



City of New York

OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER

Scott M. Stringer
COMPTROLLER



AUDITS & SPECIAL REPORTS

Marjorie Landa

Deputy Comptroller for Audit

Audit Report on the Department of
Parks and Recreation's Monitoring of Its
Employees Who Use E-ZPasses and
Parking Permits While Driving City-
Owned or Personally-Owned Vehicles
on City Business

SZ17-061A

June 6, 2017

<http://comptroller.nyc.gov>



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER
SCOTT M. STRINGER

June 6, 2017

To the Residents of the City of New York:

My office has audited the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation (Parks) to determine whether Parks effectively monitors its employees who use City-provided E-ZPasses and parking permits while driving City-owned or personally-owned vehicles on City business in accordance with applicable rules and regulations.

Parks' fleet consists of 2,943 vehicles, including 156 forestry vehicles, 108 packers, and 92 beach terrain vehicles. As of March 2017, Parks had 7,646 employees, including Park Rangers, supervisors, recreation employees and life guards, and an operating budget of \$548 million. Parks has authorized 5,303 employees to use agency vehicles and E-ZPasses issued by the Metropolitan Transportation Authority for City business. In Fiscal Year 2016, Parks spent approximately \$1.2 million for E-ZPass usage.

The audit found that Parks properly monitors the use of E-ZPasses by its authorized drivers in accordance with applicable rules and regulations. Parks maintains the logs or trip tickets detailing agency E-ZPass usage as required by the City's and Parks' policies and procedures, and keeps accurate track of its E-ZPass tags. In addition, we found that Parks was not using any vehicles on the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) recall list. However, we found that Parks does not properly enforce the City's requirements for issuing agency parking permits.

The report recommends that Parks should continue to properly monitor and track its E-ZPass usage and recoup funds for any personal usage, as required by the City of New York's *City Vehicle Driver Handbook*. Parks should also ensure that all agency-issued parking permit requests are filled out properly, indicating the specific agency business use, and that Parks employees who were previously provided agency-issued parking permits should resubmit their requests to comply with the policy. Further, Parks should continue to ensure that any vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are not used by its employees and are repaired or returned to the manufacturer for repairs, as required by its warranties. In addition, Parks should continue to confirm that its vehicle dealers and manufacturers regularly contact NHTSA to inform the agency of repairs or recalls that have been cleared, so the database can be updated. Finally, Parks should continue to retire vehicles that pose a safety hazard to its employees.

The results of the audit have been discussed with Parks officials, and their comments have been considered in preparing this report. Their complete written response is attached to this report. If you have any questions concerning this report, please e-mail my Audit Bureau at audit@comptroller.nyc.gov.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Scott M. Stringer".

Scott M. Stringer

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
Audit Findings and Conclusions	1
Audit Recommendations.....	2
AUDIT REPORT	3
Background	3
Objective.....	4
Scope and Methodology Statement.....	4
Discussion of Audit Results	4
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	5
Parks Monitors and Tracks Its E-ZPass Usage as Required by the City	5
Parks Recoups E-ZPass Charges as Required by the City	6
Recommendations	6
Inadequate Agency Parking Permit Documentation	6
Recommendations	7
OTHER MATTERS	7
Parks Ensures City Vehicle Safety	7
Recommendations	8
DETAILED SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY.....	10

THE CITY OF NEW YORK OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER AUDITS & SPECIAL REPORTS

Audit Report on the Department of Parks and Recreation's Monitoring of Its Employees Who Use E-ZPasses and Parking Permits While Driving City-Owned or Personally- Owned Vehicles on City Business

SZ17-061A

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This audit was conducted to determine whether the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation (Parks) properly monitors its employees who use City-provided E-ZPasses and parking permits while driving City-owned or personally-owned vehicles on City business in accordance with applicable rules and regulations.

Parks is responsible for maintaining a 29,900-acre municipal park system. As part of that function, it operates 800 athletic fields and nearly 1,000 playgrounds, 1,800 basketball courts, 550 tennis courts, 67 public pools, 51 recreational facilities, 15 nature centers, 14 golf courses and 14 miles of beaches. Parks' fleet consists of 2,943 vehicles, including 156 forestry vehicles, 108 packers, and 92 beach terrain vehicles.¹ As of March 2017, Parks had 7,646 employees, including Park Rangers, supervisors, recreation employees and life guards, and an operating budget of \$548 million. Parks has authorized 5,303 employees to use agency vehicles and E-ZPasses issued by the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) for City business. In Fiscal Year 2016, Parks spent approximately \$1.2 million for E-ZPass usage.

Audit Findings and Conclusions

During the audit period (January 1, 2014 through March 30, 2017), we found that Parks properly monitors the use of E-ZPasses by its authorized drivers in accordance with applicable rules and regulations. It maintains the logs or trip tickets detailing agency E-ZPass usage as required by the City's and Parks' policies and procedures, and keeps accurate track of its E-ZPass tags. In addition, we found that Parks was not using any vehicles on the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) recall list. However, we found that Parks does not properly enforce the City's requirements for issuing agency parking permits.

¹ Of the 2,943 vehicles in Parks' fleet, 1,985 are driven on the road and have plates and Vehicle Identification Numbers (VIN) (e.g., passenger vehicles, utility vans, trucks) and the remaining 958 are off-road vehicles with no plates (e.g., trailers, golf carts, front-end loaders, and pressure washers.)

Audit Recommendations

To address the findings raised in this audit, we made the following seven recommendations:

- Parks should continue to properly monitor, track and recoup its E-ZPass usage, as required by the City of New York's *City Vehicle Driver Handbook*.
- Parks should ensure that all agency-issued parking permit requests are filled out properly, with the specific agency business use.
- Parks employees who were previously issued agency-issued parking permits should resubmit their requests to comply with the policy.
- Parks should continue to ensure that any vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are not used by its employees.
- Parks should continue to ensure that all of its vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are repaired or returned to the manufacturer for repairs, as required by its warranties.
- Parks should continue to confirm that its vehicle dealers and manufacturers regularly contact NHTSA to inform the agency of repairs or recalls that have been cleared, so the database can be updated.
- Parks should continue to retire vehicles that pose a safety hazard to its employees.

Agency Response

In its written response, Parks generally agreed with the audit's findings and stated, "We are pleased that your Report concluded that Parks properly monitors the use of E-ZPasses by our authorized drivers in accordance with applicable rules and regulations; that Parks maintains the logs or trip tickets detailing agency E-ZPass usage as required by the City's and Parks' policies and procedures; that Parks keeps accurate track of our E-ZPass tags; and that Parks was not using any vehicles on the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) recall list. We also acknowledge your finding regarding the issuance of agency parking permits and will take steps to address this issue. . . . Finally, Parks wishes to thank you and your audit staff for the time and effort devoted to completing this Report."

AUDIT REPORT

Background

Parks plans and cares for a 29,900-acre municipal park system. It operates 800 athletic fields and nearly 1,000 playgrounds, 1,800 basketball courts, 550 tennis courts, 67 public pools, 51 recreational facilities, 15 nature centers, 14 golf courses and 14 miles of beaches. Parks' fleet consists of 2,943 vehicles, including 156 forestry vehicles, 108 packers and 92 beach terrain vehicles. As of March 2017, Parks had 7,646 employees, including Park Rangers, supervisors, recreation employees and life guards, and an operating budget of \$548 million. Parks has authorized 5,303 employees to use agency vehicles and E-ZPasses issued by the MTA for City business.² In Fiscal Year 2016, Parks spent approximately \$1.2 million for E-ZPass usage by its employees.

According to the *City Vehicle Driver Handbook* (Handbook),³ the City's Fleet Manual⁴ and Parks' policies and procedures,⁵ only those employees who exercise reasonable care in operating City-owned or personally-owned vehicles may use them to conduct City business. Agency heads, through their agency's Agency Transportation Coordinator (ATC), must ensure that all employees assigned a City-owned vehicle for full-time or temporary use have been authorized by the agency to drive. The ATC also ensures that drivers have valid licenses, which must be issued by New York State unless an employee is exempt from City residency requirements. In that case, authorized drivers must have a valid license from the state where they reside, and must also have the appropriate classification for the vehicle they are driving on City business. The Handbook further specifies that City agencies must establish programs that promote safety along with proper training in the use of motor vehicles.

City-provided E-ZPasses may only be issued to authorized City drivers, and all E-ZPass usage must be reported to and monitored by the ATC. Drivers may use a City E-ZPass only when conducting official business, and in connection with the approved use of a City government vehicle or an authorized personal vehicle. After each use, drivers must fill out a vehicle trip ticket that details the name of the driver, the date and time of usage, the original starting point and destination, the original and ending mileage, and the official City reason for use of the vehicle and E-ZPass. Vehicle trip tickets are maintained by the ATC as Parks vehicle trip logs and entered into the Department of Citywide Administration's (DCAS') Fleet Management System, City's Asset WORKS – FleetFocus M5.

Drivers using City-provided E-ZPasses must also be aware of their agency's procedures regarding the use of parking permits, including areas where City government vehicles are permitted to park. Parking permits must be properly displayed to ensure visibility through the windshield, and they can only be used for official City business in connection with an assigned City vehicle or an authorized personal vehicle.

² February 2017 Mayor's Management Report.

³ The *City Vehicle Driver Handbook* was updated in May 2016 to reflect the change in City administration and to include the Vision Zero Plan. No other changes were made to the rules and regulations in the Handbook.

⁴ The City of New York Fleet Management Manual, issued May 2016, includes a summary of the Handbook and policies and procedures concerning fleet procurement, fueling, vehicle assignments, maintenance and relinquishments.

⁵ Parks' policies and procedures regarding the use of City and personal vehicles for City business and the use of E-ZPasses mirror the regulations in the Handbook.

Objective

The objective of this audit was to determine whether Parks properly monitors its employees who use City-provided E-ZPasses and parking permits while driving City-owned or personally-owned vehicles on City business in accordance with applicable rules and regulations.

Scope and Methodology Statement

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. This audit was conducted in accordance with the audit responsibilities of the City Comptroller as set forth in Chapter 5, §93, of the New York City Charter.

The scope period of this audit was January 1, 2014 through March 30, 2017. Our audit reviewed E-ZPass usage and parking permits issued during our scope period. The scope also included agency parking permits that were issued and surrendered from January 2015 through February 2017. Please refer to the Detailed Scope and Methodology at the end of this report for the specific procedures and tests that were conducted.

Discussion of Audit Results

The matters covered in this report were discussed with Parks officials during and at the conclusion of this audit. Parks was also notified of our findings in writing during the course of the audit and agreed that there was no need to have an exit conference. On May 9, 2017, we submitted a draft report to Parks with a request for comments. We received a written response from Parks on May 23, 2017. In its response, Parks stated, “We are pleased that your Report concluded that Parks properly monitors the use of E-ZPasses by our authorized drivers in accordance with applicable rules and regulations; that Parks maintains the logs or trip tickets detailing agency E-ZPass usage as required by the City’s and Parks’ policies and procedures; that Parks keeps accurate track of our E-ZPass tags; and that Parks was not using any vehicles on the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) recall list. We also acknowledge your finding regarding the issuance of agency parking permits and will take steps to address this issue. . . . Finally, Parks wishes to thank you and your audit staff for the time and effort devoted to completing this Report.”

The full text of Parks’ response is included as an addendum to this report.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

We found that Parks properly monitors the use of E-ZPasses by its authorized drivers in accordance with applicable rules and regulations. Parks maintains the logs or trip tickets detailing agency E-ZPass usage as required by the City's and Parks' policies and procedures, and keeps accurate track of its E-ZPass tags. In addition, we found that Parks was not using any vehicles on the NHTSA recall list. However, we found that Parks does not properly enforce the City's requirements for issuing agency parking permits.

Parks Monitors and Tracks Its E-ZPass Usage as Required by the City

Parks properly monitors E-ZPass usage through appropriate use of either logs or trip tickets that detail agency E-ZPass usage, as required by the City's and Parks' policies and procedures.

According to §7.1 of the Handbook, *Issuance of E-ZPass*,

Issuance of an E-ZPass . . . is determined by the ATC and employees responsible for the E-ZPass must report all E-ZPass related issues to their ATC. Drivers are allowed to use a City sponsored E-ZPass only when conducting official City business and in connection with the approved use of a City Government Vehicle.

Drivers must keep a log of E-ZPass use and submit it to the agency representative responsible for monitoring use. When a pass is used, the driver must fill out a trip ticket detailing what it was used for and why it needed to be used so that accurate log books are maintained. Detailed summary reports on travel are produced by E-ZPass and submitted to the designated agency E-ZPass representative for review.⁶

We requested a copy of the log books and trip tickets that drivers filled out detailing E-ZPass use and the purpose of the trips. We also determined that Parks properly documents its vehicle and E-ZPass usage in the City's AssetWORKS – FleetFocus M5 (FleetFocus M5), a computer system managed by DCAS to track fleets, repairs, inventory records, and billing for multiple City agencies, including Parks. Further, we found that the records in FleetFocus M5 contained the necessary information (adequate log and detailed trip and E-ZPass information) to determine that the pass had been used appropriately. In addition, this system also keeps a record of E-ZPass billing, so that the ATC can appropriately review agency usage.

Finally, we reviewed the E-ZPass statements Parks received from the MTA for January 2014 through November 10, 2016. We were able to track each E-ZPass trip and the appropriate vehicles associated with E-ZPass usage.

⁶ Notwithstanding the Handbook's distinction in places of "trip tickets" and "logs," it appears to frequently use the terms "log," "trip tickets," and "trip report" interchangeably.

Parks Recoups E-ZPass Charges as Required by the City

According to §7.1.4 of the Handbook, *Reimbursement of E-ZPass Charges*, “[a]gencies receive monthly E-ZPass statements. Drivers are responsible for reimbursement to the agency for any charges incurred while not performing official City business. Drivers are reminded that abuse of a City sponsored E-ZPass is prohibited and may lead to disciplinary proceedings.”

We requested all E-ZPass reimbursements from January 1, 2014 through November 18, 2016 from Parks employees, and found that Parks had been appropriately reimbursed for \$1,180 from 62 employees as required by City regulations.

Recommendations

1. Parks should continue to properly monitor, track and recoup its E-ZPass usage as required by the City of New York’s *City Vehicle Driver Handbook*.

Parks Response: “Parks will continue to properly monitor, track and recoup our E-ZPass usage as required by the City of New York’s *City Vehicle Driver Handbook*.”

Inadequate Agency Parking Permit Documentation

According to the City’s Fleet Manual §9.16 entitled “Parking permits,”

In coordination with the Mayor’s Office of Fiscal and Administrative Management, City DOT [Department of Transportation] issues parking permits for official vehicle use. Agencies may request these passes from DOT for essential purposes only. Under limited circumstances, agencies may also issue agency specific parking permits for localized purposes, such as a permit to park in an agency parking lot. The issuance of agency parking permits must be approved by the Agency Head. The specific assignment information, purpose, and restrictions for the pass must be clearly noted on the pass. All passes must include expiration dates.

We found that Parks does not properly enforce the requirements for issuing agency parking permits as required by the City’s Fleet Manual. In the period of the audit, Parks issued 1,652 agency parking permits to allow its employees to park in various lots on Parks’ facilities. When reviewing the business purposes or reasons to justify these permits, we found that:

- 66 agency permits were issued according to the City’s guidelines;
- 859 agency permits were issued without documented justification;
- 193 agency permits were issued with inadequate justification (i.e., justification was not for business purposes); and
- 534 agency permits were issued with incomplete justification (i.e., complete information was not included in the justification).⁷

⁷ Permits we found to have incomplete justification included those that bore the statements “renewal” or that provided a facility location as the documented reason. Absent additional information, such as the business purposes, parking permit issuance would not be justified.

When applying for parking permits, Parks employees must fully document the appropriate reason for requesting the permit. Moreover, Parks officials must properly enforce the requirements for issuing the agency parking permit in accordance with City regulations.

During the course of the audit, we notified Parks that 1,586 of the 1,652 parking permits issued by Parks to its employees were not issued according to the City guidelines. Parks officials stated that they would immediately notify the agency's Legal Department to re-issue the City guidelines.

Recommendations

2. Parks should ensure that all agency-issued parking permit requests are filled out properly, with the specific agency business use.

Parks Response: "Parks will work to develop standard guidelines overseeing the issuance of parking permits. We will consider this recommendation in the development of these guidelines."

3. Parks' employees who were previously issued agency-issued parking permits should resubmit their request to comply with the policy.

Parks Response: "Parks will work to develop standard guidelines overseeing the issuance of parking permits. We will consider this recommendation in the development of these guidelines."

OTHER MATTERS

Parks Ensures City Vehicle Safety

In the course of gathering information for the audit, we learned that Parks took appropriate measures to ensure that Parks vehicles listed on the NHTSA recall database were not used without being promptly repaired or retired. In addition, Parks ensures that its drivers indicate the condition of the vehicle on the trip logs. According to §2.2 of the Handbook, *Safe Operation of a City Government Vehicle*, drivers should "not operate a vehicle with a known or obvious safety problem."

According to the City's Fleet Manual §10.5, "Warranty and recalls," "[w]arranty terms and requirements for vehicles will be tracked in the City Fleet Management System and centrally entered when each vehicle is added to the system. Fleet managers must ensure that warranties are being accessed fully to minimize City repair costs. Fleet managers must adhere to recall notices relating to vehicles in their fleets and ensure timely compliance."

When we searched the NHTSA's recall database for the 1,985 VINs for the vehicles assigned to Parks, we found that Parks currently owns 223 vehicles that have an open recall.⁸ The basis for these recalls include potential significant safety hazards such as unsafe air bags (failure to deploy on impact or metal fragments deploying), faulty wiring and loss of steering. For example, the

⁸ The NHTSA database lists the open recalls for the specific vehicle. A vehicle has an open recall if there is an unresolved national recall for that vehicle. After any appropriate changes or repairs are made to the vehicle, the recall no longer appears in NHTSA's database.

2015 Chevrolet Silverado’s recall states, “[f]rontal airbags and seatbelt pretensions do not deploy when required.

Table I below illustrates the manufacturer and the year and the number of vehicles in Parks’ fleet that are on the NHTSA recall list as of March 2017.

Table I

National Highway Traffic Safety
Administration Recall

Type of Vehicle	Year(s) of the Vehicle	Number of Vehicles in Fleet
Chevrolet	2015	2
Dodge	2001,2006	4
Ford	1998,2000,2001,2002,2004,2005,2006,2009,2013,2014	40
Freightliner (Van)	2009,2010,2012,2013	10
GMC	2000,2001	2
Honda	2007	3
Nissan	2013,2014,2015,2016	50
Toyota	2004,2007,2008,2009,2010,2011	112
Total		223

During the course of the audit, we notified Parks of the 223 vehicles that were on the NHTSA recall list. When notified of these open recalls, Parks provided documentation that these vehicles were inactive and that it was fully aware of the recall and the procedures necessary to take the vehicle off of the recall list. Furthermore, we checked FleetFocus M5 and determined that these vehicles had been pulled offline and were in various stages of repair, or waiting for manufacturers/dealers to call them in for repairs or parts replacements. As a result, Parks has ensured that its drivers are not using the 223 vehicles on the open recall list.

Recommendations

4. Parks should continue to ensure that any vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are not used by its employees.

Parks Response: “Parks will continue to ensure that any vehicle on the NHTSA recall list are not used by our employees.”

5. Parks should continue to ensure that all Parks vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are repaired or returned to the manufacturer for repairs as required by its warranties.

Parks Response: “Parks will continue to ensure that all Parks vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are repaired or returned to the manufacturer for repairs as required by its warranties.”

6. Parks should continue to confirm that its vehicle dealers and manufacturers contacted NHTSA to inform the agency of repairs or recalls that have been cleared, so the database can be updated.

Parks Response: “Parks will continue to confirm that our vehicle dealers and manufacturers contacted NHTSA to inform the agency of repairs and recalls that have been cleared, to that the database can be updated.”

7. Parks should continue to retire vehicles that pose a safety hazard to its employees.

Parks Response: “Parks will continue to retire vehicles that pose a safety hazard to our employees.”

DETAILED SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. This audit was conducted in accordance with the audit responsibilities of the City Comptroller as set forth in Chapter 5, §93, of the New York City Charter.

The scope period of this audit was January 1, 2014 through March 30, 2017. Our audit reviewed E-ZPass usage and parking permits issued in our scope period. The scope also included agency parking permits that were issued and surrendered from January 2015 through February 2017.

To meet our objective, we obtained and reviewed the updated Handbook, which was issued February 2014 and updated May 2016, along with Parks' policies and procedures and the City's Fleet Manual. To determine whether Parks monitored its drivers' E-ZPass usage and parking permits in accordance with the Handbook and City's Fleet Manual, we obtained and reviewed the following: (1) a list of all E-ZPasses issued to the agency and the associated license plates; (2) a copy of the agency's E-ZPass bills for the scope period; (3) a copy of all vehicle usage trip logs, tickets, reports and monthly passenger vehicle reports during our scope; (4) a list of all parking permits and the vehicles they were assigned to; and (5) a list of all employees who were authorized to drive on City business during the scope period.

To determine vehicle usage trip logs, tickets, reports and monthly vehicles reports, we were granted access to DCAS' Fleet Management System.

To assess the reliability of the database of E-ZPasses received from the agency, we matched the MTA E-ZPass billing statements to the vehicle trip logs for the agency, where available. In addition, we verified the number of City vehicles with the appropriate purchasing agent. We also verified the account with the MTA and compared this to the number of E-ZPasses issued and surrendered during our scope period.

To determine whether Parks effectively monitored its E-ZPass usage, we examined whether the E-ZPass was used during normal agency business hours. We reviewed all E-ZPass bills and compared the dates to the January 1, 2015 through February 2017 calendars to determine if an E-ZPass was used on a weekend or holiday. We also determined that appropriate vehicle traffic for Parks vehicles was not necessarily confined to a nine to five business schedule, which meant that late hours were permitted. If an E-ZPass was used, we determined whether proper authorization was given for its use. We also checked the vehicle trip log (where applicable) to determine if a City vehicle was used. If a personal vehicle was used, we determined whether the employee was reimbursed for mileage and tolls, or just mileage in accordance with regulations. In addition, we checked the New York City Payroll Management System to determine whether the assigned driver was an employee of the agency and not on leave during the period of E-ZPass usage. We also checked to ensure that each E-ZPass was active during the scope period. Finally, we reviewed records to determine whether Parks drivers used their E-ZPasses only while performing official City business.

To determine the safety of the 1,985 Parks vehicles with inspections and registered plates that travel on the road or highway, we reviewed the NHTSA recall database.

To determine whether Parks effectively monitored its parking permits, we reviewed 1,652 parking permits from January 2016 through February 2017 to see if each parking permit issued by the agency to an employee was attached to a City vehicle or personally-owned vehicle. We determined that DOT parking permits were issued to City vehicles, and that agency parking permits were issued to individual employees to park on Parks' property. We also reviewed whether Parks had issued an authorization to employees with parking permits, and checked to see whether each employee assigned a parking permit had any outstanding parking tickets. In addition, we obtained a list of all the parking permits from the agency and verified those lists with DOT to ensure that Parks had given us a complete list. Finally, we ensured that Parks had properly accounted for the total number of parking permits it had issued.



NYC Parks

Mitchell J. Silver, FAICP
Commissioner

T 212.360.1305
F 212.360.1345

E mitchell.silver@parks.nyc.gov

ADDENDUM

Page 1 of 2

City of New York
Parks & Recreation

The Arsenal
Central Park
New York, NY 10085
www.nyc.gov/parks

May 23, 2017

Marjorie Landa
Deputy Comptroller for Audit
City of New York Office of the Comptroller
1 Centre Street, Room 1100
New York, NY 10007

Re: Draft Audit Report on the Department of Parks and Recreation's Monitoring of Its Employees Who Use E-Z Passes and Parking Permits While Driving City-Owned for Personally-Owned Vehicles on City Business (Audit Number SZ17-061AL)

Dear Deputy Comptroller Landa:

This letter addresses the findings and recommendations contained in the New York City Comptroller's Draft Audit Report ("Report"), dated May 9, 2017, on the above subject matter.

We are pleased that your Report concluded that Parks properly monitors the use of E-ZPasses by our authorized drivers in accordance with applicable rules and regulations; that Parks maintains the logs or trip tickets detailing agency E-ZPass usage as required by the City's and Parks' policies and procedures; that Parks keeps accurate track of our E-ZPass tags; and that Parks was not using any vehicles on the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) recall list. We also acknowledge your finding regarding the issuance of agency parking permits and will take steps to address this issue.

In reference to the Report's recommendations directed to Parks:

Recommendation 1: Parks should continue to properly monitor, track, and recoup its E-ZPass usage as required by the City of New York's City Vehicle Driver Handbook.

Parks will continue to properly monitor, track, and recoup our E-ZPass usage as required by the City of New York's City Vehicle Driver Handbook.

Recommendation 2: Parks should ensure that all agency-issued parking permit requests are filled out properly, with the specific agency business use.

Parks will work to develop standard guidelines overseeing the issuance of parking permits. We will consider this recommendation in the development of these guidelines.

Recommendation 3: Parks' employees, who were previously issued agency-issued parking permits, should resubmit their request to comply with the policy.

Parks will work to develop standard guidelines overseeing the issuance of parking permits. We will consider this recommendation in the development of these guidelines.

Recommendation 4: Parks should continue to ensure that any vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are not used by its employees.

Parks will continue to ensure that any vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are not used by our employees.

Recommendation 5: Parks should continue to ensure that all Parks vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are repaired or returned to the manufacturer for repairs as required by its warranties.

Parks will continue to ensure that all Parks vehicles on the NHTSA recall list are repaired or returned to the manufacturer for repairs as required by its warranties.

Recommendation 6: Parks should continue to confirm that its vehicle dealers and manufacturers contacted NHTSA to inform the agency of repairs or recalls that have been cleared, so the database can be updated.

Parks will continue to confirm that our vehicle dealers and manufacturers contacted NHTSA to inform the agency of repairs or recalls that have been cleared, so the database can be updated.

Recommendation 7: Parks should continue to retire vehicles that pose a safety hazard to its employees.

Parks will continue to retire vehicles that pose a safety hazard to our employees.

Finally, Parks wishes to thank you and your audit staff for the time and effort devoted to completing this Report.

Sincerely,



Liam Kavanagh
First Deputy Commissioner