675,635	\$13,659	\$236,626	\$78,404	\$45,084	\$45,525	\$8,202	\$3,688	\$2,469	\$3,373	\$28,585	\$531	\$1,662	\$0	\$207,827
Local 300 Civil Service Forum AF	125	\$120,543	\$4,072	\$3,480	\$5,607	\$9,000	\$15,000	\$9,263	\$0	\$260	\$212	\$184	\$114	\$2,237	\$0	\$71,114
Local 891 (IUOE) AF	126	\$327,720	\$0	\$0	\$11,568	\$12,000	\$20,000	\$0	\$0	\$10,821	\$2,473	\$8,562	\$0	\$83,555	\$0	\$178,741
Local 246 SEIU NYC AF	128	\$239,631	\$0	\$0	\$18,000	\$8,500	\$7,000	\$2,910	\$0	\$0	\$72	\$3,700	\$0	\$989	\$0	\$198,460
TOTAL \$1 TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY	3 FUNDS:	\$687,894	\$4,072	\$3,480	\$35,175	\$29,500	\$42,000	\$12,173	\$0	\$11,081	\$2,757	\$12,446	\$114	\$86,781	\$0	\$448,315
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 - 10 MILLION																
Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF	63	\$256,750	\$0	\$0	\$9,681	\$4,400	\$21,500	\$2,429	\$0	\$0	\$30,000	\$14,444	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$174,296
Doctors Council AF	124	\$142,451	\$0	\$0	\$1,353	\$27,673	\$12,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$70,461	\$13,964	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$17,000
Local 1180 CWA Members AF	119	\$319,472	\$0	\$0	\$85,250	\$11,527	\$14,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,805	\$25,090	\$0	\$1,977	\$0	\$178,823
Council of Supervisors and Administrators AF	132	\$93,434	\$0	\$0	\$26,456	\$24,000	\$10,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$10,303	\$10,251	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$12,424
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc AF	76	\$327,914	\$27,429	\$176,879	\$55,481	\$33,310	\$14,331	\$334	\$1,780	\$3,427	\$3,949	\$9,855	\$0	\$1,139	\$0	\$0
DC 37 AFSCME AF	121	\$908,130	\$0	\$0	\$464,446	\$40,970	\$16,201	\$1,364	\$0	\$16,420	\$12,759	\$24,223	\$0	\$231,239	\$0	\$100,508
Detectives Endowment Assoc AF	14	\$1,171,334	\$21,000	\$40,961	\$15,678	\$15,000	\$23,000	\$0	\$1,897	\$16,481	\$6,148	\$20,113	\$0	\$1,817	\$0	\$1,009,240
Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers AF	114	\$115,827	\$3,419	\$14,780	\$24,725	\$12,000	\$31,236	\$229	\$0	\$2,863	\$1,401	\$17,720	\$2,622	\$500	\$0	\$4,332
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF	112	\$460,317	\$6,647	\$138,465	\$47,639	\$36,000	\$0	\$0	\$4,207	\$1,228	\$17,705	\$16,880	\$0	-\$1,313	\$0	\$192,859
Superior Officers Council (Police) AF	104	\$303,665	\$9,561	\$51,964	\$13,950	\$74,690	\$15,130	\$151	\$1,422	\$5,168	\$105,262	\$6,207	\$0	\$1,233	\$0	\$18,927
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF	82	\$401,440	\$18,556	\$191,040	\$21,058	\$9,700	\$4,500	\$1,686	\$3,862	\$7,719	\$8,726	\$23,071	\$333	\$0	\$0	\$111,189
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc AF	8	\$719,815	\$0	\$0	\$119,568	\$0	\$34,500	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,286	\$0	\$0	\$195,560	\$0	\$367,901
TOTAL \$3 TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY	12 FUNDS:	\$5,220,549	\$86,612	\$614,089	\$885,285	\$289,270	\$196,398	\$6,193	\$13,168	\$53,306	\$271,805	\$181,818	\$2,955	\$432,152	\$0	\$2,187,499
NYC CONTRIBUTION MORE THAN \$10 MILLION																
Local 371 Social Service Employees AF	123	\$557,774	\$0	\$0	\$3,780	\$22,500	\$12,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$42,984	\$2,352	\$0	\$84,959	\$0	\$389,199
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF	95	\$750,839	\$13,022	\$130,125	\$1,285	\$9,600	\$46,636	\$0	\$1,112	\$3,196	\$2,530	\$14,065	\$1,194	\$0	\$0	\$528,074
Local 237 Teamsters AF	43	\$1,548,355	\$17,700	\$183,850	\$0	\$192,632	\$30,000	\$5,637	\$0	\$15,992	\$39,545	\$43,457	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,019,542
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF	71	\$570,669	\$23,551	\$110,650	\$72,404	\$23,081	\$35,004	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,691	\$1,792	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$301,496
4 FUNDS:		\$3,427,637	\$54,273	\$424,625	\$77,469	\$247,813	\$123,640	\$5,637	\$1,112	\$19,188	\$87,750	\$61,666	\$1,194	\$84,959	\$0	\$2,238,311
TOTAL ANNUITY FUNDS	26 FUNDS:	\$10,011,715	\$158,616	\$1,278,820	\$1,076,333	\$611,667	\$407,563	\$32,205	\$17,968	\$86,044	\$365,685	\$284,515	\$4,794	\$605,554	\$0	\$5,081,952
GRAND TOTAL	90 FUNDS:	\$94,121,553	\$7,665,607	\$42,640,100	\$15,529,554	\$2,387,369	\$1,938,985	\$532,296	\$513,615	\$7,297,412	\$3,977,668	\$1,062,664	\$980,730	\$1,795,550	\$1,128,125	\$6,671,880

2012 SCHEDULE OF WELFARE FUND AVAILABLE BENEFITS

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	MEMBER BENEFITS PROVIDED BY EACH WELFARE FUND *																				OTHER BENEFITS Self-Insured unless (Ins) is specified														
			Dental		Optical		Prescription Drugs		Audiology/ Hearing Aids		Life and/or ADD Insurance		Legal Services		Supplemental/ Major Medical		Death		Short/Long Term Disability		Podiatry and/or Orthotics			Medical/Drug Reimbursements		Catastrophic		Education		Retirement/Pension Counseling							
			Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self		Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self	Ins	Self				
SELF-INSURED NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 TO \$3 MILLION (17 FUNDS)																																					
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF	85	\$1,258,414		X		X					X	X																								Wellness, Chiropractic, and Asbestos Screening	
Doctors Council WF	22	\$1,616,498		X		X																														Mammogram, Maternity/Adoption, Physical Examinations, and Psychiatric	
Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF	6/6.1	\$1,013,841	X	X		X									X																					Ambulance, In-Hospital, Maternity, and Body Scans	
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF	32	\$957,966		X		X																															
United Probation Officers Assoc WF	109	\$890,680		X		X																														Anesthesia and Emergency Room	
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	55	\$1,312,323		X		X																														X	
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	20	\$1,288,378		X		X																															
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF	50	\$949,715	X	X		X																														Employee Assistance Program and Heart Screening	
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF	3	\$1,308,114		X		X																														Lifestyle, Nurse Helpline, and Nursery	
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF	65	\$1,431,950		X		X																															
1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF	68	\$1,588,206		X		X																															Social Services
Local 246 SEIU RWF	46	\$1,370,024		X		X																															
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF	51	\$1,282,927	X	X		X																															Employee Assistance Program and Heart Screening
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF	42	\$1,416,381		X		X																															
Local 246 SEIU WF	47	\$1,962,135		X		X																															
Correction Captains Assoc RWF	5	\$2,034,739	X	X		X																															In-Hospital and Body Scans
Local 891 School Custodian & Engineers WF/RWF/ED	80	\$1,990,270		X		X																															Variable and Survivor Continuation

* Each benefit is identified as either Insured (Ins) or Self-Insured (Self).
Insured Benefits are listed in the shaded columns.

2012 SCHEDULE OF WELFARE FUND AVAILABLE BENEFITS

<u>FUND NAME</u> (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	<u>REF</u>	<u>TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE</u>	MEMBER BENEFITS PROVIDED BY EACH WELFARE FUND *																				OTHER BENEFITS Self-Insured unless (Ins) is specified									
			Dental Ins	Dental Self	Optical Ins	Optical Self	Prescription Drugs Ins	Prescription Drugs Self	Audiology/ Hearing Aids Ins	Audiology/ Hearing Aids Self	Life and/or ADD Insurance Ins	Life and/or ADD Insurance Self	Legal Services Ins	Legal Services Self	Supplemental/ Major Medical Ins	Supplemental/ Major Medical Self	Death Ins	Death Self	Short/Long Term Disability Ins	Short/Long Term Disability Self	Podiatry and/or Orthotics Ins	Podiatry and/or Orthotics Self		Medical/Drug Reimbursements Ins	Medical/Drug Reimbursements Self	Catastrophic Ins	Catastrophic Self	Education Ins	Education Self	Retirement/Pension Counseling Ins	Retirement/Pension Counseling Self	
SELF-INSURED NYC CONTRIBUTION MORE THAN \$20 MILLION (EIGHT FUNDS)																																
Local 237 Teamsters WF	45	\$32,898,859		X		X		X		X				X			X		X												X	College Guidance Counseling
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM	62	\$26,586,877		X		X		X		X				X			X		X		X		X					X		X	Diagnostic Examinations and Prosthetic Appliances	
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	101	\$47,305,544	X	X		X		X		X			X	X		X	X														Basic Health (Ins) and Well Care Programs	
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	97	\$33,466,794		X		X				X			X	X												X				X		
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF	96	\$41,831,116		X		X							X																			
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM	30	\$45,183,671	X	X		X		X		X							X		X		X		X				X		X	Clinical and Maternity		
DC 37 WF	10	\$257,276,499		X		X		X		X					X		X		X		X				X		X		X	Social Services Crisis Intervention Program, Second Surgical Consultation, and Survivor		
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF	41	\$265,720,430		X		X		X						X		X		X					X							Private Duty Nursing, Optional Rider Reimbursement, Anesthesia, Retiree Programs, and SLOAC (Ins)		

WELFARE FUNDS BENEFITS SUMMARY (64 FUNDS)

SUBTOTAL (Insured vs. Self-Insured)

TOTAL

24	55	3	61	3	46	0	44	38	3	0	27	8	22	1	22	8	12	0	14	0	12	5	5	0	6	0	11
79		64		49		44		41		27		30		23		20		14		12		10		6		11	

* Each benefit is identified as either Insured (Ins) or Self-Insured (Self). Insured Benefits are listed in the shaded columns.

2012 SCHEDULE OF BENEFIT FUND RATIOS

NAME OF FUND	REF	DEVIATION		DEVIATION		DEVIATION		DEVIATION		EXCESS/ TOTAL REV.	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
		BEN EXP/ TOTAL REV.	FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADMIN EXP/ TOTAL REV.	FROM CAT. AVERAGE	BEN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADMIN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	FROM CAT. AVERAGE		
<u>SELF-INSURED WF & RWF</u>											
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$1 MILLION</u>											
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	56	115.58%	53.41%	34.09%	79.24%	77.22%	-2.80%	22.78%	10.84%	-49.67%	-980.76%
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund	84	26.87%	-64.34%	11.56%	-39.23%	69.92%	-11.99%	30.08%	46.37%	61.58%	991.84%
Local 14 -14B IUOE WF/RWF	37	87.90%	16.67%	14.34%	-24.63%	85.98%	8.22%	14.02%	-31.77%	-2.24%	-139.69%
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF	87	70.03%	-7.05%	11.29%	-40.61%	86.11%	8.38%	13.89%	-32.42%	18.67%	231.10%
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF	86	78.48%	4.17%	9.62%	-49.39%	89.08%	12.12%	10.92%	-46.84%	11.89%	110.86%
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF	59	71.93%	-4.53%	17.33%	-8.88%	80.58%	1.43%	19.42%	-5.52%	10.74%	90.40%
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	48	75.67%	0.43%	19.99%	5.13%	79.10%	-0.44%	20.90%	1.71%	4.34%	-23.11%
Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	38	62.05%	-17.64%	32.14%	68.97%	65.88%	-17.08%	34.12%	66.04%	5.81%	3.09%
United Probation Officers Assoc RWF	110	61.68%	-18.14%	27.82%	46.25%	68.92%	-13.26%	31.08%	51.26%	10.51%	86.32%
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF	2	79.59%	5.64%	15.56%	-18.19%	83.65%	5.28%	16.35%	-20.42%	4.85%	-14.02%
Doctors Council RWF	21	87.58%	16.25%	17.38%	-8.63%	83.44%	5.03%	16.56%	-19.43%	-4.96%	-187.99%
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	54	86.73%	15.11%	17.11%	-10.04%	83.52%	5.13%	16.48%	-19.82%	-3.84%	-168.05%
UP TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY AVERAGE	12 FUNDS:	75.34%		19.02%		79.45%		20.55%		5.64%	
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 TO \$3 MILLION</u>											
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF	85	105.44%	29.47%	8.64%	-34.97%	92.43%	7.24%	7.57%	-45.18%	-14.08%	-366.56%
Doctors Council WF	22	106.48%	30.75%	22.89%	72.39%	82.31%	-4.51%	17.69%	28.14%	-29.37%	-656.16%
Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF	6/6.1	83.63%	2.69%	8.59%	-35.30%	90.68%	5.21%	9.32%	-32.53%	7.78%	47.25%
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF	32	76.86%	-5.62%	19.21%	44.71%	80.00%	-7.18%	20.00%	44.85%	3.92%	-25.73%
United Probation Officers Assoc WF	109	70.70%	-13.19%	28.25%	112.76%	71.45%	-17.10%	28.55%	106.78%	1.05%	-80.16%
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	55	99.38%	22.02%	15.00%	12.96%	86.89%	0.80%	13.11%	-5.02%	-14.38%	-372.20%
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	20	93.51%	14.82%	20.17%	51.88%	82.26%	-4.56%	17.74%	28.48%	-13.68%	-359.03%
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF	50	58.27%	-28.45%	10.70%	-19.43%	84.49%	-1.98%	15.51%	12.35%	31.03%	487.61%
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF	3	88.04%	8.10%	14.58%	9.83%	85.79%	-0.47%	14.21%	2.93%	-2.62%	-149.68%
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF	65	81.40%	-0.05%	6.36%	-52.08%	92.75%	7.61%	7.25%	-47.49%	12.24%	131.70%
1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF	68	87.05%	6.89%	13.66%	2.88%	86.44%	0.28%	13.56%	-1.76%	-0.71%	-113.46%
Local 246 SEIU RWF	46	73.40%	-9.87%	10.15%	-23.58%	87.86%	1.93%	12.14%	-12.04%	16.45%	211.46%
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF	51	64.50%	-20.80%	9.78%	-26.32%	86.83%	0.74%	13.17%	-4.61%	25.72%	386.96%
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF	42	66.40%	-18.47%	6.41%	-51.72%	91.20%	5.80%	8.80%	-36.23%	27.19%	414.79%
Local 246 SEIU WF	47	79.49%	-2.40%	10.48%	-21.07%	88.35%	2.50%	11.65%	-15.63%	10.03%	89.96%
Correction Captains Assoc RWF	5	79.29%	-2.64%	6.19%	-53.41%	92.76%	7.62%	7.24%	-47.59%	14.52%	174.95%
Local 891 School Custodian & Engineers WF/RWF/ED	80	70.64%	-13.27%	14.67%	10.46%	82.81%	-3.93%	17.19%	24.53%	14.70%	178.30%
\$1 TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY AVERAGE	17 FUNDS:	81.44%		13.28%		86.19%		13.81%		5.28%	
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 TO \$10 MILLION</u>											
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF	64	86.27%	3.24%	5.28%	-39.01%	94.23%	4.04%	5.77%	-38.82%	8.45%	8.61%
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF	77	105.46%	26.21%	5.43%	-37.25%	95.10%	5.00%	4.90%	-48.03%	-10.89%	-239.97%
Superior Officers Council (Police) WF/CLRF	106	81.81%	-2.09%	8.30%	-4.18%	90.79%	0.24%	9.21%	-2.33%	9.89%	27.08%
House Staff Comm of Interns & Residents WF/Legal	24	89.06%	6.58%	9.95%	14.89%	89.95%	-0.69%	10.05%	6.58%	0.99%	-87.22%
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal	33	88.20%	5.56%	15.93%	83.99%	84.70%	-6.48%	15.30%	62.27%	-4.14%	-153.15%
NYC RWF	89	56.88%	-31.93%	5.19%	-40.10%	91.64%	1.18%	8.36%	-11.36%	37.94%	387.50%
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF	78	86.93%	4.03%	5.66%	-34.62%	93.88%	3.66%	6.12%	-35.15%	7.41%	-4.77%
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF	105	73.07%	-12.55%	7.63%	-11.88%	90.54%	-0.03%	9.46%	0.28%	19.29%	147.95%
Detectives Endowment Assoc WF	16	90.49%	8.30%	9.27%	7.04%	90.71%	0.15%	9.29%	-1.45%	0.24%	-96.94%
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF	73	95.00%	13.69%	11.28%	30.26%	89.38%	-1.31%	10.62%	12.57%	-6.28%	-180.68%
Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED	93	65.98%	-21.04%	11.33%	30.85%	85.34%	-5.77%	14.66%	55.44%	22.69%	191.57%
\$3 TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY AVERAGE	11 FUNDS:	83.56%		8.66%		90.57%		9.43%		7.78%	

2012 SCHEDULE OF BENEFIT FUND RATIOS

NAME OF FUND	REF	BEN EXP/ TOTAL REV.	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADMIN EXP/ TOTAL REV.	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	BEN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADMIN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	EXCESS/ TOTAL REV.	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
<u>SELF-INSURED WF & RWF (continued)</u>											
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 TO \$20 MILLION</u>											
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF	25	92.53%	16.47%	9.31%	62.29%	90.86%	-2.52%	9.14%	34.61%	-1.84%	-112.44%
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF	26	72.18%	-9.14%	10.06%	75.34%	87.76%	-5.84%	12.24%	80.10%	17.76%	19.83%
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF	7	88.35%	11.22%	3.67%	-36.08%	96.01%	3.01%	3.99%	-41.32%	7.98%	-46.16%
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF	83	85.44%	7.55%	4.58%	-20.19%	94.91%	1.83%	5.09%	-25.10%	9.98%	-32.66%
NYS Nurses Assoc WF	92	76.25%	-4.02%	5.69%	-0.82%	93.05%	-0.16%	6.95%	2.26%	18.06%	21.89%
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF	72	80.26%	1.03%	3.11%	-45.77%	96.27%	3.28%	3.73%	-45.05%	16.63%	12.20%
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	9	91.05%	14.61%	3.63%	-36.71%	96.16%	3.17%	3.84%	-43.53%	5.32%	-64.11%
Local 237 Teamsters RWF	44	75.32%	-5.19%	8.64%	50.53%	89.71%	-3.75%	10.29%	51.46%	16.04%	8.27%
Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF	15	70.79%	-10.89%	5.83%	1.54%	92.39%	-0.87%	7.61%	11.96%	23.38%	57.80%
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	81	50.54%	-36.39%	3.62%	-36.96%	93.32%	0.12%	6.68%	-1.67%	45.85%	209.37%
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) WF/RWF/CLRF	113	91.17%	14.76%	4.98%	-13.17%	94.82%	1.73%	5.18%	-23.71%	3.85%	-74.01%
\$10 TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY AVERAGE	11 FUNDS:	79.44%		5.74%		93.21%		6.79%		14.82%	
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION MORE THAN \$20 MILLION</u>											
Local 237 Teamsters WF	45	95.33%	-2.86%	11.16%	34.17%	89.52%	-2.73%	10.48%	31.57%	-6.49%	0.49%
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM	62	98.23%	0.09%	9.59%	15.27%	91.11%	-1.01%	8.89%	11.64%	-7.82%	21.07%
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	101	128.04%	30.47%	5.01%	-39.74%	96.23%	4.56%	3.77%	-52.70%	-33.05%	411.92%
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	97	91.33%	-6.94%	9.14%	9.90%	90.90%	-1.23%	9.10%	14.23%	-0.47%	-92.71%
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF	96	92.99%	-5.25%	6.97%	-16.19%	93.03%	1.08%	6.97%	-12.44%	0.05%	-100.70%
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM	30	86.40%	-11.96%	9.38%	12.80%	90.21%	-1.99%	9.79%	22.98%	4.22%	-165.29%
DC 37 WF	10	100.58%	2.48%	7.70%	-7.44%	92.89%	0.93%	7.11%	-10.73%	-8.27%	28.12%
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF	41	92.23%	-6.03%	7.59%	-8.77%	92.40%	0.39%	7.60%	-4.55%	0.19%	-102.90%
MORE THAN \$20 MILLION CATEGORY AVERAGE	8 FUNDS:	98.14%		8.32%		92.04%		7.96%		-6.46%	
SELF-INSURED FUNDS AVERAGE	59 FUNDS:	83.58%		11.00%		88.29%		11.71%		5.41%	
<u>INSURED WF & RWF</u>											
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$3 MILLION</u>											
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF	12	96.30%	13.55%	7.45%	-29.85%	92.82%	4.88%	7.18%	-37.53%	-3.75%	-182.21%
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	13	95.22%	12.28%	2.72%	-74.36%	97.22%	9.85%	2.78%	-75.81%	2.05%	-55.03%
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF	23	66.74%	-21.30%	18.03%	69.71%	78.73%	-11.04%	21.27%	84.95%	15.23%	233.49%
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	60	77.91%	-8.14%	15.61%	46.98%	83.30%	-5.87%	16.70%	45.20%	6.48%	41.91%
Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF/RWF	57	87.88%	3.62%	9.30%	-12.49%	90.43%	2.18%	9.57%	-16.80%	2.82%	-38.15%
INSURED FUNDS AVERAGE	5 FUNDS:	84.81%		10.62%		88.50%		11.50%		4.57%	
SELF-INSURED AND INSURED FUNDS AVERAGE	64 FUNDS:	83.79%		10.94%		88.33%		11.67%		5.27%	

2012 SCHEDULE OF BENEFIT FUND RATIOS

NAME OF FUND	REF	BEN EXP/ TOTAL REV.	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADMIN EXP/ TOTAL REV.	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	BEN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADMIN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	EXCESS/ TOTAL REV.	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
<u>ANNUITY FUNDS</u>											
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION UP TO \$3 MILLION</u>											
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens AF	1	83.37%	27.75%	8.64%	9.34%	90.61%	0.60%	9.39%	-5.41%	7.98%	-70.25%
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc AF	11	24.36%	-62.68%	0.00%	-100.00%	100.00%	11.02%	0.00%	-100.00%	75.64%	181.90%
Local 3 IBEW Communications Electricians AF	127	72.60%	11.25%	5.74%	-27.35%	92.67%	2.89%	7.33%	-26.18%	21.66%	-19.30%
Civil Service Bar Assoc AF	130	46.19%	-29.22%	8.65%	9.41%	84.23%	-6.48%	15.77%	58.82%	45.16%	68.30%
Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF	117	71.90%	10.17%	14.40%	82.23%	83.31%	-7.50%	16.69%	68.09%	13.70%	-48.96%
Local 444 Sanitation Officers Supplemental AF	133	76.68%	17.50%	9.17%	15.99%	89.32%	-0.83%	10.68%	7.55%	14.15%	-47.26%
Correction Captains Assoc AF	4	81.73%	25.23%	8.72%	10.38%	90.36%	0.32%	9.64%	-2.86%	9.55%	-64.42%
UP TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY AVERAGE	7 FUNDS:	65.26%		7.90%		90.07%		9.93%		26.83%	
<hr/>											
Local 300 Civil Service Forum AF	125	25.74%	10.16%	7.02%	15.80%	78.58%	-1.16%	21.42%	4.49%	67.24%	-4.72%
Local 891(IUOE) AF	126	21.55%	-7.75%	6.69%	10.45%	76.31%	-4.02%	23.69%	15.57%	71.75%	1.67%
Local 246 SEIU NYC AF	128	22.80%	-2.41%	4.47%	-26.26%	83.61%	5.18%	16.39%	-20.07%	72.73%	3.05%
\$1 TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY AVERAGE	3 FUNDS:	23.36%		6.06%		79.50%		20.50%		70.58%	
<hr/>											
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 - 10 MILLION</u>											
Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF	63	49.07%	5.09%	2.71%	-32.47%	94.77%	4.64%	5.23%	-44.56%	48.23%	-2.18%
Doctors Council AF	124	17.49%	-62.54%	2.69%	-32.91%	86.67%	-4.30%	13.33%	41.29%	79.82%	61.90%
Local 1180 CWA Members AF	119	35.87%	-23.17%	3.94%	-1.82%	90.11%	-0.50%	9.89%	4.82%	60.19%	22.09%
Council of Supervisors and Administrators AF	132	6.54%	-86.00%	1.86%	-53.62%	77.86%	-14.04%	22.14%	134.78%	91.60%	85.81%
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc AF	76	48.75%	4.40%	2.64%	-34.22%	94.87%	4.75%	5.13%	-45.59%	48.62%	-1.39%
DC 37 AFSCME AF	121	38.46%	-17.62%	9.18%	128.95%	80.74%	-10.86%	19.26%	104.26%	52.36%	6.21%
Detectives Endowment Assoc AF	14	58.74%	25.80%	5.37%	34.08%	91.62%	1.16%	8.38%	-11.11%	35.89%	-27.21%
Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers AF	114	28.85%	-38.21%	0.88%	-78.15%	97.05%	7.16%	2.95%	-68.76%	70.28%	42.55%
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF	112	109.36%	134.22%	9.08%	126.60%	92.33%	1.95%	7.67%	-18.69%	-18.45%	-137.42%
Superior Officers Council (Police) AF	104	91.02%	94.93%	2.68%	-33.18%	97.14%	7.26%	2.86%	-69.69%	6.31%	-87.21%
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF	82	32.34%	-30.74%	2.13%	-46.83%	93.82%	3.59%	6.18%	-34.44%	65.53%	32.92%
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc AF	8	43.82%	-6.15%	4.95%	23.58%	89.84%	-0.80%	10.16%	7.69%	51.23%	3.91%
\$3 TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY AVERAGE	12 FUNDS:	46.69%		4.01%		90.57%		9.43%		49.30%	
<hr/>											
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION MORE THAN \$10 MILLION</u>											
Local 371 Social Service Employees AF	123	24.19%	-37.34%	3.69%	-8.29%	86.78%	-3.40%	13.22%	29.98%	72.13%	25.70%
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF	95	72.61%	88.12%	5.97%	48.65%	92.40%	2.86%	7.60%	-25.28%	21.41%	-62.68%
Local 237 Teamsters AF	43	28.37%	-26.50%	4.43%	10.23%	86.49%	-3.71%	13.51%	32.76%	67.20%	17.11%
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF	71	29.22%	-24.29%	1.99%	-50.59%	93.64%	4.24%	6.36%	-37.46%	68.79%	19.88%
4 FUNDS:		38.60%		4.02%		89.83%		10.17%		57.38%	
<hr/>											
ANNUITY FUNDS AVERAGE	19 FUNDS:	43.48%		5.50%		87.49%		12.51%		51.02%	
<hr/>											
GRAND TOTAL	83 FUNDS:	67.67%		8.76%		87.99%		12.01%		23.57%	

2012 FUNDS THAT DO NOT USE CPAs
FROM THE COMPTROLLER'S PREQUALIFIED CPA LIST*

1. 1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF
2. Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens AF
3. Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF
4. Civil Service Bar Assoc AF
5. Civil Service Bar Assoc WF
6. Committee of Interns and Residents ED
7. Correction Captains Assoc AF
8. Correction Captains Assoc RWF
9. Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF
10. Council of Supervisors and Administrators AF
11. DC 37 AFSCME AF
12. DC 37 WF
13. DC 9 Painting Industry AF (Local 1969)
14. DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)
15. Detectives Endowment Assoc AF
16. Detectives Endowment Assoc CLRF
17. Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF
18. Detectives Endowment Assoc WF
19. Doctors Council AF
20. Doctors Council RWF
21. Doctors Council WF
22. Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF
23. House Staff Comm of Interns & Residents WF/Legal
24. Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF
25. Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF
26. Local 1 Plumbing Industry AF
27. Local 1180 CWA Members AF
28. Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM
29. Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF
30. Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal
31. Local 14 -14B IUOE WF/RWF
32. Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF
33. Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF/RWF
34. Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF
35. Local 246 SEIU NYC AF
36. Local 246 SEIU RWF
37. Local 246 SEIU WF
38. Local 3 IBEW Communications Electricians AF
39. Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF
40. Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF
41. Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF/RWF
42. Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers AF
43. Local 300 Civil Service Forum AF
44. Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF
45. Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF
46. Local 333 United Marine Division RWF
47. Local 333 United Marine Division WF
48. Local 371 Social Service Employees AF
49. Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM
50. Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF
51. Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF
52. Local 444 Sanitation Officers Supplemental AF
53. Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF
54. Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF
55. Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF
56. Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF
57. Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF
58. Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF
59. Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF
60. Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund
61. NYC DC of Carpenters AF
62. NYC DC of Carpenters WF/RWF
63. NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc AF
64. NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF
65. NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF
66. NYS Court Clerks Assoc RWF
67. NYS Court Officers Assoc RWF
68. Organization of Staff Analysts WF/RWF/ED
69. Pavers & Road Builders District Council WF
70. Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF
71. Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) WF/RWF/CLRF
72. Surrogates & Supreme Court Reporters Assoc RWF
73. United Probation Officers Assoc RWF
74. United Probation Officers Assoc WF

* The City of New York Procurement Policy Board Rules ("PPB") authorize the Comptroller to maintain a list of prequalified auditors. PPB rule §3-10(k) states: A Prequalified List of Auditors shall be maintained by the Comptroller in accordance with this section. An agency seeking to award an audit contract shall solicit only those suppliers that have been prequalified by the Comptroller." Directive #12 §5.23 states "Benefit Funds contract only with firms included on the Office of the Comptroller's prequalified list of CPAs." Comptroller's Prequalified CPA List as of June 18, 2015.

THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER

INTERNAL CONTROL AND ACCOUNTABILITY DIRECTIVES

**DIRECTIVE 12 - EMPLOYEE BENEFIT FUNDS - UNIFORM REPORTING AND
AUDITING REQUIREMENTS**

INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY

This Directive sets forth accounting, auditing and financial guidelines for employee and retiree Benefit Funds which receive contributions from the City of New York. It also establishes detailed information reporting requirements for the funds and their boards of trustees. All Benefit Funds that receive contributions from the City of New York are required to conform with this Directive's provisions.

The accounting, auditing and reporting requirements prescribed herein vary in accordance with the amount of funding the Benefit Fund receives from the City. Benefit Funds are divided into two funding level categories: those with New York City Contributions less than \$300,000 (Level I); and those with \$300,000 or more in New York City Contributions (Level II).

1.0 GENERAL INFORMATION

1.1 Organization

- 1.0 General Information
- 2.0 Definitions
- 3.0 General Guidelines and Requirements
- 4.0 Annual Reporting Requirements
- 5.0 Independent Annual Audit
- 6.0 Trustee Representation Letter
- 7.0 Federal ERISA Reporting Requirements
- 8.0 Annual Report to Fund Membership
- 9.0 Supporting Schedules
- 9.4 Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule

Exhibits:

- A - Administrative Expense Schedule
- B - Benefit Expense Schedule
- C - Key Ratio Schedule
- D - Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule

1.2 Effective Date

This directive is effective for Benefit Fund plan years beginning on or after July 1, 1997.

1.3 Notice

In reissuing this directive, the Office of the Comptroller has undertaken to clarify, whenever possible the prior version's text. In reissuing this directive, there is no intent to change the existing interpretation of any subject unless explicitly stated in the text.

1.4 Assistance

Requests for additional copies and questions concerning this Directive should be addressed to: Joseph Trapani, Chief, Bureau of Management and Accounting Systems, (669-8201), 1 Centre Street, Municipal Building, Room 1005, New York, NY 10007.

2.0 DEFINITIONS

The following define the key terms used in this Directive:

2.5 Benefit Fund

Benefit Funds consist of any welfare or annuity fund that receives contributions from the City of New York. Examples of Benefit Funds include supplemental health care, educational, legal benefit, annuity, and civil/legal representation funds. Benefit Funds may be for either active or retired New York City employees.

2.6 New York City Contribution

The New York City Contribution is the total of the direct payments the City of New York is required, pursuant to applicable collective bargaining agreements, to make to a Benefit Fund on behalf of relevant employees and retirees.

The City of New York, as used herein, is a reference to its constituent agencies which are defined in the Charter of The City of New York, Chapter 52, Section 1150, subdivision 2, as a city, county, borough, or other office, position, administration, department, division, bureau, board or commission, corporation, institution or agency of government, the expenses of which are paid in whole or in part from the City's treasury.

2.7 Benefit Expense

Benefit expenses, as used herein, are the direct costs of providing benefits. These costs include:

- Claims paid by the fund for self-insured benefits.
- Insurance premium payments less any retention charges.
- The cost of providing medical referral services.
- Salaries or other payments to:
 - Attorneys who provide direct legal services to members.
 - Instructors who conduct in-house training for members.
 - Physicians who examine members for workers' disability purposes.
 - Other professionals and consultants who provide services directly to members.

2.8 Administrative Expense

Administrative Expenses are all those costs that are not Benefit Expenses, including, but not limited to:

- Salaries and allowances for the fund's administrative support staff.
- Rents and other occupancy costs.
- Insurance policies for offices, equipment and other general business purposes.
- Fees paid to third party or fund administrators for administrative purposes.
- Miscellaneous fees and commissions.
- Insurance company retention charges.

2.9 Insurance Retention Charges

Insurance Retention Charges represent the portion of the insurance premiums retained by an insurance company to recover the administrative costs of handling benefit payments. Retention charges are applicable only to insured welfare plans.

3.0 GENERAL GUIDELINES AND REQUIREMENTS

3.10 Supplementary Benefit Agreements

The supplementary benefit agreements between the City of New York and the labor unions establish the Comptroller's authority to audit and request specific information from the Benefit Funds, and describe the Funds' underlying reporting responsibilities.

The agreements require, in part, that Benefit Funds maintain accurate records and books of account in conformance with generally accepted accounting principles, file annual trustees' statements with the Office of the Comptroller containing substantiation and other information that the Comptroller shall from time to time prescribe, as per individual Fund supplemental agreements, and obtain annual independent audits of their financial statements. The agreements also specify the Comptroller's right to audit all Benefit Fund expenditures.

The agreements also set forth conflict of interest guidelines. These guidelines provide that Benefit Funds, and all fund trustees, officers and employees are prohibited from directly or indirectly receiving, in connection with the solicitation, sale, service or administration of a Benefit Fund contract, any payment, commission, loan or other thing of value from any entity or individual; and that Benefit Fund trustees, officers or employees may not directly or indirectly receive any payment, commission, loan service or any other thing of value from the Benefit Fund, except that such person may receive employee benefits to which he or she is otherwise entitled, and reasonable compensation for necessary services and expenses rendered or incurred in connection with official duties.

Many of the financial, accounting, auditing and reporting guidelines in this directive replicate, or are derived from, supplementary benefit agreement terms and conditions.

3.11 Accounting Standards

Every Benefit Fund which receives New York City Contributions is required to maintain adequate books of account and related records that will enable it to prepare complete and auditable financial statements on an accrual basis of accounting in conformity with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles.

3.12 Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directives

It is recommended that all Benefit Funds for which the New York City Contribution is \$300,000 or greater (Level II Funds) comply, where applicable, with the Internal Control and Accountability Directives issued by the Office of the Comptroller.

3.13 Spending Guidelines

Benefit Funds should insure that New York City Contributions are spent appropriately and monitored carefully. This includes:

- Restricting their use only for expenditures and programs that directly or indirectly benefit fund members.
- Carefully controlling Administrative Expenses and insuring that they do not exceed a reasonable percentage of total Benefit Fund revenue.
- Insuring that spending for Benefit Fund employee salaries, fees paid to trustees and fees or commissions paid to professionals and service providers are not excessive or unreasonable in relation to the service or product received.

- Using competitive processes to the greatest degree practicable to procure goods and services.

In addition:

- Political and charitable contributions of any kind paid from the New York City Contribution or related investment earnings are prohibited.
- Payments on Benefit Fund contracts or other obligations generally must be made by check drawn on the fund payable directly to the creditor, beneficiary or obligee. Payments, that are not customarily paid by check, including, but not limited to, electronic transfers and imprest fund expenditures, are permissible.

3.14 Service Provider Assessments

The services rendered by consultants shall be assessed at least once every two years. The assessments shall be reported in the board's official minutes and attached to the trustees' representation letter.

It is further recommended, that the work of consultants and all individuals or organizations, with the exception of medical service providers, that are paid for services rendered on a fee or commission basis, be assessed each year with the results reported in the board's official minutes and attached to the trustees' representation letter.

3.15 Investment Policy and Procedures

3.15.1 Trustee Representation Letter

Level II Benefit Funds must attach a copy of their investment policy to the trustee representation letter along with the trustees' certification that the fund has complied with its policy and procedures.

3.15.2 Investment Policy Recommendation

To insure that idle monies are invested judiciously, appropriately safeguarded and accounted for fully, it is recommended that the board of trustees:

- Insure that the fund has a written investment policy which describes the permissible types of investments and the guidelines to be adhered to for each investment type. The policies and procedures should also cover, as appropriate, compliance with ERISA investment guidelines and any statutory or legal restrictions, collateralization, the use and selection of financial institutions such as depositories, custodians and trusts, and the use and selection of financial advisors.

- Conduct annual reviews of the fund's compliance with the investment policies and procedures.
- Insure that the investment policy and procedures are periodically reviewed and revised as necessary to reflect changes in available investment opportunities and market conditions.
- Establish a trustee investment committee, that includes the fund's chief fiscal officer, to oversee the investment function.
- Insure that internal accounting and procedural controls provide an environment which encourages adherence to the fund's investment policies and procedures. The internal controls should:
 - Separate the investment authorization and accounting functions.
 - Insure that investment transactions are fully recorded at an appropriate level of detail.
 - Mandate that all transactions are based on written authorizations.
 - Regularly report on all investment activity to Trustees.
 - Provide for the bonding of appropriate Benefit Fund staff.

3.16 Travel Policy

The board of trustees must establish a written travel policy which sets forth reasonable standards for all out-of-town travel and attendance at conferences, seminars and other events. In addition to establishing guidelines describing when, and for what purposes travel is appropriate, and expenditure limitations for transportation, lodging, meals and other expenses, the policy must require the board of trustees' advance authorization of all out-of-town travel.

3.16.3 Travel Policy Minimum Requirements

The travel policy, at a minimum, must:

- Prohibit first-class travel.
- Provide that reimbursement of expenses will be made only upon submission of a completed request with supporting documents attached.
- Require persons authorized to travel on Benefit Fund business to report to the board of trustees describing the benefits derived from the trip. The reports must be incorporated in the board's official minutes. It is recommended that the reports be in writing.

In addition, it is recommended that the travel policy:

- Place limitations on the number of individuals who attend, as well as the number of times individuals may travel each year for non-essential purposes such as attending general purpose training and educational courses, attending professional development, or industry conferences, or trade shows.
- Establish reasonable per diem rates such as the Federal General Services Administration's per diem rates, by locality, for normal daily travel expenditures.
- State that Level II funds comply with the Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directive 6, *Authorization, Reimbursement and Audit of Travel, Meals, Lodging and Miscellaneous Agency Expenses*.

3.16.4 Travel Reporting Requirements

A copy of the fund's travel policy must be attached to the trustee representation letter. In addition, a summary of all trustee/staff expenditures for conference attendance and out-of-town travel must be submitted annually as part of the trustee representation letter.

3.17 Cost and Expense Allocations

Benefit Funds that share premises with related or other entities will have common Administrative Expenses such as rent, utilities, general management and other general expenses. These costs should be allocated equitably for reporting and accountability purposes. The allocation must be made systematically, applied consistently from year-to-year, and must be reviewed annually. Staff salaries should be apportioned based on records which document the efforts devoted to each entity. An explanation of the fund's allocation methodologies must be attached to the trustee representation letter.

3.18 Competitive Proposals for Insured Benefits and Other Services

Contracts for insured benefits, except for basic medical and hospital augmentations negotiated with the same insurer, must be awarded using a competitive proposal process. Benefit Funds must solicit at least three firms with the appropriate size, experience and qualifications to provide such benefits or services. The board of trustees must prepare a certification for each benefit or service contract which states that a minimum of three proposals were solicited and discloses the date on which the fund solicited the proposals and the names of all companies solicited. The certification must be included in the board's official minutes and be attached to the trustee representation letter.

It is recommended that Benefit Funds, with the exception of medical service providers, use a similar competitive proposal process to choose third party administrators and all other professional service providers.

Additionally, funds should consider using the guidance provided in the City of New York Procurement Policy Board Rules and the Mayor's Office of Contracts' Rules Implementation Memoranda to assist in developing appropriate competitive proposal processes.

3.19 Comptroller's Audits

The fund's books, records and accounts, including the full minutes of the board of trustees' meetings, are subject to review and audit by the Office of the Comptroller.

4.0 ANNUAL REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

This Directive requires Benefit Funds to prepare and submit a number of reports, copies of documents and other materials to the Office of the Comptroller. All required filings must be submitted annually, no later than nine months after the close of the Benefit Funds' fiscal year.

4.20 Funding Levels Defined

Fund filing requirements vary according to the size of the New York City Contribution as indicated below:

- Level I - Benefit Funds for which New York City Contributions are less than \$300,000.
- Level II - Benefit Funds for which New York City Contributions are \$300,000 or more.

4.21 Reporting Requirements Summary

Subsequent sections of this Directive establish Benefit Fund reporting requirements which vary among the two funding levels. To assist boards of trustees and Benefit Funds, a synopsis of reporting responsibilities and requirements, by funding level, along with references to the appropriate sections of the Directive, is provided here:

Annual Independent Auditor's (CPA) Report

- 1) Statement of Net Assets Available for Benefits
- 2) Statement of Changes in Net Assets Avail. for Benefits
- 3) Footnotes to financial statements
- 4) Auditor's opinion on the financial statements
- 5) Administrative Expense Schedule
- 6) Benefit Expense Schedule

Auditor's Management Letter

Trustee Representation Letter

- a) Fund name, address, etc.
- b) Trustee names, addresses, etc.
- c) Fund administrator, name, address, etc.
- d) New York City Contribution
- e) Total Benefit Fund revenue
- f) Number of City employees/retirees
- g) Percent NYC employees to total fund enrollment
- h) Allocation methodologies
- i) Travel policy
- j) Trustee/staff travel report
- k) Payments to trustees
- l) Payments to top five officers/trustees/staff
- m) Fee/commission payments
- n) Benefit plan amendments
- o) Insurer changes
- p) IRS 5500, 5500c or 990
- q) Investment policies and procedures
- r) Audit contract

DIRECTIVE REFERENCE	LEVEL I	LEVEL II
5.0	Yes	Yes
5.3	Yes	Yes
5.3	Yes	Yes
5.3	Yes	Yes
5.4	Yes	Yes
5.3/9.1	Yes ¹	Yes
5.3/9.2	Yes ¹	Yes
5.7	Yes	Yes
6.0	No	Yes
6.1.1	No	Yes
6.1.2	No	Yes
6.1.3	No	Yes
6.1.4	No	Yes
6.1.5	No	Yes
6.1.6	No	Yes
6.1.7	No	Yes
3.8/6.1.8	No	Yes
3.7/6.1.9	No	Yes
3.7.2/6.1.10	No	Yes
6.1.11	No	Yes
6.1.12	No	Yes
3.5/3.9/6.1.13	No	Yes
6.1.14	No	Yes
6.1.15	No	Yes
7.0/6.1.16	No	Yes
3.6/6.1.17	No	Yes
5.5/6.1.18	No	Yes

¹ Fund must provide schedule, however, independent audit is at the fund's option.

ERISA Reports 5500 & 5500C (If filed)

Level I Fund addendum

Annual Membership Report

Exhibits

A - Administrative Expense Schedule

B - Benefit Expense Schedule

C - Key Ratios Schedule

D - Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule

DIRECTIVE REFERENCE	LEVEL I	LEVEL II
7.0/6.1.16	Yes	Yes
7.0	Yes	No
8.0	Yes	Yes
9.1	Yes ¹	Yes
9.2	Yes ¹	Yes
9.3	Yes	Yes
9.4	Yes	Yes

4.22 Filing Address

All filings required by the Directive must be submitted to:

Ms. Auldith Abraham
The City of New York
Office of the Comptroller
Bureau of Audit
1 Centre Street, 11th Floor, Room 1117 North
New York, NY 10007
(212) 669-8048

Directive12@comptroller.nyc.gov

5.0 INDEPENDENT ANNUAL AUDITS

All Benefit Funds must prepare annual financial statements in accordance with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles (GAAP). Each year's financial statements must be audited annually by independent Certified Public Accountants (CPA).

5.23 Auditor Selection

It is strongly recommended that independent certified public accountants be selected through the use of a competitive proposal process. Requests for proposals should be sent to at least three firms with the appropriate size, experience and qualifications to perform the audit. Requests for proposals should incorporate a copy of this directive.

In addition, it is recommended that:

- The audit selection process be completed no later than 60 days after the beginning of the Benefit Fund's calendar or fiscal year. Timeliness in engaging CPAs is important to insure that there is no break in continuity in the auditing process and, if necessary, to facilitate the transfer of information from one firm to its successor.
- Benefit Funds contract only with firms included on the Office of the Comptroller's prequalified list of CPAs. A copy of the list may be obtained from the filing address listed in §4.3 above.

5.24 Audit Standards

The audit must be conducted in accordance with generally accepted auditing standards (GAAS) as promulgated by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants.

5.25 Audit Scope

The scope of the independent audit for all Benefit Funds must include the following:

- (1) Statement of net assets available for benefits
- (2) Statement of changes in net assets available for benefits
- (3) Footnotes to financial statements

Funds where City contributions are \$300,000 or greater (Level II) are additionally required to provide an Administrative Expense Schedule (Exhibit A) and Benefit Expense Schedule (Exhibit B) which have been audited as part of the independent audit of the basic financial statements.

5.26 Audit Opinion

The auditor's opinion must state whether the financial statements are presented fairly in accordance with generally accepted accounting principles.

5.27 Audit Contract

It is strongly recommended that audit contracts not exceed four years in length. After four years, a new request for proposals should be issued. Additionally, for Level II funds, if the same firm is awarded the contract in a subsequent four year period, the audit firm should be required to assign a different senior manager and partner-in-charge. Benefit funds are strongly encouraged not to award contracts to the same firm for more than two consecutive four-year periods.

The audit contract must require that the audit report be issued within nine months after the close of the fund's calendar or fiscal year and must incorporate procedures, established by the Comptroller, for the Comptroller's audit of the fund. Additionally, for Level II funds, a copy of the audit contract must be attached to the trustee representation letter, and must specify that the audit work papers are subject to review by the Comptroller's Office.

5.28 Peer Review

The independent auditor must provide the Benefit Fund with copies of any peer reviews performed in accordance with the AICPA's guidelines. The Benefit Fund should use the peer reviews as part of their evaluation in selecting an independent auditor.

5.29 Management Letter

Audit contract terms must include a requirement that the auditor issue a management letter when, in the CPA's professional judgment and as per AICPA guidelines, one is merited. The management letter must comment on any material weaknesses or reportable conditions in any of the five elements which make up the Benefit Fund's internal control structure: control environment, risk assessment, information and communication, control activities and monitoring. When appropriate, the management letter should contain recommendations to fund management on how to improve the noted conditions.

In gaining an understanding of the funds internal control structure, the auditor should take special note of the following areas:

- Adequacy of expenditure documentation and approval processes.
- Expense allocations for Benefit Funds that share their premises with other organizations.
- The adequacy and propriety of the fund's investment policies and procedures and of the fund's compliance with them.
- Competitive procurement practices.
- Staff utilization including the reasonableness of staffing in relation to workload requirements.
- All other matters that the auditors consider appropriate for disclosure to the trustees.

If the independent auditors conclude that there are no material weaknesses, the management letter should so indicate.

6.0 TRUSTEE REPRESENTATION LETTER

The boards of trustees of Level II funds must submit a trustee representation letter to the Comptroller annually which summarizes the Benefit Fund's management policies and activities and provides key information about the fund's operation. The trustee representation letter must be signed by all of the fund's trustees and must include an affirmation that, under the penalties for perjury, in accordance with the supplemental agreement, the report is a true and accurate reflection of management's policies and the state of the fund's affairs for the reporting period.

Level I funds have abbreviated requirements which are described in §7.0.

6.30 Trustee Representation Letter Requirements

The trustee representation letter must contain:

- 6.30.5 The Benefit Fund's name, address and telephone number.
- 6.30.6 The names and business addresses of all board of trustee members.
- 6.30.7 The fund administrator's name, address, and telephone number.
- 6.30.8 The total amount of New York City Contributions for the fund's fiscal or calendar year.
- 6.30.9 Total Benefit Fund revenue from all sources.
- 6.30.10 The number of City employee and retiree members at year end.
- 6.30.11 The number of City employees or retirees expressed as a percentage of the total number of covered Benefit Fund members.
- 6.30.12 For Benefit Funds that share premises, staff or other expenses with related or other entities, a description of all cost or expense allocation formulas, including an explanation of the allocation methodology and the basis for distribution. (§3.8.)
- 6.30.13 A copy of the fund's travel policy. (§3.7)
- 6.30.14 A summary of all expenditures for out-of-town travel and attendance at conferences for trustees and staff. The summary should include the name and position of the traveler/attendee, the dates of travel, the destination, the reason for the trip and the total expenditure. (§3.7)
- 6.30.15 A listing of all amounts paid to any trustee and a description of the work or services rendered.

- 6.30.16 A statement disclosing the total remuneration for the five most highly paid individuals from among trustees, officers and staff.
- 6.30.17 The identification of all individuals or organizations paid on a fee or commission basis, including administrators, investment managers, attorneys, accountants and other professional service providers. For each individual or organization, the provider's name and address, a description of the relationship, the fees paid and, if applicable, the amount of funds held or managed must be provided.
- For consultants, a copy of the official board minutes authorizing the hiring of each consultant and the trustees' biennial assessment of the consultants' performance. (§3.5)
- For insured benefit contracts, certification of the competitive selection process as described in §3.9.
- 6.30.18 If any amendments were made to the benefit plan during the year, a copy of the new benefit booklet or other member notification. If there were no changes the representation letter must state so.
- 6.30.19 If any benefits were changed from third party insured to self-insured or vice-versa during the year, the reasons for the change, including a detailed explanation of the advantages and any expected cost savings.
- 6.30.20 If required to file with the IRS, a copy of IRS Form 5500 or 5500C (or IRS Form 990).
- 6.30.21 A copy of the Benefit Fund's investment policy and procedures and the certification described in §3.6.1.
- 6.30.22 A copy of the independent audit contract. (§5.5)

6.31 Substitution of Statements or Filings

Funds may, in lieu of any specific requirement in §6.1 above, substitute copies of statements or filings made pursuant to State or Federal Law. Each substitution must be clearly referenced to its corresponding requirement in §6.1.

7.0 FEDERAL ERISA REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

Funds may choose to comply with the Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974's (ERISA) reporting guidelines for Benefit Fund expenditures and activities. ERISA requires that certain Benefit Funds, depending on membership size, file Internal Revenue Service Forms 5500 or 5500C. Funds choosing to comply with ERISA and which are required, under ERISA, to file 5500

or 5500C should provide an information copy to the Comptroller's Office with the trustee representation letter. At the Fund's discretion, a copy of IRS Tax Form 990 filing may be submitted, to the Comptroller's Office, instead of Forms 5500 or 5500C.

Funds with New York City Contributions under \$300,000, (Level I) must attach an addendum to the Comptroller's copy of Form 5500 or 5500C (or Form 990) with the following information:

- The number of City employee members and retirees at year-end.
- Total New York City Contributions for the year.
- Amendments to benefits. If amendments were made, a copy of the new benefit booklet or other membership notification. If there were no amendments, a statement to that effect.

8.0 ANNUAL REPORT TO FUND MEMBERSHIP

Each fund is required to issue an annual report to its membership. A copy of the annual report, with cover letter, must be sent to each member of the fund and be filed with the Office of the Comptroller. The annual report must advise the membership of the financial condition and operations of the fund and advise the membership of significant changes and other important matters. At a minimum, the annual report must include a copy or a condensed version of the most recent independently audited financial statements. This requirement may be fulfilled by publishing the cover letter and report in a fund authorized publication provided that the publication is mailed to each member individually.

9.0 SUPPORTING SCHEDULE REQUIREMENTS

All Benefit Funds are required to provide the following supporting schedules:

9.32 Administrative Expense Schedule

This schedule compares the Benefit Fund's Administrative Expenses for the last two fiscal years, however, three fiscal years of comparable data is required for any year that the result of the Benefit Fund's operations shows a deficit that exceeds five times the fund balance. The format is provided in Exhibit A. A narrative must also be provided by the board of trustees as an attachment, explaining any adverse trends from year to year, or any expense fluctuations in excess of plus or minus fifteen percent from the prior year. This schedule also requires the computation of Administrative Expenses as a percentage of total Benefit Fund revenue.

Benefit Funds with New York City Contributions under \$300,000 (Level I) must attach this schedule to the Comptroller's copy of the ERISA reporting described in Section 7.0. All other funds (Level II) must have this schedule independently audited and included as part of the annual audit report.

9.33 Benefit Expense Schedule

This schedule requests specific information for each benefit provided by the fund. The format is provided in Exhibit B.

Benefit Funds with New York City Contributions under \$300,000 (Level I) must attach this schedule to the Comptroller's copy of the ERISA reporting described in §7.0. All other funds (Level II) must have this schedule independently audited and included as part of the annual audit report submission.

9.34 Key Ratio Schedule

The Key Ratio Schedule requests the comparative analysis of certain Benefit Fund financial indicators for each of the last two years. The format is provided in Exhibit C. Each fund (Levels I and II) must submit this analysis as part of its annual reporting submission, due no later than nine months after the close of its fiscal year.

**THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER**

**INTERNAL CONTROL AND
ACCOUNTABILITY DIRECTIVE 12 SUPPLEMENT**

**FOR FUNDS NOT ESTABLISHED AND MAINTAINED BY
MUNICIPAL LABOR COMMITTEE UNIONS**

This supplement adds Section 9.4, *Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule*, to Section 9.0 of Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directive #12 which was issued on February 28, 1997.

The benefit funds established and maintained by Municipal Labor Committee (MLC) unions pursuant to collective bargaining agreements with the City of New York, have agreed to provide this supplemental information in a separate submission to the Comptroller's Office. All other funds must submit it as part of the annual reporting requirements described in Section 4.0 of the directive.

9.4 Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule

The Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule requires funds to provide:

The number of covered New York City employee and retiree members at year end.

The number of employee and retiree members for each of the fund's five largest non-City contributors at year end.

The number of trustee and/or benefit fund employee members at year end.

The employee and/or retiree member contribution rate for each of the fund's five largest non-City contributors and for the trustees and/or benefit funds.

The format is provided in Exhibit D. Each fund (Level I and II) must submit this analysis as part of its annual reporting submission, due no later than nine months after the close of its fiscal year.

ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSE SCHEDULE

DESCRIPTION	1993*	1994	1995
Salaries			
% of total Administrative Expense			
Fringe Benefits			
Investment and Custodial Services			
Legal			
Accountant			
Fees and Commissions - Other			
Rent			
Travel and Conference			
Telephone			
Insurance Retention Charges			
Office Equipment and Rental			
Stationery, Printing, Postage, Office Supplies			
Insurance			
Repairs & Maintenance			
Others (Please Describe):			
Total Administrative Expense			
Total Benefit Fund Revenue			
% Administrative/Revenue			

* Required if Fund has a current year's operating deficit in excess of five times its fund balance.

EXPLANATION OF EXPENSE CATEGORIES

EXPENSE CATEGORY	EXPENSES INCLUDED
Salaries	Salaries, Payroll Taxes, Employment Agency Fees
Fringe Benefits	Employee Fringe Benefits and Severance Pay
Investment and Custodial Services	Investment Management and Custodial Services
Legal	Attorney Fees
Accounting	Accountant Fees
Fees and Commissions - Other	Consulting, Third Party Administrators (e.g. Claims Processing), Communications and Publicity, Security, Actuary, Computer Software Design
Rent	Rent, Utilities, Storage, Building and Moving Expenses
Travel and Conference	Trustee Allowances, Meeting Expenses, Dues, Subscriptions, Awards, Auto Expenses
Telephone	Telephone and Telegrams
Insurance Retention Charges	Insurance Company Administrative Charge to handle benefit payments
Office Equipment and Rental	Depreciation, Amortization, Computer Hardware, Furniture and Equipment
Stationery, Printing, Postage, Office Supplies	Publications, Advertising, Messenger, Petty Cash, Microfilm, Records, Photocopy, Computer Supplies
Insurance	Fiduciary Liability, Bonding, Office Insurance
Repairs and Maintenance	Office Cleaning, Repairs and Maintenance
Other	Any other expense that does not fall in above categories. Each expense must be listed separately and described.

BENEFIT EXPENSE SCHEDULE

BENEFIT	DESCRIPTION	IS BENEFIT INSURED/SELF- INSURED	COST OF BENEFIT FOR YEAR	BENEFIT COVERAGE *

* Use key numbers below to indicate coverage categories

- 1. Member
- 2. Spouse
- 3. Children

**BENEFIT FUND
KEY RATIO SCHEDULE**

	1994	1995
Total Revenue		
Administrative Expense		
% of Revenue		
Benefit Expense		
% of Revenue		
Total Expense		
Net Surplus/(Deficit)		
Fund Balance Year-End		
% of Total Revenue		

Exhibit D

MULTI-EMPLOYER ANALYSIS SCHEDULE

Reporting Year _____		
EMPLOYERS	NUMBER OF EMPLOYEE AND/OR RETIREE MEMBERS	CONTRIBUTION PER EMPLOYEE AND/OR RETIREE
New York City		
Five Largest Non-City Contributors: (enter name)		
1)		
2)		
3)		
4)		
5)		
Benefit Fund/Trustee		

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUNDS

<u>AREA</u>	<u>UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE</u>
Benefit processing system	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Funds do not verify eligibility of employees' dependents. Documentation, such as marriage or birth certificates, is not reviewed before processing benefits for members' dependents.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Funds do not always check the eligibility database before processing benefit claims.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Funds paid benefits not in accordance with guidelines.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Funds pay claims without obtaining the proper documentation.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Funds improperly delay eligibility.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Benefit payments are made without being reviewed and approved by an individual other than the claims processor.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Coordination of benefits provisions are not properly applied.
Benefit administration	Funds do not maintain sufficient information concerning members' usage of benefits such as legal services and are therefore unable to assess the prudence of continuing to provide such benefits.
Allocation of common expenses	<p>Expenses are allocated between funds and related entities without:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Funds establishing a reasonable basis for the allocation (i.e. contribution rate, number of participants, actual usage). - Funds maintaining supporting documentation that substantiates the percentage of expenses allocated.
Documentation for expenses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Amounts expended by Funds do not have supporting documentation such as approved vouchers, bills and receipts.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Questionable expenses charged to fund.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Benefit expenses were not recorded by the Fund.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Payment to consultants did not specify service rendered, amount, method of compensation or period covered.

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUNDS

<u>AREA</u>	<u>UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE</u>
Travel and conference expenses	<p>Funds do not follow the following guidelines:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number of conference attendees is not kept to an absolute minimum. - Airfares or group rates are not paid directly to the sponsoring organization, or to the airlines or hotels. Reimbursements to trustees are made without adequate documentation. - Coach airfare or group rates are not used. - Reimbursements are made for personal expenditures (flowers, entertainment, etc.) - Meal advances are not limited. - Reimbursement for local transportation and meals are made despite failure to present properly documented expense vouchers. - Persons attending conferences do not submit written reports on the sessions they attended. - Summary reports were not discussed or recorded at Board of Trustees meetings. - Fund per diem expenses for trustees exceeded IRS guidelines. - Fund officials routinely have business lunches during the day with staff.
Payments to trustees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Trustees received fixed monthly allowances.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Trustees did not submit documentation for such allowances.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Insufficient guidelines for paying trustees for performing fund work.
Written contracts	<p>Funds do not maintain written contracts or agreements with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consultants - Accountants - Attorneys

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUNDS

<u>AREA</u>	<u>UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE</u>
Competitive bidding for professional services	<p>Funds do not competitively bid or consider alternative and benefit services providers for the following types of professional services:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consultants (actuary, computer, investments) - Attorneys - Fiduciary liability and bonding insurance - Third party benefit administrators
Retention charges for insured benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The funds do not have a formal package of all the solicitation materials including a complete description of benefits, estimated retentions, and all conditions which the successful bidder must meet. - The person responsible for preparing bid specifications and/or compiling experience data needed for the formal bid solicitation is an independent consultant, dependent on commissions for compensation. - Retention charges, expressed as percentage of premiums are higher than the limits established by the NYS Insurance Department. - Commissions expressed as a percentage of premiums are higher than guidelines established by the NYS Insurance Department.
Internal Controls	<p>Funds do not maintain an adequate set of accounting records, including the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - General Ledger - Cash disbursements journal - Cash receipts journal <p>Funds do not:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Stamp paid on all vouchers (indicating date and check number) - Segregate incompatible duties between personnel - Prohibit writing checks to cash or bearer

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUNDS

<u>AREA</u>	<u>UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE</u>
Significant Operating Deficits	- Substantial operating deficits have exhausted the fund's reserve.
	- Funds maintain inadequate level of reserves.
High Administrative Expenses	A significant larger percentage of total revenue was spent on administrative expenses, in comparison to other similar funds.
Postretirement benefits	The Funds financial statements do not present the Plan's obligation to provide health and welfare benefits to participants after retirements (postretirement benefit obligations) as required by generally accepted accounting principles. The effects of the omission of postretirement benefit obligation information of the Plan's financial statements are presumed to be material.
Other	- Cost savings analyses are not performed prior to major purchases (i.e. computer).
	- Work logs are not maintained by professionals to determine actual work performed and time spent.

**Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2015**

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
C 84-202	Allied Building Inspectors Local 211 – International Union of Operating Engineers Welfare Fund	12/14/84
C 83-203	Local 144 Civil Service Division Welfare Fund	01/14/85
C 83-208	Parking Enforcement Agents Local 1182 Security Benefits Fund	03/12/85
C 84-204	New York City Local 246 Service Employees International Union Welfare Fund	04/19/85
C 85-203	Local 300 Service Employees International Union Civil Service Forum Employees Welfare Fund	02/27/86
C 85-202	Correction Officers' Benevolent Association, Inc. Security Benefits Fund	04/07/86
C 85-207	Correction Captains Association Security Benefits Fund	06/25/86
C 83-206	House Staff Benefits Plan of the Committee of Interns and Residents	07/25/86
C 86-202	Superior Officers Council of the New York City Police Department Retiree Health and Welfare Fund	10/03/86
C 86-201	Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association Retirees Welfare Fund Local 831	10/15/86
C 86-203	New York State Court Clerk's Association Retirees Security Benefits Fund	10/22/86
C 86-204	Uniformed Fire Officers Association - Retired Fire Officers Family Protection Plan Local 854	11/18/86
C 86-205	Local 858 International Brotherhood of Teamsters, OTB Branch Office Managers Welfare Fund	05/05/87
C 85-206	Security Benefit Fund Local 832 International Brotherhood of Teamsters	05/08/87
C 86-208	Doctors Council Welfare Fund	08/11/87
C 86-213	Local 721 Licensed Practical Nurses Welfare Fund	11/20/87
C 87-202	Health Benefits Fund and the Retiree's Health and Welfare Fund of the Detectives Endowment Association	05/11/88
C 88-200	Patrolmen's Benevolent Association of the City of New York Retiree Health and Welfare Fund	06/06/88

**Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2015**

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
C 88-203	Local 1182 CWA Parking Enforcement Agents Welfare Fund	09/22/88
C 87-203	Professional Staff Congress - CUNY Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds	10/13/88
C 88-205	Civil Service Bar Association Welfare Fund	10/19/88
C 88-201	Local 333 United Marine Division Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds	01/12/89
C 88-207A2	Housing Patrolmen's Benevolent Association Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds - Legal Services	04/06/89
C 88-204	Local 444 Sanitation Officers Association Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds	04/20/89
C 88-207B	Housing Patrolmen's Benevolent Association Welfare, Retiree Welfare and Annuity Funds	06/30/89
C 89-205	Correction Officers Benevolent Association Annuity Fund	03/28/90
C 89-203	Local 1180 Communication Workers of America Security Benefits and Education Funds - Benefit Expenditures	04/27/90
C 90-205	NYC Retirees Welfare Fund	06/14/90
C 90-207	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Family Protection Plan	06/18/90
C 90-202	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Administrative, Welfare, Legal Services and Education Funds	06/28/90
C 90-203	Local 211 International Union of Operating Engineers Allied Building Inspectors Welfare Fund	06/28/90
C 90-209	Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF	05/06/91
C 90-210	Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc. RWF	05/04/91
C 90-211	Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Administrators WF	01/23/91
S 91-02	United Probation Officers Association Welfare and Retirement Welfare Fund	10/22/91
7I 93-099	System Audit Report on the General Controls for the Health and Welfare Applications of the Patrolmen's Benevolent Association Health and Welfare Fund	08/30/94
4D 93-050	Patrolmen's Benevolent Association Health and Welfare Fund (Including the Civil Legal Representation Fund)	09/02/94

Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2015

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
FL95-129A	Financial & Operating Practices of the NYC Transit Police Officers Security Benefit Fund	06/20/95
FL95-130A	Financial & Operating Practices of Local 858 - International Brotherhood of Teamsters	06/09/95
FR95-068A	CUNY Faculty Welfare Fund for Retirees Under Agreement No. 3080 7/1/93 - 12/31/93	01/10/95
FR95-115A	The NYC Board of Education United Federation of Teachers (UFT) Welfare Fund Payments Under Agreement (#132)	03/01/95
FR96-059A	NYC Police Department Welfare Fund Payments for Active Employees Covered Under Agreements #A-2145 and #A-2146 - July 1, 1994 to April 7, 1995	12/29/95
FL96-058A	Financial and Operating Practices of the Parking Enforcement Agents Local 1182 Communication Workers of America Security Benefits Fund	06/10/96
FL96-153A	Doctor's Council Welfare Fund	06/20/96
FL96-178A	Fraudulent Claims Paid by the Doctors Council Welfare Fund	06/27/96
FL96-161A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Local 144 Civil Service Division Welfare Fund July 1, 1993 to June 30, 1994	04/07/97
FL97-077A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Operating Engineers, Local 30 A-C Municipal Employees Welfare Fund - July 1, 1994 to June 30, 1995	05/08/97
FR97-128A	Audit Report on the NYC Finance Department Welfare Fund Payments for Active Employees Covered Under Agreements #A-3412 and #A-3412-1 for the Period from July 1, 1995, to July 26, 1996	06/24/97
FR98-082F	follow-up Audit Report on the NYC Office of Labor Relations Welfare Fund Retirees Benefit Payments Under Agreements A-1 Through A-127 for the Period March 1996 - August 1996	04/14/98
FR98-083A	Audit Report on Payments Made to Various Welfare Benefit Funds by the New York City Board of Education, for Active Employees and Retirees, for the Period September 1, 1996 to August 31, 1997	06/22/98
FR98-100A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of Local 832 International Brotherhood of Teamsters Security Benefits Fund January 1, 1996 to December 31, 1996	06/24/98

**Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2015**

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
FL98-101A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of Local 300 Service Employees International Union Civil Service Forum Retiree Welfare Fund July 1, 1994 - June 30, 1995	06/03/98
FL98-090A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of Local 1183 Board of Elections Communication Workers of America Welfare Fund October 1, 1994 - September 30, 1995	06/09/98
FL98-143A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of Local 1183 Board of Elections Communication Workers of America Retiree Fund October 1, 1994 - September 30, 1995	06/09/98
FL98-194Ab	Audit Report on District Council 37 Benefits Fund Trust and Affiliated Funds' Data Processing Preparation for the Year 2000	03/03/99
FL99-161A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of District Council 37 Education Fund July 1, 1996 – June 30, 1997	06/30/99
FL00-074A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Retirees Welfare Fund January 1, 1998 – December 31, 1998	06/05/00
FL00-075A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Welfare Fund January 1, 1998 – December 31, 1998	06/05/00
FL99-162A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of District Council 37 Health and Security Plan Trust July 1, 1996 – June 30, 1997	06/12/00
FL00-165A	District Council 37 Benefits Fund Trust	12/22/00
FM00-178A	International Union of Operating Engineers Local 891 Welfare Fund	01/26/01
FL01-095A	Doctor Council Welfare Fund	03/02/01
FL01-094A	Doctors Council Retiree Welfare Fund	03/02/01
FR01-170A	House Staff Benefits Plan and Legal Services Plan of the Committee of Interns and Residents	06/26/01

**Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2015**

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
FL01-085F	Board of Elections Local 1183 Communication Workers of America Retiree Fund	06/22/01
FL01-084F	Board of Elections Local 1183 Communication Workers of America Welfare Fund	06/22/01
FL02-083A	Communication Workers Association Local 1182 Security Benefits Fund	04/12/02
FL02-085A	Detectives Endowment Association Health Benefit Fund-Active Employees	04/23/02
FL02-086A	Detectives Endowment Association Health Benefit Fund-Retirees	04/26/02
FL03-087A	Local 300 SEIU Civil Service Forum Welfare Fund	06/10/03
FL03-088A	Local 300 SEIU Civil Service Forum Retired Employees Welfare Fund	06/10/03
FL03-086A	Sergeant Benevolent Association Health and Welfare Fund	06/30/03
FL03-151A	Local 444 Sanitation Officers Security Benefit Fund	06/30/03
FL04-093A	Local 721 Licensed Practical Nurses Welfare Fund	06/30/04
FL04-094A	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Family Protection Plan	06/30/04
FL04-095A	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Retired Fire Officers Family Protection Plan	06/30/04
FL05-088A	Municipal Employees Welfare Fund of the International Union of Operating Engineers Local Union 15, 15A and 15C	03/29/06
FL05-090A	Local 333 Insurance Fund for New York City Employees	06/26/07
FL05-091A	Local 333 Retirement Insurance Fund for New York City Retirees	06/26/07
FL08-076A	Uniformed Probation Officers Association Welfare Fund	06/30/09
FL08-077A	Uniformed Probation Officers Association Retirement Welfare Fund	06/30/09
FL09-099A	Superior Officers Council Health & Welfare Fund Of the New York City Police Department	09/30/09
FL09-100A	Superior Officers Council Retiree Health & Welfare Fund of the New York City Police Department	09/30/09

**Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2015**

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
FK07-104A	Municipal Employees Welfare Trust Fund of the International Union of Operating Engineers Local 30	12/22/09
FK07-105A	Municipal Retired Employees Welfare Trust Fund of the International Union of Operating Engineers Local 30	12/22/09
FL10-123A	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Welfare Fund	04/29/11
FL10-124A	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Administrative Fund	04/29/11
FL10-125A	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Legal Services Fund and Educational Fund	04/29/11

**2012 AUDITING AND LEGAL COUNSEL FIRMS
USED BY MULTIPLE FUNDS**

TYPE OF SERVICE:

AUDITING

FUNDS

<p align="center">Andrew L. Hult CPA, PLLC</p>	<p>Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc AF Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF Superior Officers Council (Police) AF Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF Superior Officers Council (Police) WF/CLRF</p>
<p align="center">Armao, Costa & Ricciardi, CPA PC</p>	<p>Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF</p>
<p align="center">Bollam, Sheedy, Torani & Co, LLP</p>	<p>Local 237 Teamsters AF Local 237 Teamsters RWF Local 237 Teamsters WF New York State Nurses Assoc WF Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF</p>
<p align="center">Buchbinder Tunick & Company LLP</p>	<p>Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc AF Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF Local 891 (IUOE) AF Local 891 School Custodian & Engineers WF/RWF/ED</p>
<p align="center">Deodat S. Singh CPA PC</p>	<p>Doctors Council AF Doctors Council RWF Doctors Council WF</p>
<p align="center">Ernst & Young LLP</p>	<p>Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF</p>
<p align="center">Furman & Hauswirth CPAs</p>	<p>Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) WF/RWF/CLRF</p>

2012 AUDITING AND LEGAL COUNSEL FIRMS USED BY MULTIPLE FUNDS

TYPE OF SERVICE:

AUDITING

FUNDS

Gould, Kobrick & Schlapp, PC CPAs	1199 SEIU Licensed Practical Nurses WF Civil Service Bar Assoc AF Civil Service Bar Assoc WF Correction Captains Assoc AF Correction Captains Assoc RWF Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF Council of Supervisors and Administrators AF Detectives Endowment Assoc AF Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF Detectives Endowment Assoc WF Local 1180 CWA Members AF Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal Local 3 IBEW Communications Electricians AF Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF Local 300 Civil Service Forum AF Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF Local 333 United Marine Division RWF Local 333 United Marine Division WF Local 371 Social Service Employees AF Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM Organization of Staff Analysts WF United Probation Officers Assoc RWF United Probation Officers Assoc WF
Irving Kratz	Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF

**2012 AUDITING AND LEGAL COUNSEL FIRMS
USED BY MULTIPLE FUNDS**

**TYPE OF SERVICE:
AUDITING**

FUNDS

Loozis & Wegener, CPAs	NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc AF NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF
Novak Francella LLC	DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969) Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF/RWF Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers AF
Peter DeCarlo, CPA PLLC	Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF
Rocco J. Ricciardi CPA	Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens AF Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF Local 444 Sanitation Officers Supplemental AF Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF
Sacco Manfre CPA PLLC	DC 37 AFSCME AF DC 37 WF
Schultheis & Panettieri, LLP	Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF Local 14 –14B IUOE WF/RWF
Steinberg, Steckler & Picciurro, CPAs	Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF Local 306 Municipal Employees WF New York City RWF NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF
Tarlow & Co., CPAs	Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF
Wendel-Walowitz, LLC	Local 246 SEIU RWF Local 246 SEIU NYC AF Local 246 SEIU WF

**2012 AUDITING AND LEGAL COUNSEL FIRMS
USED BY MULTIPLE FUNDS**

**TYPE OF SERVICE:
LEGAL COUNSEL**

FUNDS

Barnes, Iaccarino & Shepherd, LLP	Local 333 United Marine Division RWF Local 333 United Marine Division WF Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF/RWF Local 1182 CWA Security Benefits Fund WF/RWF/Legal
Brady, McGuire & Steinberg, PC	Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni Engineers AF Local 15, 15A, 15C Operating Engineers WF
Bruce K. Bryant	Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin RWF Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin WF
Greenberg Burzichelli Greenberg PC	Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF/RWF Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers AF
Holm & O'Hara, LLP	Civil Service Bar Assoc AF Civil Service Bar Assoc WF Correction Captains Assoc AF Correction Captains Assoc RWF Correction Captains Assoc WF/CLRF Local 3 IBEW Communications Electricians AF Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF
Lichten & Bright	United Probation Officers Assoc RWF United Probation Officers Assoc WF
Meyer, Suozzi, English & Klein, PC	Council of Supervisors and Administrators AF Local 246 SEIU NYC AF Local 246 SEIU RWF Local 246 SEIU WF
Michael T. Murray, PC	Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc AF Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF

**2012 AUDITING AND LEGAL COUNSEL FIRMS
USED BY MULTIPLE FUNDS**

**TYPE OF SERVICE:
LEGAL COUNSEL**

FUNDS

Mirkin & Gordon, PC	Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens AF Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF Detectives Endowment Assoc AF Detectives Endowment Assoc RWF Detectives Endowment Assoc WF Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF/RWF Local 300 Civil Service Forum AF Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF Local 371 Social Service Employees AF Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/ED/Legal/ADM Local 891 School Custodian & Engineers WF/RWF/ED Local 891(IUOE) AF Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF Superior Officers Council (Police) WF/CLRF
Mitchel B. Craner	NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF
O'Dwyer & Bernstein, LLP	Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) AF Sergeants Benevolent Assoc (Police) WF/RWF/CLRF
Pryor, Cashman, Sherman & Flynn	Doctors Council AF Doctors Council RWF Doctors Council WF
Ronald Sheckman, et al/Pryor Cashman LLP	Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc AF Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc RWF Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF
Spivak Lipton, LLP	Local 1180 CWA Members AF Local 1180 CWA Municipal Mgt WF/RWF/Legal/ED/ADM Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF
Stroock & Stroock & Lavan, LLP	Local 237 Teamsters AF Local 237 Teamsters RWF Local 237 Teamsters WF Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF
Sullivan, Papain, Block, McGrath & Cannavo, PC	Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc AF Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc WF
Taubman Kimelman & Soroka, LLP	Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF Local 444 Sanitation Officers AF Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF